POST

RECRUITMENT & RETENTION

BEST PRACTICES UPDATE

APRIL 2006

Page intentionally left blank

CALIFORNIA COMMISSION ON PEACE OFFICER STANDARDS AND TRAINING

Recruitment and Retention
Best Practices Update

April 2006

POST Recruitment & Retention Best Practices Update
© 2006 California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

Published July 2001
Revised April 2006

For information about obtaining copies of this publication, contact:

POST Media Distribution Desk
1601 Alhambra Boulevard
Sacramento, CA 95816
916.227.4856
http://www.post.ca.gov/Chouse/pubs/order.asp
publications@post.ca.gov

Preface

Recruiting qualified applicants to become peace officers has been a recurring concern to California law enforcement. However, in no time in the past has the concern been so great nor the outlook for the future so uncertain as it is today.

The POST *Recruitment & Retention Best Practices Update* addresses the rapidly changing environment in which law enforcement leaders find themselves. More leadership attention in workforce management is needed if executives are to successfully recruit and retain staff, while meeting the needs of the community as it grows and becomes more diversified. This report provides information and resources to assist law enforcement in addressing recruitment and retention issues. It updates best practices for agencies to consider to improve recruitment and retention.

Specifically, this report provides a snapshot of current and projected changes in population demographics in addition to the implications these changes may have for law enforcement. It identifies hiring trends and potential competition for qualified candidates both within and outside the profession. It provides survey results of academy recruits to determine where they had difficulty in the selection process, what led them to choose a specific agency for employment, what recruitment strategies worked to attract them and more. It identifies trends in national recruitment strategies. It provides survey results of agency representatives who attended the 2001 Recruitment Symposium indicating to what extent new strategies were implemented as a result of attending the symposium. It reports the outcome of focus groups comprised of subject matter experts, largely outside of the law enforcement profession, to identify best practices in recruitment and retention. It highlights strategies developed by participants who attended the Recruitment and Retention Symposium 2005 – Developing Winning Recruitment and Retention Strategies as well as specific best practices.

KENNETH J. O'BRIEN
Executive Director

Page intentionally left blank

CALIFORNIA COMMISSION ON PEACE OFFICER STANDARDS AND TRAINING

COMMISSIONERS

Page intentionally left blank

CONTENTS

PART ONE
SURVEY OF THE LITERATURE AND RESEARCH

Chapter

PART TWO
BEST PRACTICES

CONTENTS, CONTINUED

Chapter

LIST OF TABLES

ACKNOWLEGEMENTS

Page intentionally left blank

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The environment in which law enforcement leaders find themselves is rapidly changing, and the labor pool is significant among those changes. Workforce management will demand more leadership attention if executives are to successfully recruit and retain staff, while at the same time meet the needs of a community that is growing, becoming more diverse, aging and has higher expectations.

Consider the following factors about the changing environment with respect to population growth and ethnicity, size and age of the workforce, and demand for officers.

Growth – California is growing at a rate of nearly 600,000 people per year.

Diversity – California is becoming more diverse with 32% of the population being Hispanic, nearly 11% Asian and 7% African American. Hispanics and Asian populations, nationally, are projected to double by 2050. Sixty-five percent of California Officers are Caucasian, while only 46.7% of the state's population is Caucasian. The largest disparity is among Hispanics who represent 32% of the state's population, but only 20% of peace officers in California are Hispanic. The number of female officers in California is approximately 8,000, or 12.7%, down from a high of 15.8%.

Size of workforce – There are approximately 30 million more Baby Boomers than Generation Xers. The Millennial Generation, while equal in number to the Baby Boomers, is only now reaching their 20's. This combination has created a dynamic where it is projected that by 2010 there will be 10 million more jobs nationally than there are qualified workers to fill them.

Aging Workforce – In 2004, the California Performance Review Report projected that over the next five years 70,000 state government workers will become eligible to retire. The federal workforce is in a similar situation with nearly half of the 1.9 million workers being eligible to retire in five years.

Demand for Officers – Between 2002 and 2012, the state projects an estimated 68,000 peace officers will need to be hired with an estimated 30,300 as a result of separations. According to a 2005 report entitled, Where the Jobs Are, law enforcement related positions are the highest priority for federal hiring with a goal of hiring 37,000 people over a period of two years. Seventy-six California agencies sent representatives to the 2005 Recruitment and Retention Symposium. These agencies had a combined total of more than 8,300 vacancies.

These factors make this report both relevant and timely. In order to address these issues, the following actions were taken to determine the best practices for law enforcement leaders to better address the recruitment and retention of peace officers.

- Established a Recruitment and Retention Advisory Council comprised of a cross-section of law enforcement agencies and professional associations.
- Provided a snapshot of current and projected changes in population demographics and the implications these may have for law enforcement.
- Identified hiring trends and potential competition for qualified candidates both within and outside the profession.
- Surveyed academy recruits to determine where they had difficulty in the selection process, what led them to chose their employing agency , what recruitment strategies worked to attract them, etc.
- Surveyed law enforcement recruiters to identify trends in recruitment strategies being employed nationally.
- Surveyed agency representatives who attended the 2001 Recruitment Symposium to determine to what extent they implemented new strategies after attending the symposium.
- Conducted focus groups comprised of subject matter experts, largely outside of the law enforcement profession, to identify best practices in recruitment and retention.
- Highlighted strategies developed by participants who attended the 2005 Recruitment and Retention Symposium – Developing Winning Recruitment and Retention Strategies.
- Highlighted specific best practices.

These actions became the building blocks of this report, yielding rich, contemporary information about the environment in which agencies must operate and the challenging forces at work that will demand greater attention and strategic focus if leaders are to successfully manage the workforce today and in the future. The literature suggests, as does research reported in this document, that few agencies are sufficiently prepared to address this impending workforce crisis.

In one survey, 81% of the respondents agreed that recruitment was a problem for their agencies, yet only 26% have a written strategic plan to address it. Another survey revealed that 91% felt recruitment was an issue for their agency and 67% felt it was a bigger problem than just four years ago. Yet, half of the respondents budget no money for recruitment and another 24% budget less than $5,000. In terms of retention, 72% of the survey respondents indicated that retention is still an issue and 54% believe it is a bigger problem than four years ago.

How can agencies improve recruitment and attract qualified candidates, especially women and minorities? Once an employee is hired, what does it take to retain that individual? Are there best practices in place where leaders can learn important lessons? What are strategic considerations in workforce planning?

The answers to these questions, as well as others, are critical to meeting the challenge facing law enforcement agencies across California and the nation. While there has been some progress it has not been nearly enough to meet the need. There is much to be learned, however, from other branches of government and the private sector.

This reports draws from lessons learned in California law enforcement agencies and others across the nation. It draws from work done on the behalf of the federal government, as well as the private sector. All of these sources are recruiting from the available labor pool. As

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

competition increases, both the public and private sectors will be forced to take a thorough look at how they recruit and manage the workforce in order to retain competent and capable staff prepared to meet the organization's mission.

In a survey of more than 850 academy recruits collected from fifteen academies, the following are among the key findings:

- The two strongest motivators to pursue a law enforcement career were a desire to serve and the element of adventure/excitement.
- Recruits identified time required to complete the (selection) process and lack of contact through the process as the most difficult aspects of applying to be a peace officer.
- Agency reputation, variety of assignment, agency location and academy sponsorship were the most compelling reasons for accepting employment with the respective employing agencies.
- Affiliated recruits were recruited most often by website, an agency employee who is a friend or relative, and other employee referrals.
- The most popular recreational activities for the respondents included watching DVD movies at home, the theater, and jogging.
- More than 50% decided they were interested in a law enforcement career by the time they graduated from high school.

These findings communicate the strongest motivator is a desire to serve, followed by adventure/excitement. Television and agency recruitment videos send both messages, although the service message appears to get "drowned out" by the flashing red lights and tactical imagery. An agency must decide what matters most and communicate a clear message.

An agency's reputation is significant. Potential employees want to be a part of an agency what is well respected in the community and the profession.

Few agencies have successfully employed a strategy that connects with the number one activity these recruits rated the highest; DVD movies. Some agencies get recruitment posters or information to the appropriate rental stores, but the potential is great for a more creative recruiting outreach.

Half of the academy recruits knew by high school graduation that law enforcement was a potential career choice. In fact, nearly 20% were interested in a law enforcement career by the time they finished elementary school. Could that number be increased if there were more long-range recruitment strategies?

What are the recruitment trends? A survey of fifty recruiters across the U.S. found that their respective agencies had, collectively, changed how they recruit in the following ways: expanded outreach efforts, developed an internet presence, and focused on making improvements or changes in the recruiter(s) in terms of diversity, training or increased the number of recruiters.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

Considering the changes these agencies made, use of the internet yielded the best results followed by outreach and improvements to the selection process. In the next two to three years, the respondents envisioned upgrading recruitment materials, using different advertising mediums, attending more job fairs, putting more focus on recruiting minorities and women, and enhancing or developing an internet presence. These recruiters found that the website and employee referrals to family or friends worked best to attract qualified candidates. However, when asked to identify the level of employee involvement, few agencies put more than minimal effort into developing a plan to actively engage employees in the recruitment process.

Eleven programs that are designed to help meet the challenge of attracting, hiring, and retaining a diverse workforce are highlighted. Some important lessons to be learned from those having success include the following.

- Take time to better understand the perspectives of those who are under-represented through open dialogue and/or conducting research.
- Ensure that there is consistency between agency actions within the community and the recruitment messages.
- Align agency operations and culture to create an inviting work environment for minorities and women.
- Craft creative, focused outreach strategies that will help get the recruitment message to the under-represented segments of the community.
- Partner with community leaders to identify and recruit candidates.
- Mentor candidates/recruits through the selection process, academy, and field training.
- View diversity recruitment from a holistic perspective in terms of community relations, rather than an isolated, independent action.

The advice from several successful agencies was to realize it takes time and to be patient. Nonetheless, consistently following the lessons outlined above will help an agency reach its goal, even if it takes 20 years as in the case of Miami-Dade Police Department.

One of the most creative approaches toward recruiting women is the Sacramento Police Department's Fitness Challenge. In short, the Fitness Challenge is a well publicized event where teams of women compete against each other and themselves. The fitness course is designed around the obstacle course. The team leaders are female police officers. After the initial competition, the teams workout together at least two times a week for twelve weeks. There is one final event after which team and individual progress awards are given. Over the twelve weeks, relationships are built, women have quality opportunities to learn about the department and many apply. In fact, every woman the department has hired since starting the Fitness Challenge has either participated in the event or knows of the event. The event has increased the number of women entering the academy from 2-3 to 8-10 per class.

Three subject matter expert focus group sessions were conducted by POST staff. The participants were largely from outside law enforcement and included representation from Fortune 500 Companies, Best 100 Companies to Work For, HR professions, and consultants.

The combined results of these focus groups resulted in recommending the following best practices for recruitment and retention.

Recruitment
- Develop a Recruitment Plan
- Conduct Research
- Personalize the Recruitment Process
- Select the Right People as Recruiters and Train Them
- Build Strong Partnerships
- Develop an Employee Referral Program
- Improve the Selection Process
- Develop an Advertising Plan
- Develop an Internet Presence
- Employ Effective Recruitment Strategies

Retention
- Develop Effective Supervisors/Managers
- Develop an Employee-Friendly Culture and Policies
- Develop a Retention Plan
- Engage Employees
- Improve Communication
- Develop Staff
- Improve Operations
- Address Cost of Housing Issue

This information was used to develop the format for the Recruitment and Retention Symposium that POST conducted in November 2005. The symposium participants were from law enforcement agencies, including human resources and a few community members.

The symposium used a problem-based learning format. The 200 participants were divided into twelve tracks. Each track developed an action plan to address the assigned problem. Those action plans became the basis for each of the Best Practices identified in the report.

Each of the best practices provides relevant and practical information. Most include examples of agencies that are employing the Best Practice. At the end of each best practice is a summary of key points.

The July 2001 Peace Officer Recruitment and Retention: Best Practices, published by the Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training, lists many ideas in a succinct fashion. This report is not intended to replace it, but build on an existing solid foundation by providing current thoughts, research, and practices.

Leaders desiring to meet workforce challenges should consider developing two guiding documents. The first is a recruitment strategic plan and the other is a succession plan. These

documents, together, will help guide an agency in developing a solid plan to recruit employees into an agency who has taken steps to create a positive work environment that seeks to both value and engage its employees. Further, a plan will be in place to prepare employees for assuming greater levels of responsibility, while slowing the loss of institutional knowledge by encouraging some employees to delay retirement or remain engaged in some capacity after retirement.

The contents of this report will help agencies develop both of these plans. A common theme for developing them is analysis. A part of the analysis is engaging an agency's staff to determine what attracted them to, and keeps them at the agency. It seeks to identify what issues are frustrating to employees, as well as what steps could be taken to improve the work environment. These same questions, asked of women and minorities inside the agency, can provide useful information. By asking these questions leaders communicate they are willing to listen, which is what employees want.

Good plans have a solid under-pinning of research to help identify strengths and weaknesses in workforce management, so appropriate steps can be taken to develop and implement strategies that will have the greatest potential impact. No doubt this will take time and effort, but it is vital to developing a solid foundation.

This report is continued evidence of POST's commitment to help the law enforcement profession in California better prepare to meet the growing recruitment and retention challenges. The challenge is big and continues to grow. However, this report provides substantial information that will help leaders meet the challenge and provide better service to the communities they serve.

SECTION ONE

<u>SURVEY OF THE LITERATURE AND RESEARCH</u>

Section One will present information gained as a result of the survey of the literature pertaining to recruitment, diversity recruitment, and retention. Additionally, information gained through four surveys, subject matter expert focus group sessions and reports generated through querying the POST data base on peace officers will be presented. Collectively, these sources of information yielded rich information providing very good insight into the recruitment and retention of peace officers. As a result of these efforts, twelve best practices will be presented in Section Two.

Page intentionally left blank

CHAPTER 1

<u>INTRODUCTION</u>

Attracting and retaining a high caliber of staff is the most critical issue and responsibility of executives in any profession. Without having the best staffs in place, organizations are ill-prepared to deal with the complex issues facing our society in this ever-changing environment.

In Jim Collin's book, <u>Good to Great</u>, he identifies eleven companies that met his criteria for being great. These were good companies who determined to become great and, in the process, emerged from transitions to sustain extraordinary results for fifteen years after the transition. Next to the chief executive officer, the most critical factor was the staff. He writes:

> The good-to-great leaders began the transformation by first getting the right people on the bus (and the wrong people off the bus) and then figured out where to drive it.[1]

One of the key findings in his work was that great companies consider "who" first and then where. They sought to hire the best staff, and with the best onboard, to then focus on what direction to take the company to meet the challenges in a competitive, changing marketplace.

No less is true for law enforcement. Leaders must place a priority on attracting and retaining the best employees. Settling for those minimally qualified will grow a mediocre agency whose service will be, at best, mediocre.

The communities in California expect and demand higher standards from law enforcement. Citizens want committed peace officers who possess and practice such attributes as courage, integrity, compassion, and who provide great service to everyone regardless of race or appearance.

This is no small task, but one that demands law enforcement leaders to make this a strategic priority that is constantly at the forefront of organizational life. It impacts the very essence of who an agency is and what they do, as well as how they are perceived by the community they serve.

The California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training (POST) has long been an advocate of local agencies. Further, the POST Strategic Plan calls for assisting local agencies with recruitment and retention. POST conducted the first Symposium on Recruitment in 1989. In 1990, a Management Fellow was hired to work on three specific projects, one of which was to develop a Regional Testing Pilot Project in Contra Costa County.

---

[1] Jim Collins, <u>Good to Great</u>, (New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 2001), 63.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

In 2000, another Management Fellow was hired to develop a Peace Officer Recruitment and Retention Best Practices Booklet, professionally produced recruitment advertisements that agencies could use, and coordinate a Recruitment Symposium in 2001. The Recruitment and Retention Best Practices Booklet is an excellent resource for ideas to enhance recruitment and retention.

In January 2005, the Commission approved funding to provide an update on recruitment and retention best practices and to conduct a recruitment and retention symposium which occurred November 15-17, 2005.

POST continues to solicit ideas for the strategic plan on assisting local agencies to recruit and retain qualified peace officers.

STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

Recruitment and retention of peace officers continues to be a significant concern for Sheriffs and Chiefs of Police. A survey on the pressing issues facing law enforcement in the next five years was conducted under the auspices of the California Chiefs of Police Association in November 2004 by Chief Steve Krull of the Livermore Police Department.[2] The results showed that of the 235 chiefs who responded to the survey, recruitment and retention was consistently ranked among the top two issues facing law enforcement in the next five years, regardless of agency size.

Similar surveys were conducted by Chief Krull in 1994 and 2001. In 1994, recruitment and retention was tied for the third most important issue and ranked number one in 2001.

Frequently, executives lament over the lack of applicants for peace officer positions. Of greater concern is the relatively small number of qualified candidates.

A study conducted by Community Oriented Policing Services (COPS) of 1,270 agencies showed that the supply of qualified candidates was down throughout the Nation. More than half of the small agencies surveyed, and two-thirds of the large agencies (serving populations of over 50,000), reported that a lack of qualified candidates caused staffing problems. Among these agencies having difficulty finding candidates, there was a thirty-three percent vacancy factor.[3] Possible explanations for this finding included:

- Better paying jobs outside of law enforcement
- Increased educational requirements that may have restricted come candidates
- Unusually high attrition as Baby Boomers retire

---

[2] Steve Krull, California Police Chiefs – Demographic Survey, November 2004.
[3] U.S. Department of Justice, Office of Justice Programs, Hiring and Keeping Police Officers, (Washington, D.C.: National Institute of Justice, August 2004), 2.

- Negative publicity over matters like racial profiling and excessive use of force
- Increased hiring by police agencies[4]

This was one of the most detailed studies available that examined the recruitment of peace officers nation-wide. Although dated by five years, the results validate the difficulty law enforcement agencies were having in finding qualified candidates.

What was not addressed is the importance of developing a comprehensive recruitment strategic plan that addresses the many aspects associated with recruitment. The assumption appeared to be that there is a finite pool of those who desire to be peace officers, which is true. But what about people who might be interested if they had a better understanding of law enforcement as a career and how it could help them to achieve life goals? Further, what unnecessary barriers have jurisdictions implemented that impede or discourage candidates during the recruitment and selection process? These are important areas to explore to determine if there are factors beyond a shrinking pool of peace officer candidates.

At the onset of this project, a Recruitment and Retention Advisory Council was established with representatives from a cross-section of law enforcement agencies and professional associations. More than twenty agencies and associations participated on the Council (See Appendix 1). At the first meeting in March 2005, participating agencies had a combined total of more than 2,300 vacancies. With more than 400 police departments, sheriff's departments, and other California law enforcement agencies, the number of vacancies statewide would be significantly higher.

They are not alone when it comes to having vacancies. Conversations, newspaper articles, demographics, and the results of this study conclude that finding qualified candidates is becoming more difficult. Unfortunately, recruitment is likely to become more of a challenge in the coming years.

The crux of this project is to identify best practices in recruitment and retention to help California law enforcement agencies both recruit and retain the best candidates during one of the most challenging and competitive periods in recent history.

To this end, this report seeks to accomplish a number of things that will better frame the importance of studying peace officer recruitment and retention, as well as provide an update in best practices for agencies to consider in order to improve recruitment and retention efforts.

Specifically, this report will:

- Provide a snapshot of current and projected changes in population demographics, in addition to the implications these may have for law enforcement.
- Identify hiring trends and potential competition for qualified candidates both within and outside the profession.
- Provide survey results of academy recruits to determine where they had difficulty in the selection process, what led them to chose the agency they are employed by, what recruitment strategies worked to attract them and more.

---

[4] Ibid.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

- Identify trends in recruitment strategies being employed nationally.
- Provide survey results of agency representatives who attended the 2001 Recruitment Symposium regarding to what extent they implemented new strategies after attending the symposium.
- Report the outcome of focus groups comprised of subject matter experts, largely outside of the law enforcement profession, to identify best practices in recruitment and retention.
- Highlight strategies developed by participants who attended the Recruitment and Retention Symposium 2005 – Developing Winning Recruitment and Retention Strategies.
- Highlight specific best practices.

This process has yielded rich information that can be used by law enforcement agencies to address the current and future challenges of recruiting and retaining the best candidates in order to meet the ever changing complexity of law enforcement in California.

DEMOGRAPHICS

As of June 30, 2004 the population in California was 36,590,814. California has grown at an average of more than 600,000 people each year for the past five years. However, in 2003 and 2004 the number of people was slightly under 600,000.[5] If this growth continues, California will add another 6,000,000 residents in the next ten years.

Ethnicity in California is shown in table 1. Whites account for 47.44% and Hispanics are second with 32.44% of the population. More than half of the California population is non-white.

---

[5] California Department of Finance, E6.County Population Estimates and Detailed Components of Change July 1, 1999-2004, with Census 2000 Counts, February 7, 2005, http://dof.ca.gov/HTML/DEMOGRAP/E-6_00-04.xls (last viewed August 30, 2005), 1.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

Table 1. RACE/ETHNICITY IN CALIFORNIA

Race/Ethnic Group	Year 2003	
	Number	Percent
White	17,075,466	47.44
Hispanic	11,677,021	32.44
Asian	3,911,866	10.87
Black	2,348,986	6.53
Multi-Race	667,883	1.86
American Indian	195,263	.54
Pacific Islander	114,841	.32
Total	35,991,326	100.0

This report has some other interesting information about California's demographics. Table 2 shows the state-wide percentage of the population that are children, working age, over 64 and median age by ethic group. Hispanics have the largest percentage of children with 36 percent under 18 years of age. Conversely, they have the lowest percentage of adults over 64 at 4.5 percent.[6] The median age for Hispanics is 26 versus 40 for Whites.[7]

The significance of this information is that Hispanics represent the second largest race/ethnic group. They have the largest percentage of children and the youngest median age. Hence, in the next ten years, many more Hispanics will be coming into the workforce. As shown later in this report, they are significantly underrepresented among peace officers.

Table 2. CALIFORNIA AGE DISTRIBUTION DATA

Race/Ethnic Group	% Children Under 18	% Working Age (18-65)	% Over 64	Median Age
White	20.7	64.3	15	40
Hispanic	36	40.5	4.5	26
Asian	22.6	65.7	11.7	36
Black	31	60.5	8.5	30
State-wide	27	62.5	10.5	34

---

[6] California Department of Finance, California Current Population Survey Report March 2004, May 2005, http://dof.ca.gov/HTML/DEMOGRAP/Reports/CPS/CPS_Extended_3-04.pdf (Last viewed August 30, 2005), 9.
[7] Ibid., 11.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

From a futurist perspective, the economy of the developed world will continue to grow for at least the next five years. The implication is that labor markets in the developed world "will remain tight, particularly in skilled fields. This calls for creativity in recruiting, benefits, and perks."[8] If birthrates in the U.S. do not climb dramatically, workers will have to stay on the job longer or more immigration will need to occur.[9]

There is evidence, however, that the birthrate in the U.S. is rising. Between 1990 and 2000, "children aged 10 to 14 increased by twenty percent" and those "aged five to nine increased by slightly less than fourteen percent."[10] While this will help, it will likely not provide enough workers to meet the need.

Further, the elderly population will continue to grow. World-wide it is expected to double by 2020 and triple by 2050.[11] The impacts are varied. By 2020, for example, the U.S. will need twice as many geriatric doctors and approximately 500,000 more nurses to meet the demand.[12]

The trends indicate there will be an increased need for knowledge-workers. Use of computers, telecommuting, and internet use are just three examples of technological changes in the workplace. This trend is driving up the skill level needed at even entry-level positions. The opportunity for training is one thing younger workers desire as a job benefit.[13] As educational levels rise in other professions, companies who might not have sought the same candidates as law enforcement will increasingly do so, creating more competition for a limited number of people.[14]

Another article by Gene Stephens, a police futurist, entitled, "Policing the Future – Law Enforcement's New Challenges," addresses the challenges that include new expectations relative to terrorism, technological advances, and new computer crimes. The article comments several times about the need for better educated and trained staff and leaders to meet the challenges.

Immigration is changing the ethnic composition in the U. S. Nationally, Hispanics made up 12.6 percent of the U.S. population in 2000. That figure is expected to double by 2050.[15] Since Hispanics already comprise more than 32 percent of the California population the impact will be significant. The percentage of Asians is expected to more than double during that same time period.[16]

In terms of generations, this is a very diverse time in history with people, on the average, living longer. Hence, in the workforce there are generally four generations.

---

[8] Marvin J. Cetron and Owen Davies, "Trends Now Shaping the Future", The Futurist, March-April 2005, 28.
[9] Ibid., 29.
[10] Melissa Taylor and James Carroll, The Changing Population in the U.S., Trend Alert, December 2002, 9.
[11] Cetron, 30.
[12] Ibid.
[13] Ibid., 31
[14] Gene Stephens, "Policing the Future – Law Enforcements's New Challenges," The Futurist, March-April 2005, 51.
[15] Cetron, 31.
[16] Ibid.

Societal values are changing as Generation Xers and Millennials exert more influence. Both of these groups have more in common with themselves than with their parents. Self-reliance and cooperation are values important to these groups. As national security loses urgency, they will focus on family related values, such as long-term health care, day care, early childhood education, and anti-drug campaigns.[17]

These groups are also the most entrepreneurial generations in history. They have only known good economic times and have come to expect it.[18] They are likely to strike out on their own if their aspirations are not met within traditional organizations.

Further, they are not as interested as their baby boomer predecessors in public service work. As these Generation Xers and Millennials were growing up, they heard public officials and others denigrate public service. This has helped to create an anti-government bias.[19]

Among these generations, more women than men are going to college. Fifty-seven percent of U.S. college students are women. The number is higher among minority groups.[20] As young women become more educated, more opportunities will be open to them. Child care and other family-oriented services will become more important. Employers, law enforcement included, will have to address their concerns to attract and keep them.

In an article published by the International Association of City Managers entitled, The Shrinking Talent Pool for Local Government Managers, several important points are made.[21] First, as some 80 million Baby Boomers retire there are only about 50 million Generation Xers coming along behind. That's a gap of 30 million! The percentage of those in government tends to be older, so the gap is even more exaggerated.

Second, there is a lack of rewards for increasingly difficult jobs. While the article focuses on the challenges of city managers, the same can be said of peace officer jobs. Compensation, benefits, working conditions, political posturing, and tight budgets are examples of things that can make it difficult to attract and retain employees.

Third, the Generation Xers have different values from those in leadership. The Xers want balanced lives and time for family, leisure activities, and other priorities. Staffing needs, mandatory overtime, limited opportunity for growth, and court time are examples of expectations in some agencies that may clash with Xers.

Fourth, other barriers may exist as well, such as cost of housing. Compensation for law enforcement in many areas is inadequate to allow an officer to live in the jurisdiction he/she works. In fact, officers may have to commute a considerable distance to find affordable housing.

---

[17] Ibid., 33.
[18] Ibid., 34.
[19] Frank Benest, "Help Wanted: Young People for Public Service," Western City, September 2003, 1.
[20] Ibid., 36.
[21] International City/County Management Association, The Shrinking Talent Pool for Local Government Managers, 2005, http://icma.org/main/ld_results.asp?hsid=1&ssid1=44&ssid2=79&ssid3=387 (Last visited August 30, 2005), 3.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

Officers who commute long distances may be tempted to find a different position closer to home, especially as they gain more experience.

The trend is clear. The most qualified candidates will have an increasing number of career options from which to pick. Additionally, women and minorities will become a larger percentage of the labor pool.

Nationally, it is estimated that by 2010, there will be a labor shortage of 10 million workers as the demand for workers exceeds the supply.[22] Of equal concern is the fact that there are an unprecedented number of retirements and with them a loss of institutional and intellectual knowledge. Employers, including law enforcement agencies, must hire women and minorities if they are to fill their vacancies, reflect an increasingly diverse community, and effectively engage the community in addressing issues.

A challenge for law enforcement is that these groups are under-represented, especially in upper levels of management. Unless senior managers are attuned to these issues and willing to address them, law enforcement will fall further behind in its ability to attract and retain a growing segment of the labor pool.

CLASS OF 9/11

Partnership for Public Service conducted a survey of some 800+ graduating college seniors regarding the effects of September 11, 2001. The survey explored how this event impacted these students in terms of career choices in general and openness to a career with the federal government specifically.

Two questions were of particular interest relative to this report. The first explored reasons why these students would most likely consider a career with the federal government. The second explored reasons why they would not consider a career with the federal government. The results are shown in tables 3 and 4 below.[23]

Accounting for 84% of the responses, the top four reasons respondents would consider a career with the federal government, in order of priority included good pay and benefits, working on issues that were of interest to them, job security, and a challenging job with responsibility.

---

[22] Tamara Erickson, Bob Morison and Ken Dychtwald, Coming of Age: Strategic Implications of the Aging Workforce and the Coming Worker Shortage, Conference Notes - July 13, 2004, Harvard Business School Publishing (2004: The President and Fellows of Harvard College), 1.
[23] Partnership for Public Service, The Class of 9/11 Full Survey Results, http://ourpublicservice.org/usr_doc/9-11-Survey-Results.pdf (last visited August 18, 2005), 14-15.

Table 3. REASONS THE CLASS OF 9/11 WOULD
CONSIDER A CAREER WITH THE FEDERAL
GOVERNMENT

Reason	Percent
Good pay and benefits	43%
Working on issues that interest me	22%
Job security	10%
Challenging job with responsibility	9%
Serving your country and community	8%
Exciting people to work with	1%

One third of the respondents said they would not work for the federal government because they considered it to have too much bureaucracy. The other top three reasons were: salaries are not high enough, they didn't know what careers were available, and no one had ever asked them to consider working for the federal government.

The last two reasons indicate that respondents may not have had adequate information to make a decision about the federal government as a career option. Another seven percent indicated the federal government did not have a job that matched the respondent's skill or goals. Some of this perspective may have been due to a lack of information as well. Hence, nearly thirty percent may have discounted the federal government as a potential employer due to a lack of information about available opportunities.

TABLE 4. REASONS THE CLASS OF 9/11 WOULD NOT CONSIDER
A CAREER WITH THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT

Reason	Percent
Too much bureaucracy	33%
Salaries not high enough	14%
I don't know what careers are available	12%
Never been asked to consider working for the federal government	10%
No job to match my skills or goals	7%
Not a fun or interesting place to work	6%
I have too much student debt	4%
None of the above	10%

Another finding in this study was that respondents, for the most part, did not see government work as community service. Only nineteen percent viewed working for government as

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

completely public service. Fifty-two percent considered government as somewhat public service. Surprisingly, twenty-nine percent saw government as not too much, or not at all, public service.[24] Many respondents did comment that they considered law enforcement as more public service than other aspects of the federal government.

The authors of the study concluded that for the federal government to be more appealing to college graduates, some changes needed to be made. Their recommendations included:

1. "…government agencies will have to do a better job of showing young recruits how their work in government will actually make a difference for their community and country."
2. "Modernization efforts aimed at aligning pay with the market and rewarding high achievers with meaningful performance bonuses would go a long way toward reaching this new crop of college graduates."
3. "If government agencies are to succeed in recruiting these high achievers they will need to make a much more aggressive push to raise the perceived value of government jobs among both the public at large and key influencers, such as college students' parents, teachers and peers."[25]

In another article by the Partnership for Public Service, The Hiring Process, three obstacles are noted for hiring talented personnel – time, complexity, and efficacy.[26]

On average, the federal government takes more than three months to hire a new employee. Some positions take six months to a year or longer to fill due to required security clearances. And yet, a study in 2002 found that two-thirds of college students were not willing to wait more than one month for a federal job offer.[27]

In terms of complexity, some federal job applications are up to 35 pages in length. Irrelevant questions and acronyms that are likely to be unknown to someone new to government were found in these applications.

Last, communication between federal managers and HR professionals on a candidate's qualities and skills has been poor. Assessment tools to ascertain which candidates have the desired characteristics are viewed as the least effective tools available.

Is there relevancy for law enforcement from the federal government? Consider the following five points:

First, is law enforcement adequately getting the message out to potential candidates? This study found that nearly one-third or more of the respondents lack adequate information about career

---

[24] Partnership for Public Service, The Class of 9/11 Full Survey Results, 12.
[25] Partnership for Public Service, The Class of 9/11 – Bringing A New Generation of Practical Patriots Into Public Service, http://ourpublicservice.org/usr_doc/class-of-9-11.pdf May 2005 (Last visited August 18, 2005), 9-10.
[26] Partnership for Public Service, The Hiring Process, http://ourpublicservice.org/usr_doc/PPS-05-06.pdf, July 19, 2005 (visited August 18, 2005), 1.
[27] Ibid.

opportunities in the federal government. Quite possibly, the same is true in the case of law enforcement.

Second, does law enforcement provide challenge and potential for rewarding work that is compensated accordingly? Issues such as cost of housing, long commutes, opportunities for growth, promotional opportunities, and organizational culture are factors to consider.

Third, is there a perceived lack of value or negative perception about law enforcement? If so, this could impact a potential candidate's level of interest. Additionally, friends, parents and other key influencers may dissuade individuals from applying.

Fourth, does the hiring process take too long when talented individuals do not want to wait more than a month for a job offer? While some law enforcement agencies have made strides in reducing the selection processing time, many take an average of nine months or longer.

Fifth, is the application, background, and selection process too complex? After the initial application, candidates must complete an extensive personal history statement. There are multiple stages in the selection process. The time requirement is one of the most difficult aspects of the selection process according to recent hires (See Recruit Survey on page 28).

Research conducted in conjunction with this report suggests these points are very relevant. If so, lessons learned by the federal government may yield rich information of benefit to law enforcement. Other places in this report will address these factors.

CALIFORNIA PEACE OFFICERS

The POST Peace Officer Database contains information about peace officers statewide, such as jurisdiction, age, gender, date of hire, and race. Several reports were run in April 2005 to determine specific information about age at entry into the system, current age, gender, and race.

Additionally, information about the number of years of service was requested to determine when officers departed prior to retirement. Unfortunately, reasons for their separation were not available.

The information requested focused on sheriff, police and community college peace officers, for a total of 63,159 officers.[28] This represents most, but not all, peace officers in the state. The total number of full-time officers at the time was approximately 78,192.

---

[28] Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training, <u>Sheriff, Police and Community College Current Full-Time Sworn Personnel – Current Age/Gender Summary</u>, April 20, 2005, 33.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

AGE AND GENDER

Age was examined from two perspectives – current age and age at time of entry into the system. Table 5 reflects the current age of officers by gender. As you can see, there are a total of 55,142 male officers and 8,017 female officers.[29] Statewide, females account for 12.7 percent of sheriff, police and community college peace officers.

Column five of Table 5 depicts the percentage of female officers for each age category. Notice that the greatest percentage of female officers is in the 20-24 age category, followed by those 25-29. This would seem to indicate that agencies are having greater success in recruiting women. There may be a variety of reasons for this increase. It may be that females are more interested in a law enforcement career today and, in part, it could also be that law enforcement agencies are doing a better job in recruiting them into the profession. Likely, it is a combination of reasons that has contributed to this increase.

However, one thing is certain: there is considerable room for improvement to bring the percent of females in law enforcement up to par with the percent reflected in the workforce. Later in this report, information will be provided as to what agencies are currently doing to attract females into the profession.

TABLE 5. SHERIFF, POLICE AND
COMMUNITY COLLEGE FULL-TIME
SWORN PERSONNEL – CURRENT
AGE/GENDER

Age	Male	Female	Total	Percent Female
18-19	2	0	2	0
20-24	1,117	209	1,326	15.8
25-29	5,728	1,013	6,741	15.0
30-34	10,207	1,584	11,791	13.4
35-39	11,599	1,803	13,402	13.5
40-44	10,080	1,675	11,755	14.2
45	1,785	258	2,043	12.6
46	1,739	246	1,985	12.4
47	1,645	201	1,846	10.9
48	1,679	168	1,847	9.1
49	1,557	185	1,742	10.6
50	1,395	163	1,558	10.5
51	1,242	96	1,338	7.2
52	1,006	94	1,100	8.5

---

[29] Ibid.

Table 5 - Continued				
53	904	91	995	9.1
54	755	68	823	8.3
55+	2,702	163	2,865	5.7
Total	55,142	8,017	63,159	12.7

According to the information in Table 5, there are 8,679 officers who are 50 years old or older. Since most agencies in the state have adopted the "3@50" enhanced retirement, many of these officers may be eligible to retire. Another 9,463 will reach age 50 in the next five years, or by 2010. This means that potentially up to 18,142 could retire over the next five years.

The popular "3@50" enhanced retirement for public safety officers was approved in January 2000. Since that time, many jurisdictions have adopted the retirement plan. Others are still waiting for it to be approved by local officials.

Currently, there is discussion about seeking to reduce government employee pension benefits. Should this be successful, there may be a ground swell of officers seeking to retire prior to the reduction depending on how the changes are implemented. Regardless, the foreseeable future will see officers retiring at a younger age.

How old are officers when they enter the system as a peace officer? According to the POST database, the majority of officers began their career between 20 and 29 years old. Table 6 presents the results of the database query.

TABLE 6. AGE AT ENTRY INTO THE
POST DATABASE AS A FULL-TIME
PEACE OFFICER

Age at Hire	Number
18-19	173
20-24	23,036
25-29	23,075
30-34	10,425
35-39	3,992
40+	2,455
Total	63,146

Seventy-three percent, or 46,111, of current police officers, deputy sheriffs, and community college peace officers were hired between age 20 and 29. Slightly more than 14,000 were hired in their 30's and fewer than 2500 were hired in their 40's or older.

Only 173 were hired when 18 or 19 years of age. According to Government Code, Section 1031 (b), the minimum age for peace officers is 18. While California law allows for 18 year olds to be peace officers, few have been hired at age 18 or 19. Is this because there are few interested or qualified candidates? Are agencies under the misunderstanding that the minimum age is 18, not 21? Eighteen year olds can enlist in the armed forces and fight on foreign soil, as many are currently doing in Iraq and other places.

DIVERSITY

Beyond gender diversity, how diverse is the law enforcement workforce? POST tracks eight ethnicity groups. They include: Asian, Black, Filipino, Native American, Pacific Islander, Hispanic, White, Other and Unknown.

Table 7 reflects the number and percent of peace officers who fall into each of the classifications tracked by POST. Column four shows the percentage of California population that coincides with each of the ethnic categories. As one can see, peace officers are mostly white. In fact, the percent of peace officers that are white is about 50% more than the general population.

The biggest disparity is among Hispanics and Asians. Hispanic officers currently represent 20.3 percent of peace officers state-wide. This percent would need to increase to 32 percent to reach parity with the population at large. The percentage of Asian officers would need to more than double to reach parity with the population at large. In short, considerably more officers are needed to better reflect ethnicity in California.

TABLE 7. COMPARISON OF ETHNICITY OF CALIFORNIA
PEACE OFFICERS AND GENERAL POPULATION

Ethnicity	No. in Law Enforcement	Percent	Percent in California[30]
White	41,444	65.6	46.7
Hispanic	12,802	20.3	32.4
African American	4,419	7.0	6.4
Asian	3,024	4.8	10.8
Filipino	307	.5	
Native American	240	.3	.5
Pacific Islander	71	.1	.3
Other	627	1.0	.2
Unknown	225	.4	
Multi-race			2.7

---

[30] State of California, Department of Finance, Economic Research Unit, California Statistical Abstract – 2003, Table B-5, http://countingcalifornia.cdlib.org/pdfdata/csa03/03abstract.pdf (Last visited August 3, 2005), 19.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

PEACE OFFICER EMPLOYMENT PROJECTIONS

The California Department of Labor publishes an Occupational Projections of Employment Report that is available on-line.[31] The occupational category entitled, Law Enforcement Workers, has five sub-categories. The report estimates how many new positions are anticipated to be added over the 10 year project. The number of separations projected due to retirement or other reasons is also listed. These two numbers added together reflect the estimated number of positions that may need to be filled over the next 10 years.

Table 8 reflects the 10 year projection for law enforcement worker types. For example, in 2002, there were 125,100 law enforcement workers. This number is projected to grow to 162,800 by 2012. This reflects a numerical increase of 37,700. However, during this same period there are projected to be 30,300 separations. If correct, an estimated total of 68,000 people would have to be hired to meet the needs of all five types. One interesting observation is that there are nearly as many projected separations as there are in new positions added, 30,300 versus 37,700, respectively.

TABLE 8. CALIFORNIA OCCUPATIONAL PROJECTIONS 2002-2012 – LAW ENFORCEMENT WORKERS

Occupational Titles	Avg. Annual Employment		No. Change (Growth)	% Change	Separations	Total Positions to Fill
	2002	2012				
Law Enforcement Worker Title	125,100	162,800	37,700	30.1%	30,300	68,000
Correctional Officers & Jailers	36,800	45,000	8,200	22.3%	7,600	15,800
Detectives & Criminal Investigators	9,300	12,100	2,800	30.1%	2,500	5,300
Parking Enf. Workers	1,800	2,200	400	22.2%	300	700
Police & Sheriff's Patrol Officers	75,500	101,400	25,900	34.3%	19,500	45,400
Transit & Railroad Police	1,100	1,400	300	27.3%	200	500

Police and Sheriff Patrol Officers, alone, would account for 45,400 of the total number. Annualized, this would mean law enforcement agencies would need to hire 4,540 officers each

---

[31] The Occupational Projections of Employment 2002 – 2012 can be accessed at http"//www.calmis.ca.gov/htmlfile/subject/occproj.htm scrolled to Long Term Projections – State of California 2002-2012 (Last visited August 2, 2005) and download the excel report.

year over the next 10 years. If, collectively, law enforcement agencies hire five out of every 100 who apply, then it would take an applicant pool of nearly 91,000 to hire 4,540. The size of an applicant pool would need to be larger if fewer than five were hired out of each 100 who apply.

A report on how to interpret the Occupational Projections of Employment[32] stresses that these are estimates based on the indicators used by the state to make the projections. Further, the changes are not likely to occur in a straight-line fashion, but may be cyclical or impacted by other events occurring in the economy.

COMPETION FOR STAFF

As one considers the number of positions that will need to be filled, it is important to consider who else may be recruiting from the same pool of potential candidates. According to the California Occupational Projections Report, between 2002 and 2012, nearly 2.7 million new jobs will be created and almost 3.5 million separations will occur.[33] Hence, nearly 6.2 million positions will need to be filled in California during the same 10-year span.

According to the California Performance Review (CPR) Report, the State Personnel Board says that 70,000 or 34 percent of the state's employees are eligible to retire in the next five years.[34] Other estimates say the "number could actually be as high as 49 percent, or as many as 100,000 state employees."[35]

This same report indicates that public safety state employees had a separation rate equal in 33 percent in 2003 and 23 percent in 2004.[36] For the past six years, public safety state employees have had an average annual separation rate of 30 percent.[37] In 2004, 25 percent of the public safety employees were over the age of 50, which means many of them could be eligible to retire, depending on when they entered the system.[38]

Elsewhere in the CPR Report, it says that between 1970 and 1990, California colleges and universities only met half the need for college educated workers needed by the state. The other

---

[32] Employment Development Department – Labor Market Information, Occupational Projections – Introduction and Methods, November 24, 2004, (Last visited August 2, 2005) from http://www.calmis.ca.gov/FILE/OCCPROJ/0amethoctx.htm.
[33] California Occupational Projections 2002 – 2012.
[34] California Performance Review, SO43 Creating a Workforce Plan for California State Employees, http://cpr.ca.gov/report/cprrpt/issrec/stops/pm/so43.htm, (Last visited August 2, 2005), 1.
[35] Ibid.
[36] Ibid, 2.
[37] Ibid.
[38] California Performance Review, Good People, Good Government, http://cpr.ca.gov/report/cprrpt/preschg/good.htm (Last visited August 2, 2005), 5.

half came from outside California and other countries.[39] This means that for some time the state has not been able to find the needed college educated workers within the state.

On the federal level, things are no better. Max Stier, president and CEO of the Partnership for Public Service states, "The federal government is in triple jeopardy. It is struggling to respond to the talent demands of the 21st century, baby boomers are retiring in record numbers, and the pipeline of available talent to replace them has dried up."[40]

Paul C. Light, Vice President and Director of Governmental Studies at The Brookings Institution, writes:

> "…the federal government was designed for a workforce that has not existed for several decades. Built around 30-year careers with one-way in right after high school or college and one-way out at retirement, it is a place for employees who care more about long-term security than short-term achievement…young Americans…see dead-end jobs ruled by seniority, not performance.
>
> The federal government is losing the talent war on two fronts. Its personnel system is slow in hiring, almost useless in firing, overly permissive in promoting, out of touch with performance and penurious in training….Government hierarchies are so thickened with needless layers that agencies cannot provide the kind of work that today's labor market expects."[41]

The reality is that much of what Mr. Light says about the federal government might also be said about local government and how potential workers see local government opportunities.

According to a report produced in 2002, it was projected that 50 percent of the federal workforce would be eligible to retire in the next 5 years.[42] The employment climate has changed considerably over the years. "Between 1980 and 2000 the U.S. labor market expanded by 35 million people as the baby boom generation entered the 'prime age workforce' (employees between 25 and 54 years old). In contrast, between 2000 and 2020 the prime age workforce will only grow by 3 million people."[43]

---

[39] California Performance Review, ETV 02 Create an Education and Workforce Council, http://cpr.ca.gov/report/cprrpt?issrec/etv/etv02.htm (Last visited 2 August 2005), 1.
[40] The Partnership for Public Service, Press Room: New Study Reveals the State of Federal Workforce: Security, Public Health, Engineering Skills Top Governments "Most Wanted" List, http://ourpublicservice.org/enlib/custom_tags/content/print_email_doc.htm?action=pri (Last visited 2 June 2005): 1.
[41] Paul C. Light, The New Public Service, The Brookings Institute, c. 2000, http://brookings.edu/views/articles/light/20000101.htm (Last visited 17 August 2005).
[42] The Partnership for Public Service, Tapping America's Potential: Expanding Student Employment and Internship Opportunities in the Federal Government, http://www.ourpublicservice.org/publications3735/publications_show.htm?doc_id=147279, 10 July 2002, (Last viewed, 23 January 2006), 6.
[43] David T. Ellwood, The sputtering Labor Force of the 21st Century: Can Social Policy Help?, June 2001, National Bureau of Economic Research Working Paper, W8321, pp. 3-4, quoted in The Partnership for Public Service, Tapping America's Potential: Expanding Student Employment and Internship Opportunities in the Federal Government, (10 July 2002), 6.

The top five federal government hiring needs are listed in a report published February 2, 2005, by the Partnership for Public Service and National Academy of Public Administration. The highest priorities are security, enforcement, and compliance assistance. The types of occupations included in this are criminal investigators, compliance officers, police officers, security and prison guards, and airport screeners. They anticipate hiring more than 37,000 people in the next two years.[44] Examples of opportunities in these occupations are included in Table 9. The U.S. Border Patrol, for example, is anticipated to add 2,000 positions per year for the next four years.

TABLE 9. FEDERAL PUBLIC SAFTETY OCCUPATIONAL OPPORTUNITIES

Department	Occupation	No. Positions	No. of Years
Transportation Security Administration	FT/PT Screeners	9,000	2
Border Patrol	Agents	2000	4
Customs	Investigators	800	4

Hence, private employers and state and federal governments will be seeking to hire significant numbers of people in the coming years. These job opportunities will give candidates a variety of options that will make it increasingly difficult for local agencies to attract and retain qualified employees.

Summary of Key Points

The following is a summary of the key points identified in this chapter.

- California is growing at a rate of nearly 600,000 per year, and has been for at least the past five years.
- California is becoming more diverse with 32% of the population being Hispanic, nearly 11% Asian, and 7% African American. Hispanics and Asian populations, nationally, are projected to double by 2050.
- Generation Xers, as a group, are approximately 30 million in number smaller than Baby Boomers. The Millennial Generation is just now reaching their 20's. This combination has created a dynamic where it is projected that there will be 10 million more jobs nationally than there are qualified workers to fill them. The result will be an increasingly intense competition for qualified workers.
- One study found that college students were not willing to wait for more than 30 days for a government job.

---

[44] The Partnership for Public Service and National Academy of Public Administration, Where the Jobs Are: The Continuing Growth of Federal Job Opportunities, 2 February 2005, http://www.ourpublicservice.org/research/research_show.htm?doc_id=260717, (Last viewed, 31 January 2006), 6.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

- The number of female officers in California is approximately 8,000, or 12.7%. However, among officers 20-24 years of age, women account for 15.8%.
- Currently, more than 8600 California officers are 50 years or older. Another 9,440+ will turn 50 within the next five years.
- While 73% of the current officers were hired between 20 to 29 years of age, only 173 or .27%, were hired at age 18 or 19. Yet 18 and 19 year olds are serving in Iraq.
- Sixty-five percent of California Officers are White, while only 46.7% of the state's population is White. The largest disparity is among Hispanics who represent 32% of the state's population, but only 20% of peace officers in California are Hispanic.
- Between 2002 and 2012, the state projects an estimated 68,000 peace officers will need to be hired with an estimated 30,300 as a result of separations.
- In 2004, the California Performance Review Report projects that over the next five years 70,000 state government workers will become eligible to retire.
- According to a 2005 report entitled, <u>Where the Jobs Are</u>, law enforcement related positions are the highest priority for federal hiring with a goal of hiring 37,000 people to fill those positions over a period of two years.

Page intentionally left blank

CHAPTER 2

RECRUITMENT

Recruitment is one of two major focuses for this report. Five avenues were pursued to obtain an updated perspective including the establishment of a Recruitment and Retention Advisory Council, a series of three focus groups aimed at identifying best practices based on input from subject matter experts, a survey of academy recruits, a survey of law enforcement recruiters from agencies around the nation, and a review of contemporary literature.

This five-part process has yielded a wealth of information about best practices in recruitment. The information gained from each source reinforces the findings in each of the others.

If law enforcement agencies, individually and collectively, can embrace these findings there is much to be gained in terms of filling vacancies with qualified candidates. On the other hand, if chiefs and sheriffs do not make recruitment a strategic issue of organizational importance, their respective agencies will suffer as competition for qualified recruits intensifies. This, in turn, could have an adverse impact on retention, because the two are so closely linked.

RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION ADVISORY COUNCIL

Stakeholder input was critical for this project. In the beginning, many key stakeholder groups were asked to nominate a representative to participate on a Recruitment and Retention Advisory Council. Additionally, a cross-section of law enforcement agencies was desired.

Examples of groups/agencies represented include: California State Sheriff's Association, California Police Chiefs Association, Peace Officer Research Association of California, Latino Peace Officer Association, Asian Peace Officer Association, National Organization of Black Law Enforcement Executives, Women's Peace Officer Association, Los Angeles Police and Sheriff's Departments, San Diego Police and Sheriff's Departments, Redding Police Department and Amador County Sheriff's Department. A complete list can be found in Appendix 1.

The group's focus was to assist with this project by providing input on a variety of recruitment and retention related topics, disseminate information provided to the group, respond to informational needs, and assist in planning a Recruitment and Retention Symposium.

The group met in San Diego approximately every two months. A variety of guest speakers were invited to attend and address specific issues. Some of the guest speakers included: Debbie Eglin

(Master Instructor Program Graduate – Recruitment Project), Jason Abend (Executive Director, The National Law Enforcement Recruiter's Association), Felipe Ortiz (Executive Director, National Latino Peace Officer Association), and Chris Lancaster (Los Angeles Newspaper Group).

The group's input was invaluable in the process of working on this project. Their years of experience, diversity, and expertise added much.

SUBJECT MATTER EXPERT FOCUS GROUPS

In an effort to identify best practices that may be in use in the private sector, subject matter experts were invited to attend one of three focus group sessions held in San Diego, Los Angeles and Burlingame. In order to identify subject matter experts, notices of the focus groups were sent out through the Society for Human Resource Managers, American Society for Training and Development, and Professionals in Human Resource Association. Interested individuals provided a brief explanation of their background in recruitment and retention. Those most qualified were invited to attend. A small number of law enforcement representatives were invited to participate based on their expertise. Combined, a total of 26 subject matter experts participated in one of the three sessions.

Additionally, nine Recruitment and Retention Advisory Council members participated in one of the three sessions, raising the total number of participants to thirty-five. A complete list of participants can be found in Appendix 2.

The following is a list of recommendations that were derived from the input provided in the three focus groups. There were ten recommendations pertaining to recruitment. Taken together, these recommendations provide a strong base upon which to develop a comprehensive recruitment program.

The recommendations are prioritized based on the frequency with which the topic was mentioned and/or based on multi-voting that took place after participants finished brainstorming ideas. Each item is followed by a brief explanation that summarizes important points discussed by the focus group participants.

l. Develop a Recruitment Plan – Take time to identify agency recruitment goals and plans for up to five years. How important is recruitment? How many people will need to be hired? What diversity needs exist? How many recruiters will be needed to reach these goals? In short, develop a strategic plan relative to recruitment that involves the entire agency, if appropriate.

2. Conduct Research – Conduct research to better understand the agency, community and the results of current and/or past recruitment efforts. For example, research should provide an agency with the information to answer the following types of questions: Who is the ideal

candidate? Are the job qualifications really what the agency wants? What advertising and other efforts are yielding the best results? What are the agency's demographics and how do those compare with the community served? What has attracted and kept existing staff? Why do officers leave the agency? The answers to these questions will impact recruitment planning, advertising, and strategies.

3. <u>Personalize the Recruitment Process</u> – A significant number of comments were made about the need to personalize the recruitment process and to "court" candidates. Suggestions included making staff accessible to candidates to answer questions, regularly sending notices to candidates keeping them abreast of progress, reaching out to the families of candidates to address concerns they may have, and assigning agency staff to mentor selected candidates through the process.

4. <u>Select and Train the Right People as Recruiters</u> – Develop criteria for who the agency wants as a recruiter. Considerations should include matching the diversity of who the agency wants to recruit, willingness and ease in talking with people, salesmanship, assertiveness at job fairs, and someone who wants to recruit for the agency. Training recruiters is important. Examples of topics include sales techniques, how to make "cold" calls, how to follow up with people through the process, understanding the respective jurisdictions selection process, and having answers to frequently asked questions.

5. <u>Build Strong Partnerships</u> – Develop relationships with others who can help provide a potential pipeline of candidates. Suggested partnerships included the military, college and high school counselors, community-based organizations, student associations, and other departments internal to the agency's jurisdiction. Additionally, if a good candidate does not qualify or fit in the agency, refer them to a partner who may be able to employ the person.

6. <u>Develop an Employee Referral Program</u> – Employees may be the agency's best source for referring good candidates. Help employees see themselves as ambassadors of the agency and develop a culture that fosters commitment to the agency. Keep employees informed about recruitment processes and the need for good candidates. Provide them with materials they can pass on to potential candidates. Consider ways to acknowledge and/or reward employees who refer candidates, especially when those candidates are hired.

7. <u>Improve the Selection Process</u> – Look for ways to speed up the recruitment and testing process. Make sure the right screening tools are in place to help identify the best candidates. Consider employing a "Pre-Qualifying Questionnaire" that will allow an opportunity for people to screen themselves out if they have disqualifiers in their background. Train evaluators as to what to look for in candidates. The selection process should include a way of seeing how a good candidate might fit in the agency, even if not immediately in the position for which they have applied. For example, a survey of academy recruits found that women, more than men, were employed by a law enforcement agency in some other capacity before being hired as an officer.

8. <u>Develop an Advertising Plan</u> – Advertising is about attracting good candidates. In order to do this, one needs to know what good candidates are looking for in a job or career and where they frequent. This may take some research. In the process of developing a message, you will want

to consider asking targeted groups to look at the message to ensure it will be received the way it is intended. An important aspect to consider is "branding." Branding is a way of putting a unique spin on the agency and why the candidate would want to work there. Scan the community to see where recruitment opportunities may exist due to downsizing and be sensitive to cyclical factors, such as in the spring when college graduates are busy looking for career opportunities. Another consideration is the medium used to advertise. A multi-faceted approach usually works best. Advertise in ways that will reach the best candidates. Develop a way to track which approach yields the best candidates.

9. Develop an Internet Presence – Consider developing a recruitment website for the agency. Many find that candidates are increasingly doing research about job opportunities on the internet. A significant number of applications are coming via the internet. Effective websites are easy to navigate with a limited number of "clicks," allow on-line opportunity to ask questions, and submit an application. The website should list appropriate, but limited information on qualifications and the testing process.

10. Employ Effective Recruitment Strategies – A number of strategies were suggested and include: Allowing candidates to participate in a ride-a-long, establishing an ongoing college campus presence by sponsoring events/refreshments on college campuses (such as pizza at a club meeting) that allow recruiters to develop relationships with students over time, hiring temporary employees in other capacities as a way to bring potential candidates into the agency, promoting the use of high school and college interns, use search engines to look for potentially good candidates in other fields, promoting scholarships from professional law enforcement associations, rehabilitate good candidates who fall out of the process along the way, have an ongoing application process to keep applications coming in, ask employees to tell their "story" about what attracted and keeps them working for the agency (print, video-tape or put stories on internet), and effective community outreach. The agencies that are most successful employ multiple strategies. However, they are also willing to track each strategy's effectiveness and adjust accordingly as they strive to attract qualified candidates.

These ten recruitment strategies offer ideas rich with potential to improve an agency's success in attracting qualified candidates. However, it should also be evident that executive support is imperative. That support will likely require the cooperation and support of leaders outside of a police agency. Other key stakeholders include human resources, community leaders and city/county leadership, such as the city manager, county executive, and members of the city council or board of supervisors.

2005 ACADEMY RECRUIT SURVEY

An important source of information is those who have been through the recruitment process and have recently been hired or are contemplating a career in law enforcement and have decided to

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

attend an academy. Currently, there are thirty-nine POST approved academies in the state. Most of these academies are operated in conjunction with community colleges.

Some recruits are affiliated, meaning they have been hired by a law enforcement agency and sent to the academy for basic training. Others are non-affiliates, meaning that they are attending the academy on their own time and at their own expense.

A recruit survey was developed which touched on many aspects of the recruitment process and background of those currently attending an academy in the state. The purpose for doing the survey was to identify practices that could be used to improve the recruitment and selection processes and was pre-tested at the Sacramento Police Academy. Several changes were made based on input from the recruits.

A letter was sent to all academies asking them to participate by allowing their students to complete the survey. A copy of the survey was provided to the academies to review (Recruit Survey is included in Appendix 3). Fourteen academies agreed to participate during the month of May, 2005. They are listed below:

Allan Hancock College
Butte Community College
California Department of Parks and
  Recreation
College of the Sequoias
Fresno City College
Grossmont College
Kern County Sheriff's Department

Long Beach Police Department
Orange County Sheriff's Department
Rio Hondo Community College
Riverside County Sheriff's Department
Sacramento County Sheriff's Department
San Diego Regional Training Center
San Francisco Police Department

Survey responses were received from 851 Peace Officer Basic Training Academy recruits. Over 60% of the respondents were affiliated with (employed by) a law enforcement agency (see table 10). Responses from affiliated and non-affiliated were analyzed separately in order to note any differences between those who had been successfully hired versus those who had not been hired.

TABLE 10. HAVE YOU BEEN HIRED AND SENT TO THE ACADEMY BY A AW ENFORCEMENT AGENCY?[45]

	Frequency	Percent
No Response	12	1.41
Yes	518	60.87
No	321	37.72

---

[45]Recruit Survey, Item 1.

Numbers and percentages of recruits by age and gender are presented for affiliated recruits in Table 11 and non-affiliated recruits in Table 12. Slightly more than 70% of the affiliated recruits (72% for females and 73% for males) are between the ages of 18 and 29.

TABLE 11. RECRUIT AGE AND GENDER –
AFFILIATED RECRUITS[46]

Age	Female	Male	Total
18-29	39 72%	334 73%	373
30 +	15 28%	125 27%	140
Total	54	459	513

For the non-affiliated recruits, 72% of the females and 77% of the males are between the ages of 18 and 29.

TABLE 12. RECRUIT AGE AND GENDER
– NON-AFFILIATED RECRUITS[47]

Age	Female	Male	Total
18-29	36 72%	204 77%	240
30 +	14 28%	61 23%	75
Total	50	265	315

REASONS FOR PURSUING A CAREER IN LAW ENFORCEMENT

Respondents rated the degree to which they agreed or disagreed with nine common reasons for pursuing a career in law enforcement. The rating scale ranges from "Strongly Disagree" (1) to "No Opinion" (4) to "Strongly Agree (7).

---

[46] Recruit Survey, Items 14 and 15.
[47] Recruit Survey, Items 14 and 15.

Table 13 shows the mean (mathematical average) and standard deviation[48] of the agree/disagree ratings for the nine reasons for pursuing a career in law enforcement. The ratings are rank ordered by the means for the agency affiliated respondents. On average, both affiliated and non-affiliated respondents at least somewhat agreed that they pursued a career in law enforcement for each of the listed reasons. However, two reasons stood out as the most powerful reasons for seeking a career in law enforcement: Desire to Serve and Adventure/Excitement. Approximately half or more of the affiliated and non-affiliated respondents strongly agreed with these reasons.

TABLE 13. REASONS FOR PURSUING A CAREER IN LAW ENFORCEMENT[49]

	Agency Affiliated			Not Affiliated		
	Mean	Std	Percent Strongly Agree	Mean	Std	Percent Strongly Agree
Desire to Serve	6.4	0.8	57%	6.4	0.9	58%
Adventure/Excitement	6.2	0.9	49%	6.2	1.1	51%
Stable Employment	6.1	1.0	41%	6.0	1.3	42%
Non-routine Work	6.0	1.0	39%	5.9	1.2	38%
Retirement Plan	5.9	1.1	37%	5.9	1.3	39%
Salary & Benefits	5.8	1.1	27%	5.8	1.2	29%
Independence	5.6	1.2	24%	5.6	1.3	27%
Status of Being a Peace Officer	5.3	1.5	24%	5.3	1.6	27%
Shift Work	4.6	1.5	11%	4.8	1.4	12%
Other reasons	5.8	1.7	56%	6.6	1.2	82%

In terms of "Other reasons," there were two categories for pursuing a career in law enforcement that were mentioned most often by recruits. The first group was categorized at Service/Responsibility. This group of comments included comments like giving back to the community, being a role model, and making a difference. The other was categorized as Career Choice and included comments like family tradition, career choice, and a challenging career. Respondents indicated the degree to which the various aspects of the peace officer selection process were difficult for him or her. Table 14 presents the results. Since non-affiliated recruits

---

[48] The standard deviation is a statistical measure of how tight or wide the distribution of scores falls around the mean. The closer the standard deviation is to zero, the more the scores tend to pack closely around the mean. The larger the standard deviation, the wider the distribution of scores.

[49] Recruit Survey, Item 2.

may not have participated in any of the post-job offer components of the selection process (i.e., background investigation, psychological screening, medical exam, oral interview, and any academy-sponsored physical agility test), these values are listed as "n/a" (not applicable) in the table.

In general, only the "time required to complete the [selection] process" was rated as difficult by the majority of affiliated respondents (54% somewhat, or more strongly agreed). Forty-three percent of the non-affiliated respondents rated this item as somewhat or more difficult. The mean ratings were 4.2 and 4.0 (for affiliated and non-affiliated respondents respectively), indicating that they neither agreed nor disagreed that the time required to complete the process was difficult. Lack of contact throughout the process was rated as the second most difficult aspect of applying.

Of the specific testing components, the oral interview, background investigation, and psychological screen were seen as the most difficult parts of the selection process. Minimum requirements were rated as the least difficult aspect of the process.

In the list of "Other reasons" the most frequent comment cited the duration of the process. Related to this were a number of comments about lack of information and/or notification about different stages of the process and what to expect.

Difficulties in Applying for a Peace Officer Position

TABLE 14. THE FOLLOWING ASPECTS OF APPLYING FOR A POSITION OF PEACE OFFICER WERE DIFFICULT FOR ME[50]

	Agency Sponsored			Not Affiliated		
	Mean	Std	Percent Somewhat or more Strongly Agree	Mean	Std	Percent Somewhat or more Strongly Agree
Time Required to Complete the Process	4.2	1.9	54%	4.0	1.8	43%
Lack of contact through the process	3.5	2.0	34%	3.7	1.7	36%
Oral Interview	3.1	1.6	27%	n/a		
Background Investigation	2.7	1.6	18%	n/a		
Psychological Screening	2.6	1.6	16%	n/a		
Written Test	2.5	1.4	13%	2.9	1.6	22%
Physical Agility	2.4	1.4	13%	n/a		
Medical Exam	2.4	1.4	10%	n/a		

---

[50]Recruit Survey, Item 3.

Table 14 - Continued						
Finding out when the test would be given	2.3	1.5	10%	2.7	1.6	16%
The Application	2.3	1.4	10%	2.6	1.5	13%
Minimum Requirements	1.9	1.2	4%	2.5	1.5	11%
Other	4.9	2.1	59%	5.6	1.5	60%

REASONS FOR ACCEPTING EMPLOYMENT WITH AN AGENCY

Table 15 summarizes the reasons that agency-sponsored recruits accepted employment with the hiring agency. Reasons are rank ordered by mean level of agreement. More than 80% of the affiliated respondents agreed that the following were the most important reasons for choosing the agency.

- Agency reputation
- Variety of assignments
- Agency location
- Agency willingness to send the recruit to the academy

It is important to note that a study reported in the Journal of Criminal Justice concluded that the "extent the applicant perceives a match between their own characteristics and those of the job and organization" impacts their commitment to be a police officer and remain with the profession.[51] In this instance, applicants likely perceived that the agency's reputation and their values were likely similar. The more a potential applicant knows about an agency, the more likely they can develop a perception as to whether or not they fit with the agency.

More than 70% of the respondents agreed that the following were important reasons for accepting employment with the employing agency.

- Retirement plans
- Salary/benefits
- Work hours available

The "Other" reasons included written comments that spoke to the reputation of the agency, the recruitment efforts of the agency and the agency's location.

---

[51] Sally A. Carless, "The influence of fit perceptions, equal opportunity policies, and social support network on pre-entry police officer career commitment and intentions to remain," Journal of Criminal Justice, vol. 33 (2005), 348-349.

	Agency Sponsored		
	Mean	**Std**	**Percent Somewhat or more Strongly Agree**
Reputation of the agency	5.8	1.3	86%
Variety of assignments	5.7	1.3	85%
Location of city or agency	5.7	1.4	84%
Agency was willing to send me to academy	5.7	1.5	82%
Retirement plan	5.4	1.5	77%
Salary / Benefits	5.2	1.4	77%
Work hours available to me, such as 10-12 hour shifts	5.1	1.5	71%
Size of agency	5.0	1.6	45%
First agency to offer a position	4.5	2.0	55%
Friend/Family works for this agency	3.8	2.1	37%
Affordability of housing	3.2	1.7	22%
I was already with the agency in another capacity	3.1	2.2	22%
Other[53]	5.7	1.6	68%

Table 16 presents the most successful agency recruiting strategies. Although there were no universally successful strategies, other than self-referral, the most successful recruitment techniques for affiliated respondents were:

- Agency websites
- Friends in the agency
- Direct recruitment by agency members
- Direct recruitment by others in law enforcement

---

[52]Recruit Survey, Item 4.
[53] Respondents only rated their agreement or disagreement with "other" reasons when they listed a reason in the comments section of the item. For most respondents, the item was left blank and their data is excluded from this particular item's analyses.

Traditional newspaper and radio/television advertisements were least successful strategies. The responses to this item underscore the importance of having a presence on the internet either via a department website or by posting career opportunities on an appropriate on-line source. Additionally, the importance of recognizing the value of involving department employees in helping to recruit is apparent. Providing employees with information about the ideal candidate, testing dates and processes, and other relevant information is important. Some agencies even offer an incentive as a part of an Employee Referral Program to encourage employees to refer good candidates.

The "Other" reasons included written comments about being recruited out of the academy or as a result of a referral by a friend.

TABLE 16. IF EMPLOYED BY AN AGENCY, I WAS RECRUITED TO THIS AGENCY VIA[54]

	Agency Sponsored	
	Percent	Std
Self-referral	43%	0.50
Website	36%	0.48
Agency employee who is a friend or relative	26%	0.44
Agency employee who told me about the opportunity	18%	0.39
I was already with the agency in another capacity	15%	0.36
Friend/Family who works in a different law enforcement agency	14%	0.34
Job fair	9%	0.28
Friend/Family no in law enforcement referred me	6%	0.23
Ad in paper	5%	0.21
Ad on radio/television	1%	0.12
Other	2%	0.14

EDUCATIONAL LEVEL

Table 17 presents the educational level of the affiliated and non-affiliated respondents. Despite the fact that high school education (or a GED) is the minimum educational requirement, most

---

[54] Recruit Survey, Item 5.

respondents had at least some college education. There is also a statistically significant difference between the affiliated and non-affiliated respondents. Affiliated respondents tended to have a higher level of education than non-affiliated respondents.[55] Non-affiliated respondents were more likely to have high school diplomas (or GEDs) or to have some college than affiliated respondents. Affiliated respondents were more likely to have AA or BA degrees than non-affiliated respondents.

Affiliated women were more likely to have a higher level of college education. Nearly 50% had at least a Bachelor Degree and 32% had an Associate Degree, compared to 36% and 25% for men.

TABLE 17. WHICH OF THE FOLLOWING BEST DESCRIBES YOUR HIGHEST LEVEL OF EDUCATION?[56]

	Agency Sponsored	Not Affiliated
High School / GED	9%	14%
Some College (LT 60 Units)	28%	48%
AA Degree (or 60 Units)	26%	25%
BA Degree	35%	11%
Post Graduate Degree	2%	2%

PREPARATION FOR THE ACADEMY

Table 18 presents the activities performed by the respondents to prepare for the academy. The most common activities for both affiliated and non-affiliated respondents were:

- Working out to get in shape
- Talking with an officer
- Going on a ride-a-long

From a recruitment point of view, employee referrals, ride-a-longs, and having staff available to talk with candidates were important strategies to attract potential candidates.

---

[55] A chi square statistic was calculated on the data represented in Table 7. This statistic indicated that there was a statically significant difference between the level of education for the affiliated and non-affiliated agencies χ^2(4 df) = 73.9, p<.0001.
[56] Recruit Survey, Item 6.

	Agency Sponsored		Not Affiliated	
	Percent	Std	Percent	Std
Work Out to get In Shape	92%	0.3	83%	0.4
Talk with an Officer	78%	0.4	78%	0.4
Go on a ride-a-long	62%	0.5	65%	0.5
Take College Courses	48%	0.5	47%	0.5
Read LE Material	41%	0.5	47%	0.5
Volunteer in LE	32%	0.5	26%	0.4
Other	7%	0.3	7%	0.3

EMPLOYMENT HISTORY

The employment history for affiliated and non-affiliated respondents is presented in table 19. More than half of the respondents from each group had been employed full-time with the same employer for two years or longer. There was little difference in type of employment between the affiliated and non-affiliated respondents.

---

[57] Recruit Survey, Item 7.

	Agency Sponsored	Not Affiliated
None	Less Than 1%	1%
Multiple Part-Time jobs	10%	13%
Part-Time, same employer, 2 yrs or more	15%	8%
Full-Time, Same employer, 2 yrs or more	57%	53%
Full-Time, multiple employers, 2 yrs or more	14%	17%
Other	5%	8%

FREE TIME ACTIVITIES

Table 20 presents the ratings on the types of recreational activities engaged in by the respondents. The most common activities performed by over half of both the affiliated and non-affiliated respondents are:

- Watching DVD movies at home
- Jogging
- Watching movies at a theatre

While not statistically significant, more affiliated women than men reported spending free time biking, swimming and jogging. This was not true for non-affiliated women who enjoyed reading more than others.

In reviewing all the "other comments," two were frequently mentioned - weight lifting and spending time with friends and family.

The relevancy of this question is to see where other potential candidates may be found. As an agency develops recruitment strategies, consideration should be given to promoting career

---

[58] Recruit Survey, Item 8.

opportunities in places similar to where these recruits spend free time, especially those under-represented.

TABLE 20. WHAT TYPE OF ACTIVITIES DO YOU REGULARLY ENGAGE IN DURING YOUR FREE TIME?[59]

	Agency Sponsored		Not Affiliated	
	Percent	Std	Percent	Std
DVD movies at home	67%	0.47	74%	0.44
Jogging	62%	0.49	58%	0.49
Movies at a theatre	55%	0.50	55%	0.50
Reading	41%	0.49	38%	0.49
Camping/hiking	37%	0.48	41%	0.49
Intramural team sports	34%	0.47	27%	0.44
Swimming	32%	0.47	38%	0.49
Biking	28%	0.45	28%	0.45
Professional sporting events	25%	0.43	18%	0.38
Fishing	22%	0.41	31%	0.47
Concerts	21%	0.41	20%	0.40
Martial arts	16%	0.37	10%	0.30
Hunting	11%	0.32	20%	0.40
Tennis	7%	0.26	9%	0.29
Other	27%	0.44	23%	0.42

---

[59] Recruit Survey, Item 9.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

MILITARY EXPERIENCE

Table 21 presents the number of affiliated and non-affiliated respondents with experience in the armed forces. Approximately three-fourths of both groups have no military experience. There is very little difference between the two groups relative to military experience.

TABLE 21. HAVE YOU BEEN IN THE
ARMED FORCES?[60]

	Agency Sponsored	Not Affiliated
No	76%	78%
Yes	24%	22%

ACADEMY PREPARATION CLASSES

Table 22 compares affiliated and non-affiliated respondents on whether or not they took classes or had other assistance to help prepare for the law enforcement academy. Fewer than half of both affiliated and non-affiliated recruits took classes or received other assistance in preparing for the academy.

TABLE 22. DID YOU TAKE ANY CLASSES
OR OTHER ASSISTANCE TO HELP YOU
PREPARE FOR THE ACADEMY?[61]

	Agency Sponsored	Not Affiliated	Total
No	58%	56%	57%
Yes	42%	44%	43%

---

[60] Recruit Survey, Item 10.
[61] Recruit Survey, Item 11.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

CLARITY OF ACADEMY REQUIREMENTS

Table 23 presents data on the number of respondents who were given clear expectations on the requirements for success in the academy and eventual career in law enforcement. While the overwhelming majority did, approximately one-sixth of the affiliated and non-affiliated respondents did not have clear expectations of the academy and job requirements.

A study reported earlier in this section regarding pre-entry police officers, suggested that agencies provide detailed and realistic information about the job and organization to applicants to help promote early career commitment.[62] New hires who enter the academy or a field training program and find that their perception is not accurate, are more likely to lose commitment, leave the organization, and perhaps the profession.

TABLE 23. DID SOMEONE MAKE CLEAR THE
EXPECTATIONS REQUIRED TO BE SUCCESSFUL
DURING THE ACADEMY AND LAW
ENFORCEMENT CAREER?[63]

	Agency Sponsored	Not Affiliated	Total
No	17%	18%	18%
Yes	83%	82%	82%

AGE OF DECISIONS TO SEEK A LAW ENFORCEMENT CAREER

Table 24 presents data on the age range at which affiliated and non-affiliated respondents became interested in a career in law enforcement. Although there is no statistical significance, the affiliated respondents tended to be older than the non-affiliated respondents.[64]

---

[62] Carless, 349.
[63] Recruit Survey, Item 12.
[64] The raw data represented in Table 14 were collapses into two age groups: 11 to 18 years (i.e., school age) and 19 years of age or older (i.e., beyond high school age). When these groups were compared by affiliation status, the Fisher's Exact Test two-sided probability was .0533. The commonly accepted level of statistical significance is .0500, so the value is not statistically significant. However, the data suggest that affiliated academy students tend to be older than non-affiliated students.

It is interesting to note that many recruits decided they were interested in a law enforcement career at an early age. Seventeen percent of the affiliated and twenty percent of the non-affiliate recruits had made a decision they were interested in a law enforcement career by the time they finished elementary school. By the time they finished high school the percent jumped to fifty percent and fifty-seven percent, respectively. This suggests that law enforcement agencies may want to consider recruitment strategies and/or opportunities for positive interaction with officers important from a long-range recruitment perspective.

TABLE 24. WHICH OF THE FOLLOWING AGE
RANGES DESCRIBES WHEN YOU DECIDED YOU
WERE INTERESTED IN A LAW ENFORCEMENT
CAREER?[65]

	Agency Sponsored	Not Affiliated
11 or younger (Elementary)	17%	20%
12-13 (Junior High)	9%	8%
14-18 (High School)	24%	29%
19-29	41%	37%
30-39	9%	5%
40-49	<1%	<1%
50 or older	<1%	<1%

Surveying academy recruits yielded important information in a variety of areas. Agencies can learn much that can be used to improve recruitment efforts. Asking similar questions of recent new hires could yield agency specific information that could be used to enhance recruitment efforts.

2001 SYMPOSIUM SURVEY

In 2001, a Recruitment Symposium was conducted and nearly 300 people were invited to attend. It was felt that it would be useful to survey those who attended this symposium to see how beneficial they felt the symposium was for addressing recruitment and retention in their respective agencies. A copy of the survey is included in Appendix Five.

---

[65] Recruit Survey, Item 13.

The primary thrust of the questions were to determine respondent reaction to the material presented, whether or not the individual suggested changes based on what they learned at the symposium, and whether or not those suggestions were implemented.

A total of 298 surveys were sent out and approximately eighty surveys were returned. In order to increase the response rate, a second questionnaire was sent out, generating another fifty responses, bringing the total responses returned to one hundred-thirty-two, a 44% return.

Reflecting back on Symposium 2001, 96% responded positively that they learned new ideas about recruitment, while 77% said they learned new ideas about retention at the symposium.

When asked if they used the information to improve recruitment and retention in their respective agencies, the response was also very positive at 84% and 67%, respectively. However, 30% agreed with the statement, "I recommended changes to others, but no action was taken."

Recruitment and retention are still issues for these agencies. Ninety-one percent said recruitment was still an issue in their respective agency. Retention was less of an issue at 72%.

Compared to four years ago, however, 67% felt recruitment was a bigger problem. Fifty-four percent responded positively that retention was a bigger problem.

Respondents were asked to identify where they were experiencing issues in their efforts to recruit and retain peace officers. Table 25 shows the results.

Clearly, attracting qualified candidates is the biggest problem most agencies are experiencing. However, other factors may well contribute to this problem. For example, nearby agencies may offer better pay or benefits, the testing/selection processes may be longer than in other agencies, career opportunities in the agency may be limited, the image of the agency may impede attracting candidates, or advertising efforts may be poor.

With respect to retention, competition from surrounding jurisdictions and cost of housing are often factors. In many areas of the state, affordable housing may be very limited, forcing officers to commute considerable distances. Those same officers may live or commute through a number of jurisdictions closer to home.

Written responses to the "Other" category offered no patterns of concerns. Rather, they included a variety of comments, such as:

    Candidates not passing the field training program
    AA degree/60 unit minimum requirement
    Recruits cannot pass the background
    Facilities cramped and small
    A career in law enforcement is not as attractive as it once was

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

TABLE 25. AGENCY CHALLENGES IN RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION[66]

Issue	Number
Getting qualified candidates to apply	117
Competition from surrounding jurisdictions	82
Working with the community to attract minority and/or female candidates	82
Cost of housing is high	73
Inadequate funding for recruitment efforts	56
Time necessary for a candidate to complete our testing/selection process	50
Pay/benefit package is not competitive	41
Higher than normal percentage of retirements	38
Recruits successfully completing the basic academy	31
Career enhancing opportunities available to officers is very limited	26
Advertising is not effective	25
Size of agency is adversely impacting recruitment	21
The image of our agency impedes attracting candidates	17
Training for officers after the academy is very limited	9
Other	11

Respondents were asked to list how many full-time and part-time staff were assigned to recruitment. Table 26 summarizes the responses.

Nearly half of the respondents indicated that they did not have anyone assigned full-time to recruitment. Fifty-one indicated they had one or two people assigned full-time. A total of one hundred-four of the respondents had two or fewer full-time staff assigned to recruitment.

TABLE 26. NUMBER OF FULL-TIME AND PART-TIME STAFF ASSIGNED TO RECRUITMENT[67]

Number	Full-time	Part-time
0	53	35
1-2	51	49
3-5	10	15
6-10	2	6
11+	2	6

Respondents were not asked to list the size of their respective departments, so a correlation to department size versus number of staff assigned to recruitment could not be made.

---

[66] Symposium Survey, Item 13.
[67] Symposium Survey, Item 14.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

Another way to look at recruitment is by the amount of money budgeted to the process. Table 27 summaries the responses relative to money budgeted to recruitment. It is noteworthy that only sixty-seven people responded to this item. It is possible that many did not have this information readily available to them when they were completing this survey.

Thirty-six respondents (more than half) indicated that their respective agencies do not budget for recruitment. Seventy percent of the respondents budget less than $5,000. The amount of money budgeted, however, ran as high as $800,000.

TABLE 27. MONEY BUDGETED FOR RECRUITMENT[68]

Budgeted Amount	Number
0	36
1 – 4,999	11
5,000 – 9,999	2
10,000 – 14,999	9
15,000 – 19,999	2
20,000 – 24,999	2
25,000 +	5
Total	67

The next survey item inquired as to how much money was specifically earmarked for advertisement. Table 28 summarized the responses. Here again, fewer than half responded to this item. Of those who did, more than half (twenty-eight) do not budget for recruitment. Twenty agencies budget less than $10,000 for advertisement. Only five respondents indicated they budget $10,000 or more for advertisement.

TABLE 28. MONEY SPECIFICALLY
BUDGETED FOR ADVERTISING[69]

Budgeted Amount	Number
0	28
1 – 4,999	15
5,000 – 9,999	5
10,000 – 14,999	1
15,000 – 19,999	2
20,000 – 24,999	1
25,000 +	1
Total	53

---

[68] Ibid.
[69] Ibid.

The respondents were asked several open-ended questions. The first of these questions asked, "What would most help your organization with the recruitment and retention of peace officers?" The response yielded many different comments, which generally fell into seven categories as shown in Table 29.

The category with the highest number of comments was Pay/Benefits. There were sixty comments related to pay and benefits. Within these comments most specifically addressed increasing pay and benefits, including several that suggested their agencies needed the enhanced retirement program commonly known as "3@50." There were a dozen comments that addressed the need to assist officers with the high cost of housing.

TABLE 29. RESPONDENT SUGGESTIONS TO
IMPROVE RECRUITMENT & RETENTION[70]

Categories of Suggestions	Number
Pay/Benefits	60
Funding	22
Recruitment Efforts	20
Candidate Pool	15
Work Environment Enhancements	9
Testing/Selection	7
Other	11

In the category of Funding, there were seventeen comments about adding staff and/or resources to assist with recruitment. Overall, adding staff and/or resources was second only to increasing pay.

Recruitment Efforts consisted of a number of comments that focused on aspects of recruitment such as needing ideas on where to recruit, how to recruit, and needing recruitment tools, like videos and public service announcements. It also includes several comments about needing management support for department recruitment efforts.

The category of Candidate Pool consisted primarily of comments about needing more qualified candidates or more candidates from which to make selections. There were two comments pertaining to academy graduates not being able to pass field training. The thought was that these agencies needed candidates who were better trained in order to successfully complete field training.

---

[70] Symposium Survey, Item 15.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

The next open-ended question inquired as to what has worked best to recruit and retain employees. Table 30 identifies ten categories of responses and the number of responses is attributed to each category.

Advertising received the most responses. The focus was largely on how agencies advertise employment opportunities in the traditional sense of advertising. For example, word of mouth and internet accounted for 81% of the responses with word of mouth receiving the most responses. There were a number of comments that specifically referenced employee referrals and agency referral programs.

Recruitment Activity/Events referred to agency representatives going out to various locations to promote career opportunities. Academy visits and job fairs were cited most often, making up more than half of the events referenced. Job fairs and career days on both high school and college campuses were mentioned. Other ideas mentioned more than once included visiting military bases, community events, and outreach to Administration of Justice classes.

With respect to benefits, competitive pay was cited most often. Good benefits and the "3@50" enhanced retirement program were each mentioned multiple times. Other responses included longevity pay, signing bonuses, transfer sick/vacation accrual balances, and lifetime medical.

TABLE 30. WHAT HAS WORKED BEST TO RECRUIT
AND RETAIN STAFF?[71]

Category	Number
Advertising	53
Recruitment Activity/Events	41
Benefits	23
Working Conditions	17
Agency Reputation	15
Testing	14
Recruitment Planning	11
Ancillary Programs	9
Quality of Life	5
Other	3

Working conditions played an important part in recruitment and retention for seventeen agencies. Scheduling and expanding specialized assignments were cited most often. Scheduling generally referred to having the "3-12" schedule or other alternate schedule. Other comments included mentoring, take home cars for detectives, state-of-the-art equipment, and the availability of commute vehicles.

---

[71] Symposium Survey, Item 16.

Having a good reputation was viewed as important by many agencies. Eight agencies specifically cited having a good reputation as a benefit for recruitment and retention. However, other related comments cited such things as having high standards, positive work environment, and promoting the agency in a good light.

Testing was cited fourteen times. More than half of the comments pertained to shortening the time required to complete the hiring process. The other comments included on-going or frequent testing and administering testing off-site.

Recruitment planning included a variety of comments pertaining to aspects of planning, such as developing a hiring plan or other decisions that would impact how or where an agency might recruit. Most often, agencies commented on making a decision to focus on recruiting lateral officers.

Ancillary programs included all comments about having success with Reserve, Cadet or Explorer Programs, as well as part-time jobs for college students. A small number of agencies sited this as an important way to bring people in the agency who might later become regular officers.

Quality of life pertained to the jurisdiction being located in a nice place to live. These agencies saw this as a plus in attracting and keeping employees. Having affordable housing was cited once.

The survey of people who attended the 2001 Recruitment and Retention Symposium provided a perspective on whether agencies made changes as a result of attending the symposium. Further, the respondents provided updated information as the current status of recruitment, challenges agencies face, and what has worked well to attract candidates. The survey also revealed that while recruitment and retention are issues, agencies have not committed much in staff or resources to address the problem.

RECRUITER SURVEY – NATIONAL PERSPECTIVE

Representatives from fifty agencies across the United States responded to a survey that was administered to participants who attended one of two recruitment classes[72] conducted in Arlington, Virginia in May 2005. A list of participating agencies can be found in Appendix Three and a copy of the survey in Appendix Six.

The focus of this survey was to identify what changes these agencies made in the past three years to improve recruitment and, of those changes, what worked best and what changes are anticipated in the next two-three years. Examples of questions that were asked focused on how

---

[72] The title of the two classes were: (1) The 2005 National Summit on Law Enforcement Diversity Recruitment by the Performance Institute and (2) 2005 Law Enforcement Recruitment Advertising Conference by The National Law Enforcement Recruiters Association.

many full-time or part-time staff were assigned to recruiting and how much money was budgeted for recruitment and advertising. A copy of the survey can be found in Appendix Four.

To the question, "In the last three years, what changes have you made to how you recruit?" the responses listed most often referred to expanding outreach efforts such as attending more job fairs, recruiting on college campuses, interacting with community groups, creating more printed material to distribute or taking other steps to get the information out in the community. Related to this was an increased effort to focus outreach or advertisement to target college, minority, and female candidates.

Nearly a third of the agencies developed an internet presence. This was accomplished by adding a department website or contracting with an ad agency to post a listing on the internet. (The U.S. Army found that on-line recruiting was extremely effective and cost-efficient. "In the first year of its operation in 2002, for example, the cyber station generated 14,000 leads, which led to about 1,400 enlistments. That 1-in-10 ratio is the best of any station in the Recruiting Command…The cyber station now hosts about 100 hours' worth of chat room sessions, including more than 40 hours in Spanish."[73])

One-quarter of the respondents focused on the recruiters. They increased the number of recruiters, diversity of recruiters, size of the recruitment unit, and/or provided training to recruiters.

At least three agencies mentioned taking the following steps to improve recruitment: implemented some form of employee referral system, developed a recruitment plan, changed minimum standards to attract more candidates, and took steps to speed up the selection process.

With respect to the second question, "Considering your response to the question above, which of these changes has worked the best for your agency?" the use of internet was identified as working best to improve recruitment. This included agencies that developed a website presence or paid for advertisement on the internet.

Close behind the internet were expanded outreach efforts through attending more job fairs, visits to colleges, interacting with community groups, creating more printed material to distribute, or taking other steps to get the information out in the community. A number of agencies found that increasing the number of recruiters or size of recruitment unit and/or provided training to recruiters was beneficial, as was implementing some form of employee referral system. Those who took steps to speed up the selection process felt this improved recruitment.

Participants were asked to identify what changes were anticipated in the next two to three years. The largest category of comments focused on plans to expand outreach efforts through upgrading materials, using different advertising medium and attending more job fairs. A number of agencies indicated an intent to focus efforts to attract minorities and women. Finally, some agencies were planning to develop a website or advertise on the internet.

---

[73] Patrick J. Kiger, "Manpower Mission," <u>Workforce Management</u>, 24 October 2005, 31.

Successful recruitment efforts often have executive support and a written strategic plan. Using a scale of one to seven, with one, strongly disagree and seven, strongly agree, respondents were asked to rate to what extent they believed their chief or sheriff were supportive of their recruitment efforts. The responses ranged from one to seven with a collective average score of 5.86, meaning that most generally agreed that the chief or sheriff was supportive.

Using the same scale to respond to the item, "Your agency has developed a written strategy outlining your recruitment goals," respondent ratings again ranged from one to seven. However, the average score was lower at 4.57, meaning there was only slight agreement.

The next survey item focused on what attracted qualified applicants to their respective agencies. Respondents had eighteen recruitment options to rate. Table 31 lists the eight items that had a positive rating. Positive rating meaning the score reflected at least a response in the "Slightly Agree" range or higher.

TABLE 31. WHAT ATTRACTED QUALIFIED CANDIDATES[74]

What Attracted Qualified Applicants	Average Rating
Website	6.95
Agency employee who is a friend or relative referred the applicant	5.56
Self-Referral	5.55
Friend/family not in law enforcement referred applicant	4.98
Friend/family who work in a different law enforcement agency	4.96
Agency employee who is not a friend or relative referred the applicant to the department	4.96
Ad in newspaper	4.59
Job Fair	4.58

Website received the strongest response with an average rating of 6.95 out of a possible 7. Nearly one and one-half points below were friend or employee referral and self-referral.

Respondents were asked to identify how the agency helps recruits prepare for the academy. About 75% of the respondents indicated that their respective agencies make staff available to talk with candidates about what to expect in the academy, as well as allowing the opportunity to go on a ride-a-long.

Table 32 lists the various options respondents had to choose and the number of respondents who selected that response. In the other category, several comments addressed offering orientations and/or open houses to address expectations and answer questions.

---

[74] Law Enforcement Recruiter Survey, Item 8.

TABLE 32. OPTIONS AGENCIES OFFER RECRUITS PREPARE FOR THE ACADEMY[75]

Option	Number
Work out classes to get in shape	6
Provide a reading list covering relevant topics such as community policing	8
Provide courses in conjunction with a community college	1
Allowing the opportunity to go on a ride-a-long	34
Making staff available for interested applicants to talk with about what to expect in the academy	36
Contracts to allow recruits who have not been successful an opportunity to return to the academy after he/she completes some agreed upon measures, such as a physical fitness class	7
Other	10

Respondents were asked to rate the agency's approach to involving department employees in the recruitment process. Five options were offered ranging from no involvement to very high involvement. Respondents were asked to select the one option that best reflected the agency's approach.

Table 33 shows the response to this item. Sixty-three percent felt their agency used what was described as medium level of involvement. Only twenty percent, combined, rated their agency high or very high.

TABLE 33. HOW AGENCIES INVOLVE EMPLOYEES IN RECRUITMENT[76]

Level of Involvement	Number/Percent	
None – Our department has no structured plan to involve employees	7	14%
Low – Employees only provided information about upcoming recruitment periods, but not generally encouraged to get involved otherwise	1	2%
Medium – Some efforts are made to get employees involved. Examples might include providing materials for employees to distribute or involving a cross-section of employees in developing recruitment strategies	31	63%
High – Formal written plan providing for paid incentives and/or department recognition when recruit is hired/completes and/or completes probation	7	14%
Very high – All of the above are employed to engage the whole department in the process of finding qualified candidates	3	6%

---

[75] Law Enforcement Recruiter Survey, Item 10.
[76] Law Enforcement Recruiter Survey, Item 11.

The survey of recruiters provided up-to-date information as to the changes these agencies have made to improve recruitment and what has worked the best to improve recruitment, as well as attract qualified recruits. Only 20% of the respondents have taken steps to develop a formal employee referral program and fewer yet have focused on engaging the whole agency in the process of finding qualified recruits.

2005 – RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION SYMPOSIUM SURVEY

As part of the registration process for the 2005 Recruitment and Retention Symposium, 145 participants completed an on-line survey. A copy of the survey is included in Appendix 7. Participants were asked to what degree they agreed or disagreed with eight recruitment items. The results are recorded in Table 34.

The overwhelming majority (81%) agreed that recruitment is a problem for their agency. However, only 26% had developed a written recruitment strategic plan. While recruitment is an issue, only a small percent have done strategic planning to address the issue. Sixty-seven percent of the agencies survey candidates to determine how the candidate heard about the agency. Sixty-four percent have taken steps in the past three years to shorten the testing process.

In terms of recruitment strategies, some agencies have made strides. Just over half of the agencies (51%) feel they have identified who would be an ideal candidate. Thirty-one percent have made efforts to develop strategies to partner with external organizations. Another 33% actively recruit high school and college interns.

The high cost of housing makes it difficult to recruit in many areas of California. Only 5% have found effective ways to address this issue.

Respondents were also asked to summarize steps the agency had taken to improve recruitment in the past two years. Improving and/or shortening the selection process were the biggest improvement agencies made. More or better advertisement was the second most frequently mentioned change, followed by recruiting at academies. There improvement included more emphasis on recruiting at job fairs, using the internet, personalizing the recruitment process and improving pay and benefits.

TABLE 34. REGISTRANT SURVEY RESPONSES - RECRUITMENT[77]

Statement	Agree		On Opinion		Disagree	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
1. Recruitment is a problem for our agency.	127	81	7	5	23	15
2. Our agency has developed a written strategic plan for recruitment.	39	26	21	14	91	60
3. We have identified who we believe to be the ideal candidate for our agency.	78	51	33	22	41	27
4. We have surveyed applicants and know how they heard about our agency.	102	67	18	12	32	21
5. We have improved our selection process in the past three (3) years to shorten the amount of time required to complete the selection process.	96	64	21	14	33	22
6. We have developed effective strategies to partner with external organizations to address our recruitment needs.	47	31	28	19	75	50
7. We have found effective ways to address the cost of housing in our area to help employees live in our jurisdiction.	7	5	27	18	116	77
8. We actively recruit interns from local high schools or colleges as a part of our recruitment strategy.	49	33	22	14	79	53

Representatives from seventy-six law enforcement agencies attended the symposium. As the representatives registered at the symposium they were asked to identify how many vacancies existed in their respective agency. The results of this informal poll revealed these agencies had nearly 8,300 vacancies. There were, however, a number of large agencies attending, such as the Los Angeles Police and Sheriff's Department, San Francisco Police Department, and the San Diego Police and Sheriff's Departments.

---

[77] 2005 Recruitment and Retention Survey, Items 1-8.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

Key Points - Summary

The following is a summary of the key points identified in this chapter.

- This project involved establishing a Recruitment and Retention Advisory Council whose members represented a cross-section of California law enforcement and related professional associations.
- Subject matter expert focus groups yielded rich information, including identifying ten strategies to improve peace officer recruitment.
- More than 850 academy recruits, from fifteen academies, responded to a survey. Sixty-one percent were affiliated, meaning they were hired and sponsored to attend the academy by a law enforcement agency. Key findings included:
  - The two strongest motivators to pursue a law enforcement career were a desire to serve and adventure/excitement.
  - Recruits identified time required to complete the (selection) process and lack of contact through the process as the most difficult aspects of applying to be a peace officer.
  - Agency reputation, variety of assignment, agency location and academy sponsorship were the most compelling reasons for accepting employment with their respective agencies.
  - Affiliated recruits were recruited most often via the following recruitment strategies: website, agency employee who is a friend or relative, and other employee referral.
  - The most popular recreational activities for the respondents included watching DVD movies at home, jogging, and watching movies at theaters.
  - For both affiliated and non-affiliated recruits, more than 50% decided they were interested in a law enforcement career by the time they graduated from high school.
- A survey of 2001 Recruitment and Retention Symposium attendees revealed the following:
  - Compared to four years ago, 67% believe recruitment to be a bigger problem and 54% believe retention to be a bigger problem.
  - The biggest four challenges for respondents were: getting qualified candidates to apply, competing with surrounding jurisdictions, working with the community to attract minorities and/or women, and the high cost of housing.
  - Nearly 75% of respondents budget $5,000 or less for recruitment.
  - Respondents identified word of mouth and internet as being most successful in reaching candidates.
- A survey of fifty recruiters across the U.S. found that their respective agencies had, collectively, changed how they recruited in the following ways: expanded outreach efforts, developed an internet presence, or focused on making changes to the recruiter(s). Of the changes that were made, use of the internet yielded the best results followed by outreach and improvements to the selection process. In the next two-three years, the respondents envisioned upgrading recruitment materials, using different advertising mediums, attending more job fairs, placing more focus on recruiting minorities and women, and enhancing or developing an internet presence.
- These recruiters found that the website and employee referrals to family or friends

worked best to attract qualified candidates.
- Sixty-three percent of the respondents say their respective departments use a "medium" approach to involving employees in the recruitment process described as "Some efforts to get employees involved with recruitment by providing materials or involving employees in developing recruitment strategies."
- A survey of participants who registered to attend the 2005 Recruitment and Retention Symposium found the following:
  ○ Eighty-one percent agreed that recruitment is a problem.
  ○ Only 26%, however, have developed a written strategic plan.
  ○ Sixty-four percent have improved the selection process by shortening the time required to complete the selection process.
  ○ Only 31% have found effective strategies to partner with external organizations.
  ○ Seventy-six agencies participated in the symposium and, collectively, had more than 8,300 vacancies.

The next chapter will present current information on diversity recruitment to attract minorities and women.

Page intentionally left blank

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

CHAPTER 3

<u>DIVERSITY RECRUITMENT</u>

Nearly every community has ethnic diversity. Some of the ethnic population has been in this country for generations and others have only recently arrived. Some persons are light in color, while others are darker. Most people came to this country in hopes of a better life. All persons want to feel important and to be treated with dignity and respect.

The founders of this country valued life, liberty and the pursuit of happiness. They wrote it into the constitution and made necessary updates as greater revelation occurred.

One of the biggest challenges facing law enforcement agencies is attracting a diverse pool of qualified candidates who represent the various ethnic groups in the community. Progress had been made although it has been slow.

Webster's defines diversity as:

> …quality, state, fact, or instance of being diverse; different.[78]

Diversity, in and of itself, is not bad, it is just different. Segments of the community may have differences in culture and how they communicate. They may have had different experiences in day-to-day living in terms of education, socio-economic conditions, and interaction with law enforcement. It is in this context where differences can give rise to communication breakdown, mistrust, and other issues.

One way for law enforcement agencies to address this is by hiring a diverse workforce that reflects the different racial and ethnic groups in the community. Another is to improve the relationship between the law enforcement agency and different segments of the community.

It stands to reason that a poor law enforcement/community relationship hinders recruitment. Acrimony creates a chasm that is difficult to bridge without treating the cause.

In problem-solving, having diverse perspectives is essential to brainstorming potential courses of action and identifying the best solution. The same is true with the law enforcement profession. Having different perspectives is important, especially when serving and partnering with the community to address crime and quality of life issues.

---

[78] Michael Agnes, Editor in Chief, <u>Webster's New World College Dictionary, Fourth Edition</u>, (Cleveland: Wiley Publishing, Inc., 2002), 419.

If a law enforcement agency is to reflect the community, more effort must go into recruiting members from different segments of the community; including women. The benefits for an agency include:

- Increase in mutual understanding between different groups
- Decrease in tension between both employees in an agency and within the community
- Instill community confidence in the law enforcement agency
- Spur coordination within the community
- Reduce stereotyping[79]

However, improving diversity is easier said than done. But why? What factors make this such a challenge? The reasons are many and varied.

For minority/ethnic groups, law enforcement as a career may not be a serious consideration for a variety of reasons. A study conducted in the United Kingdom found the following factors discouraged ethnic groups from applying for police officer positions:

- The thought of having to work in a racist environment, having to face prejudice from both colleagues and the general public on a daily basis.
- The isolation of minority ethnic police officers in a predominately white male culture, leading them to deny their cultural identity in order to fit in.
- The danger of the job and having to deal with unpleasant situations coupled with a lack of confidence in (racist) colleagues assisting them in circumstances where their life or physical safety were at risk
- The anticipated reactions of friends or family, who they thought might be disappointed, fearful for their safety, and perhaps hostile; they also felt that minority ethnic police officers might be put under unreasonable pressure to reveal sensitive and confidential information.
- Concerns over pressure from the local community to decide where their loyalties were and, for Asian Muslim women with strong religious beliefs, whether the job was appropriate for a woman.
- Black and Asian women were anxious about being subjected to both sexism and racism if they joined the police.
- A perception that minority ethnic police officers have little or no promotion prospects, which in turn could limit their chances of getting the financial rewards associated with higher ranks of the police service.[80]

The reasons expressed in this study reflect the perspective of ethnic groups and how they view the police. While the study is based on people in the United Kingdom, the same perspectives exist in the United States.

---

[79] Ronald N. Regnery, Legal Aspects of Diversity Hiring Practices – Learning Past Lessons to Avoid Future Pitfalls, Presentation at The 2005 National Summit on Law Enforcement Diversity Recruitment, (Arlington, VA: May 11, 2005).
[80] Vanessa Stone and Rachel Tuffin, Attitudes of People from Minority Ethnic Communities towards a Career in the Police Service, Police Research Series – Paper 136, (London: Policing and Reducing Crime Unit, 2000), vi.

In the late 1990's, the Nassau County Police Department was concerned when 91 minority candidates dropped out of the selection process. In order to ascertain why they dropped out, a recruit officer was assigned to randomly contact candidates who potentially could have been hired between 1997 and 1998. Twenty-one interviews were conducted. The two primary reasons given by these candidates were cynicism and elapsed time from test to hire. Cynicism pertained to the candidates lacking faith that the system would be fair and impartial.[81]

Felipe A. Ortiz, National President of the National Latino Peace Officers Association, identified the following obstacles in recruiting Hispanics:

- Mobility amongst Hispanics/Latinos is low due to family and community ties as they prefer to stay close to family.
- Financial constraints inhibit them from applying and moving.
- Reputation of a police department's hiring and promotional practices.[82]

As noted earlier in this report, an agency's reputation was the most important factor recruits considered in selecting an agency for employment. Agencies with a reputation of being professional during interaction with the community, inclusive in dealing with all segments of the community, having a demonstrated history of hiring and promoting qualified candidates regardless of gender or ethnicity, and a service-oriented philosophy have made great strides in creating a climate conducive to attracting a diverse workforce.

In an article by the National Center for Women and Policing, the following issues were identified as barriers to women in law enforcement:

- Negative attitude of male colleagues
- Gender discrimination
- Underutilization of female officers
- Sexual harassment
- Co-worker gossip
- Lack of promotional opportunities
- Inflexible working patterns
- Burden of "proving themselves" beyond what is expected of men[83]

The presence of these barriers, or perception thereof, will impact an agency's ability to recruit women into the profession.

---

[81] Inspector Lawrence W. Mulvey, Achieving Diversity: Mentoring During the Applicant Investigative Process, quoted in U.S. Department of Justice, Achieving Diversity Through Marketing, Based on Conferences of the Major Cities Chiefs 1999-2001, 36.

[82] Felipe A. Ortiz, Recruitment of Hispanics, presentation to the Recruitment and Retention Advisory Council in San Diego on August 25, 2005.

[83] Kim Lonsway, Hiring and Retaining More Women: The Advantages to Law Enforcement Agencies, National Center for Women and Policing a division of the Feminist Majority Foundation, Spring 2003, 9. (Available on the National Center for Women and Policing Website at this address: http://www.womenandpolicing.org/pdf/NewAdvantagesReport.pdf)

In 2000, the New York State Police conducted a study to better understand the perspectives of women toward law enforcement in general and the New York State Police specifically. What they found was that women had a negative perception about law enforcement in these areas:

- Job danger
- Working alone
- Possibility of relocation

Additionally, they found the following job attributes to be important to women:

- Financial and job security (salary, benefits, pension)
- Social contribution (helping others, performing work that is critical and important)
- Supportive work climate (team environment – statistically significant for women)
- Job challenge and skill variety (also known as job enrichment, which includes career advancement opportunities and job satisfaction)
- Family-friendly work policies (statistically significant for women) [84]

The research conducted by the New York State Police was subsequently used by the agency to develop a marketing strategy to recruit women. The results will be shared later in this chapter.

The succeeding sections will provide information agencies can use to overcome the obstacles to recruiting segments of the community identified above. Progress in creating a diverse workforce is dependant upon understanding the concerns of different segments of the community, implementing changes that address those concerns, and communicating this to the community through a variety of marketing strategies.

MINORITY RECRUITMENT

There are many terms pertaining to recruiting from different segments of the community. Some call this "Minority Recruitment," while others refer to it as "Diversity Recruitment." This can be a sensitive issue because of the tension that currently exists, or existed, between some communities and law enforcement. For the purposes of this section, Minority Recruitment is used to differentiate it from a focus on women, who will be addressed in the next section.

All segments of the community are important, especially in light of the difficulty in finding qualified candidates. However, in order to better reflect the community, an agency may need to focus on some segments of the community more than others. The issue is in how an agency markets and reaches out to the community to attract qualified candidates.

---

[84] Lieutenant Bryon Christman, Recruiting New York State Troopers, A presentation at the 2005 State Police Hiring and Promotional Summit, San Antonio, Texas, September 20, 2005.

In order to maintain credibility with the community, and in accordance with federal law, the process must not treat candidates disparately or cause adverse impact for one group over others. The U. S. Department of Justice investigates such complaints.

Success in focused recruitment, especially when reaching out to minority or ethnic segments of the community, is largely dependent on three things: the relationship the department has with the community, the experience of minority officers within the agency, and the methods used by the agency to conduct outreach. All three are necessary to get optimal results.

A study reported in the Journal of Criminal Justice conducted in Australia that focused on pre-entry police officers reported that information about organizational values, culture, and climate would help applicants determine if they were compatible with the job and organization. Specific to diversity, the author had this advice:

> Employers could also foster early career commitment by promoting awareness and knowledge about EEO (equal employment opportunities) or diversity policies. Knowing that the organization promotes and encourages gender and cultural diversity is likely to enhance willingness to persevere with career goals and intentions to remain a police officer.[85]

Another study, also reported in the Journal of Criminal Justice, concluded that the presence of an African American or Latino chief or mayor were significant predictors of the employment of their respective ethnic group in the police department.[86] The survey was based on a random survey of 281 municipal police departments across the U.S. with populations of 25,000 or more. The police departments were surveyed in 1993, 1996, and 2000.

In an article by Chief Harold L. Hurtt, he articulates four steps suggested by Dr. Gary Weaver to achieve diversity in law enforcement:

1. Law enforcement professionals must know the public perception of their own culture and how it affects others.
2. Learn about different cultures found within a law enforcement agency and the community it serves in order to develop a cultural awareness.
3. Understand the dynamics of cross-cultural communication, adjustment, and conflict since many cultures communicate differently which contributes to communication breakdown.
4. Develop cross-cultural communicative, analytical and interpretive skills in order to communicate with different cultures more effectively.[87]

---

[85] Carless, 349.

[86] Jihong Zhao, Ni He and Nicholas Lovrich, "Predicting the employment of minority officers in U.S. cities: OLS fixed-effect panel model results for African American and Latino officers for 1993, 1996 and 2000," Journal of Criminal Justice, 33 (2005), 384.

[87] Chief Harold L. Hurtt, A Chief's perspective on why we need to achieve diversity in law enforcement, quoted in U.S. Department of Justice, Achieving Diversity Through Marketing, Based on Conferences of the Major Cities Chiefs 1999-2001, 10.

While this article was written at least five years ago, it still offers good advice. Agencies must take the time to conduct self-analysis in the form of evaluating the by-product of the service delivered through the eyes of the community.

A study conducted by the University of Tennessee at the request of the Southeast Community-Oriented Policing Education Institute surveyed 100 cities in eight states in the Southeast region. The survey asked questions of police, government, and community leaders in these cities about community-policing. One of the questions focused on the level of trust that existed between police and minorities in the community. The results showed that local government and minority leaders rated the level of trust much lower than did law enforcement leaders. The study said this was also a common finding in other studies.[88]

At the Recruiting for Tomorrow: Investing in Human Capital Symposium, hosted by the U.S Department of Justice and Community Policing Consortium on October 31 and November 1, 2005, Dr. C. B. Akins spoke to the point of improving recruitment as a part of improving community relations. The following points are particularly relevant.

- Your recruitment "Video" should agree with your "Audio" – What people see in the community as you deliver service should match what you say in your recruitment videos.
- Listen to the "quiet riot" – Your community will either be "engaged or enraged." Seek to engage the community in meaningful dialogue. Failure to do this may result in meeting the community in the streets where you will have no choice but to listen to an enraged audience.
- Buy-in comes from the top – The Chief must consistently support improved community relations and diversity. This includes appropriately dealing with officers, whose actions violate community trust.
- Learn to use "intentional" language – We are what we call "ourselves." Avoid speaking of a white community, black community, Hispanic community, or any other. We are one community. There are, however, different segments within the community.
- Improving relationships between the community and police – A Five-Step Process: These five steps represent stages of communication between the community and police. They need not occur in sequence if community and police leaders see the need and are willing to engage in meaningful dialogue and work together to bring about real improvement in community building.

  o Irritation – Segments of the community will be an irritant as they seek meaningful dialogue with an agency.
  o Confrontation – When irritation does not work, expect confrontation in some fashion to follow.
  o Cooperation – To diffuse confrontation some agencies will grudgingly agree to cooperate. At this level, it may not be productive.
  o Collaboration – There is a willingness to work together, but it is still not optimal.

---

[88] Kent R. Kerley, When Community and Agency Are in Sync, Community Policing Exchange, November/December 1999, http://www.communitypolicing.org/publications/exchange/e29_99/e29kerle.htm, (Last viewed: January 16, 2006).

o   Cross-fertilization – Here the community and police truly work together by respecting and valuing each other, listening to one another, and developing mutual goals to improve the community.[89]

While most of the literature on police recruitment comes from those in law enforcement, this comes from the heart of a community leader, a pastor of a large church who has, for many years, had a vision of a stronger community, one where the police and the community truly partner to improve relationships and address quality of life issues for everyone.
In the final report of the Innovations in Police Recruitment and Hiring, the author identified some key learning points from the five Hiring in the Spirit of Service grant sites. These are important considerations for agencies committed to enhancing diversity.

- Employing input from minority employees and community members is encouraged and their input should occur in the initial planning stages. The benefit of involving them is that they can provide information on why potential minority candidates might seek or not seek a law enforcement position. They can also provide important information on what it would take to help minority candidates to envision themselves as an officer.

- Mentoring and/or tutoring is important not just to help a candidate be successful in completing the academy, but post-academy as they adjust to the culture of the law enforcement agency, which may be very different from what they are accustomed. A couple of the agencies found that difficulties associated with English as a second language necessitated them going further than expected to provide assistance.

- In all of the agencies, the community was involved in the recruitment process. While the involvement may have been somewhat different in the participating agencies, it was found to be beneficial in identifying, recruiting and retaining service-oriented recruits. The involvement may have occurred in one or more of the following areas: focus groups, advisory committees, participation on oral boards, recruiters, or mentors/tutors.[90]

- Due to past mistrust, it may be a challenge and "decidedly more complex" to obtain meaningful input and participation. However, agencies found that by spending more time preparing community members to participate and "framing expectations as well as anticipated outcomes," they received better participation.[91]

Several programs that focus on different approaches to improve community relationships and/or improve recruitment within diverse segments of the community are highlighted below.

---

[89] Dr. C. B. Akins, Sr., A Voice from the Community, A presentation at the Recruiting for Tomorrow: Investing in Human Capital Conference, hosted by the U.S Department of Justice and Community Policing Consortium on October 31, 2005. Dr. C. B. Akins pastor at First Baptist Church Bracktown in Lexington, KY, and can be contacted at (859) 231-7042.
[90] Ellen Scrivner, Innovations in Police Recruitment and Hiring, U.S. Department of Justice, Office of Community Policing Services, http://www.cops.usdoj.gov/mime/open.pdf?Item=1655, 71.
[91] Ibid, 65.

BALTIMORE COUNTY POLICE DEPARTMENT, MARYLAND – HISPANIC/LATINO
COMMUNITY LIAISON PROGRAM

The Baltimore County Police Department realized that recruitment of Hispanics/Latinos had to
be connected with strengthening ties with this segment of the community. They established the
following goals that address both community outreach and recruitment as a part of a Hispanic
Community Liaison Program.

- To establish positive relations with the Hispanic/Latino community to ensure they will
  call the police when needed and help reduce crime and victimization. To build
  relationships with civic groups, local industry, businesses, and members of the
  Hispanic/Latino community.
- To recruit bilingual volunteers to assist in neighborhoods with large Spanish speaking
  populations. These volunteers will assist with answering questions about Police matters
  and County Services available to residents.
- To actively recruit qualified Hispanic/Latino candidates for employment with the
  Baltimore County Police Department.
- To assist Patrol, Criminal Investigation Division, and Specialized Unit Detectives with
  investigations and any other detail as needed. To respond to incidents of a critical or
  emergency nature involving Spanish speaking subjects. To coordinate between crime
  victims and police as needed.
- To assist in the training of officers with instruction aimed at eliminating cultural and
  language barriers.
- To provide assistance by explaining DUI laws and education in traffic safety to the
  Spanish Speaking community. This will help to reduce the number of DUI
  arrests, reduce crashes, reduce fatalities, and increase traffic safety awareness in
  general.[92]

Officer Carlos Selvi, Hispanic/Latino Liaison Officer, had this to say about the program:

We started the program in August 2004. During the 1990's, the Hispanic/Latino
population increased by nearly 70% and that does not include illegal immigrants. A
study showed that 86% of the foreign language calls received on the 9-1-1 line were from
Spanish speaking people.

Language barriers, fear of being deported and lack of trust were a problem. As a result,
many crimes were not being reported and when they were, investigation was very
difficult.

The primary reason this program was started was to improve the department's
relationship by improving communication and understanding between the department and
the Hispanic/Latino population in the community. We do a lot of presentations to the
community and talk about the need for Hispanic/Latino officers, especially bi-lingual
officers.

---

[92] Baltimore County Police Department Website, Hispanic/Latino Outreach Program,
http://www.co.ba.md.us/Agencies/police/community/hispanic_outreach.html, (Last viewed: January 16, 2006).

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

Improving relationships and communication with the Hispanic/Latino population is important to us. Our annual training has included an 8-hour Survival Spanish course. Our department will also pay for officers to attend a 32-hour course at a local community college that provides cultural information, as well as enhancing language and communication skills between officers and Hispanics/Latinos.

While we have not conducted a study to measure improvement in perceptions, I believe it has been positive.[93]

This liaison program reflects a philosophy broader than just that of recruitment. It is a step in the right direction and will, if properly managed, improve the relationship between the police department and community. Recall, too, that the Hispanic/Latino population in the U. S. is projected to double by 2050 and, in California, Hispanic/Latino currently represents 32% of the population.[94] Agencies will want to keep this in mind as they plan for the future.

SACRAMENTO POLICE DEPARTMENT – COMMUNITY RECRUITER PROGRAM

The Sacramento Police Department started the Community Recruiter Program in 2004 as a means of attracting segments of the community where traditional outreach had been largely ineffective. Funding for this program and others in the department was provided in part by the Hiring in the Spirit of Service Grant awarded to them by the U. S. Department of Justice, COPS Office.

The concept is this: "Identify interested community leaders and train them to be Police Recruiters."[95] Further, "the Community Recruiter Program consists of community leaders from neighborhoods, associations, clubs, churches, and businesses who assist the Police Department in seeking out and recruiting police candidates."[96]

Interested community leaders are invited to attend a three-hour class that provides information about:

Federal and State laws
Testing and selection process
Police Academy and Field Training Program

Each community recruiter is provided a DVD that provides information on the topics listed above and a Recruiting Book that outlines and contains samples of the testing process. Each Community Recruiter is linked to a Police Recruiter who will assist with meetings, presentations, and overall recruiting process. They can also participate by being a member on the oral testing

---

[93] Officer Carlos Selvi, Telephone Interview, January 16, 2006.
[94] California Department of Finance, California Current Population Survey Report March 2004, 9.
[95] Captain Kevin Johnson, "The Community Recruiter," The Police Chief, (June 2005) 17. Contact information – email: kjohnson@pd.cityofsacramento.org
[96] Sacramento Police Department, Community Recruiter Program Brochure, (No Publication Date).

process and/or participate in recruitment booths at community events. They are also encouraged to participate in ride-a-longs, so they can better understand the job of a police officer.

Once a candidate is selected, the Community Recruiter responsible for nominating the candidate, meets with the candidate through the Academy and Field Training Programs, participates in the Academy graduation ceremony and is available to be a mentor for the recruit.

After the recruit finishes the Academy, the recruit is assigned to the community that recruited them. This allows the community to see "their" officer at work.

The department has information about the program on its website, including a short video. The video is called, "Episode 15 – Community Recruiter, Diverse Department, the Community and Rapper Cop," and can be found on at this website: http://www.sacpd.org/citybeat.asp.

Captain Dan Schiele, Personnel Division Commander, added this about the program:

> The Community Recruiter Program has improved the department's relationship with the community by opening dialogue with community leaders and helping them understand the police department better. More than 220 community leaders have participated in one of the six classes the department has hosted. We bring in translators when necessary to improve the exchange of information.
>
> The program has given community leaders a better understanding of the recruitment process, including the background phase and the confidentiality required if the candidate fails. In the past, community leaders tended to get upset if we did not provide specifics about why the candidate failed.
>
> While we have not had large numbers of community recruiters recommend candidates, the program is still in the infancy stage. The challenge is keeping the community engaged. We have sent out newsletters and are considering holding periodic meetings. We plan to continue it and make adjustments are necessary.[97]

The Community Recruiter Program takes community leader involvement to another level by investing more time and providing more information to them. The benefits of which are likely to extend beyond recruitment.

MIAMI DADE POLICE DEPARTMENT – SETTING RECRUITMENT GOALS

In the 1980's there was a riot in Miami. It became apparent that the department needed a more diverse police agency. At the time, about 84% were White, 8.5% were African American and 7.5% were Hispanic. The department established goals of increasing the African American representation to 25% and Hispanic to 50%. It also set a goal of increasing the number of female officers from 7.5% to 25%. With this in mind, the department sought a similar mix in each

---

[97] Captain Dan Schiele, Sacramento Police Department, Personal Interview, 10 November 2005.

academy. Over the next 20+ years, the composition of the department has changed substantially. In 2004, the diversity of the department was 32% White, 19.5% African American and 47.5% Hispanic with 23.6% being female officers.[98]

Mr. Edmundo Valdes, Senior Bureau Commander of the Personnel Management Bureau shared these comments.

> It was challenging to build the diversity numbers up, but once we did the base has remained stable as those officers helped to recruit friends and family. Establishing diversity goals for our department was important. We kept those goals before us over the years. Another critical factor was that the top supported those goals and reinforced the message down through the organization.
>
> We were also creative in our marketing to reach out to the segments of the community we were trying to recruit. Preparing fact sheets for all managers who were speaking in the community was helpful. It both reinforced the message, but provided for a consistent message being communicated out to the community over the years. We spend, and have spent, considerable money on advertising. We have been able to support this with money we got from the Florida Public Safety Drug Fund, which comes from seized drug money.
>
> My advice to departments trying to increase diversity is this:
>
> - Be patient…it takes time.
> - Do not be unrealistic in setting goals…it took us 20 years to achieve our diversity goals, but we did not give up.
> - Use your employees…employees are the best recruitment tool, so give them a sense of ownership in the recruitment process.
> - Make sure the command staff is versed in recruitment information especially as it applies to diversity, and that they communicate that message inside and outside the department.
> - A key to our success is that we accept applications every business day and we have an ad every Sunday in the Miami Herald Employment Section. Everyone looks at the Employment Section at some time and we are there every Sunday.[99]

The tenacity of the agency to hold to the goal of improving diversity was rewarding even though it took twenty years. The agency was strategic in making an effort to send a consistent message to the community, which was beneficial. Regular ads in the newspaper reinforced the message each Sunday.

---

[98] Edmundo Valdes, "Targeted Recruitment," A presentation at the 2005 National Summit on Law Enforcement Diversity Recruitment, 11 May 2005, Arlington Virginia.
[99] Edmundo Valdes, Telephone Interview, 19 January 2006.

FAIRFAX COUNTY POLICE DEPARTMENT, VIRGINIA – MENTORING PROGRAM

In the mid-1990's, the Fairfax County Police Department realized the need to develop a mentoring program to "anchor" new officers to the department by pairing them with veteran police officers. In 1996, the program was recognized as a model for other agencies at the 1996 International Chiefs of Police conference in Phoenix, Arizona.

The program is geared for newly hired officers. It begins when a conditional job offer has been made. Highly qualified candidates may participate in a pre-hire program where they work in a variety of temporary or short-term positions until the next academy starts. Whether hired prior to the academy or at the start of the academy, each new hire is assigned a mentor.

The department has about 1,300 sworn officer positions and sends an average of 50-60 recruits to the academy each year. Program participation lasts until they have completed the Field Training Program. By this time, new officers will have developed a network of friends and relationships in the department. The program also includes newly hired lateral officers, but they generally have a more abbreviated program.

Veteran officers apply to be mentors. After their applications are screened, training is provided to the selected officers. The training is a one-day program designed to familiarize mentors with the program standards, expectations, and necessary skills. Mentors provide support, helping new officers learn about the department, transition into the community, understand what to expect in the Academy and Field Training Programs, answer questions and help the recruit to be successful.

Kristine Gubanich, Career Development Coordinator, has headed the Employee Mentoring Program for the past five years. She shared these thoughts about the program:

> The Employee Mentoring Program is designed to help our department attract and retain highly qualified officers. It is hard to say how many officers are here today as a result of the program. However, written program evaluations completed by new officers consistently report that their anxiety and concerns of being new to the department were reduced. Comments often speak to the program giving them a greater appreciation for the department.

> The program has been a benefit to new recruits of various ethnicity, gender and experiences. The program accurately reflects the diversity within our agency.

> I frequently get calls from other agencies about our program. For agencies considering starting a professional mentoring program, I would urge them to consider the following three things:

> 1. Be clear about what you want to accomplish with the program.
> 2. Build the program on a framework that is well-thought out.
> 3. Adopt a long-term perspective about mentoring that focuses on growing and retaining staff over the long haul.

Our strategic plan involves expanding the Employee Mentoring Program to address the needs of officers who are mid or later in their career. While we have a Field Training Program for new supervisors, our goal is to use professional mentoring in order to help them continue to grow their management and leadership skills.

The Employee Mentoring Program is important to our agency…and here to stay. [100]

The Fairfax County Police Department developed the Employee Mentoring Program more than ten years ago and has learned valuable lessons that can help other agencies who are considering such a program.

See also: Personalizing the Recruitment Process by Courting Candidates and Family – Blue Springs Police Department.

NATIONAL LATINO PEACE OFFICER ASSOCIATION/CALIFORNIA – PROPOSED SUEÑOS PROGRAM

The National Latino Peace Officer Association (NLPOA) in California, under the leadership of Chief Steve Fajardo, has developed a proposed strategy for their chapters to help recruit and retain Latinos in law enforcement. This strategy is known as the Sueños Program. There are many NLPOA chapters in California and across the United States. Each chapter has an obligation to help promote Latino representation in law enforcement.

The Sueños Program is comprised of three parts. Each part is designed to further the organization's goals. The first part is the Sueños de Mańana, which encourages the chapter to commit to a minimum of one $500 scholarship to a graduating high school Latino/a who is interested in seeking a career in law enforcement.

The second part is the Sueños de Navidad. This part encourages each chapter to provide food and toys to families in need. While many chapters already do this, commitment to this program helps provide a consistent approach.

The third part is Sueños de Seguridad. The focus is to identify viable candidates, connecting them with an agency, and mentoring them through the selection process.

This three part program is designed to encourage a uniform approach to getting NLPOA chapters involved with building relationships with the community and helping recruit and retain Latinos in law enforcement.

Law enforcement agencies may be able to improve focused recruitment efforts by working with a NLPOA chapter in their area. If one does not exist, an agency may want to consider encouraging Hispanic/Latino officers to start a local chapter.

---

[100] Kristine Gubanich, Telephone Interview, 17 January 2006.

Chief Steven Fajardo, California NLPOA President, proposed this program and shared these comments:

> I see this proposed program as a way for NLPOA in California, and beyond, to help identify and recruit Latinos into the law enforcement profession. Preliminary feedback among California chapters has been positive. Our association should take action on this proposed program in 2006.
>
> The development of this program is a direct result of my involvement on the POST Recruitment and Retention Advisory Council. We discussed many recruitment and retention issues and heard a variety of informed speakers. It was during these discussions that I realized what had to be done and I went back to our chapters and we developed the Sueños Program.
>
> I am very proud of the association I shared with the POST Council and it proves what can be accomplished when public agencies and non profits work together for the common good of California.[101]

While this program is not yet approved, it identifies a potential partnership for agencies interested in recruiting Latinos.

HILLSBOROUGH COUNTY SHERIFF'S OFFICE, FLORIDA – EXPANDING DIVERSITY

The Hillsborough County Sheriff's Office was one of the U.S. Department of Justice, COPS, Hiring in the Spirit of Service grant recipients. The Sheriff's Office used the grant money for the development of a recruitment website, recruitment video, professionally produced commercials, and other recruitment materials.

These efforts were connected to a strategic plan for 2005-2007 that stated the following:

> Goal 5: Provide a work environment that attracts and retains a diverse group of quality applicants, rewards excellence, and promotes leadership through supervisory accountability.

Connected to the strategic plan were several sub-goals that involved providing scholarships to exemplary Law Enforcement candidates, expanding the recruitment strategies to attract highly skilled, service-oriented professionals from diverse backgrounds, implementing the "A Safer Tampa Bay" television recruitment campaign, teaming minority and female deputies to recruit diverse populations, and increasing minority applicants by 5% in the first 180 days.[102]

The department achieved these goals through the following actions:

---

[101] Steven Fajardo, Personal Telephone Interview, 20 January 2006, and Sueños Program PowerPoint Handout, No date.
[102] Sheriff David Gee, Hillsborough County Sheriff's Office, First 180-Day Action Plan, (No publication date) 13.

- Developing a website presence that was easy to locate, navigate and find information that would prompt a response to their recruitment theme: **COURAGE, INTEGRITY, COMPASSION – COULD YOU ANSWER THE CALL?** The website can be located at the following site: http://www.hcso.tampa.fl.us/RandS/index.html.

  The website provides considerable information about the department. One of the most impressive aspects about the site is sixteen testimonials by men and women of various ages, ranks, and ethnicity. Each testimonial has a short statement written by the individual, a picture of them and a short video clip that allows a visitor to watch the officer talk about their position and the opportunities they have had in serving the community or other related messages about courage, integrity, and compassion.

- Implementing the "A Safer Tampa Bay" television campaign. During the first quarter of 2005, the department aired 144 thirty-second commercials. The commercials highlighted the service-oriented theme and included people of diverse demographic backgrounds.
- Twenty-five scholarships were extended to exemplary Law Enforcement candidates. One-fourth of the scholarship recipients were minority candidates. A scholarship provides a $2,000 per month stipend to recruits while attending the Academy.[103]

The website, recruitment materials, and recruitment video are built on the department's theme to create a "branding" that is uniquely theirs, one that supports hiring people committed to serving the community. During the first six months, the department achieved the targeted goals as identified in their strategic plan.

The next section will focus on recruiting women.

RECRUITING WOMEN

As noted previously in this report, women represent about 13% of the officers in California, yet they constitute about half of the workforce. There are a variety of obstacles for women, which were listed earlier in this chapter. Harassment, working alone, danger, and lack of promotional opportunities are some of the obstacles.

The National Center for Women and Policing identified six advantages for recruiting and retaining women, especially in light of community-oriented policing. The six reasons are as follows:

- Female officers are proven to be as competent as their male counterparts.
- Female officers are less likely to use excessive force.

---

[103] Sheriff David Gee, Hillsborough County Sheriff's Office, First 180-Day Action Plan – Follow-Up Report, (June 28, 2005) 9.

- Female officers implement "community-oriented policing."

- More female officers will improve law enforcement's response to violence against women.

- Increasing the presence of female officers reduces problems of sex discrimination and harassment within a law enforcement agency.

- The presence of women can bring about beneficial changes in policy for all officers.[104]

Five agencies will be highlighted for programs they have implemented to improve recruitment of women. Those agencies include the California Highway Patrol, Sacramento Police Department, Sacramento Sheriff's Department, New York State Police, and the Los Angeles Sheriff's Department.

CALIFORNIA HIGHWAY PATROL – FROM A WOMEN'S PERSPECTIVE

The California Highway Patrol (CHP) started actively recruiting women in the mid-1970's and they have not stopped. In fact, the CHP is committed to attracting women to the department. Women have concerns about being a law enforcement officer and the CHP has developed materials that were written from a woman's perspective to address these concerns.

The following are several examples from their website.

- Is being a CHP officer dangerous?

  As with any other law enforcement career, being a CHP officer can be dangerous. Officers provide public safety every day to those who are in need of our assistance whether in a hazardous situation or a controlled environment. In any event, the CHP is committed to their officers by providing the best training available to ensure that the duties of an officer are carried out in the safest way possible, both for the public as well as the officer.

- Someday I would like to start a family. How does that fit in with my career as a CHP officer?

  Many of the women on the CHP have started families of their own, and have found that the Department is very supportive of this personal and very important decision in a woman's life. The CHP allows a six-week maternity leave plan with pay. Benefit options include Non-Industrial Disability Insurance (NDI). Employees in the annual leave program can receive NDI payments at 50 percent of their gross salary or supplement with credits up to 100 percent income replacement.

---

[104] Lonsway, 3.

By state law, you are also allowed up to a one-year leave of absence without losing your present position. The CHP also offers great insurance benefits that will assist with the high cost of medical bills that can be incurred by having a child.

- I have small children and attending the Academy for six months would be an incredible hardship.

   Women who make the very brave decision to attend the Academy while they have children at home do so for the long term security and benefits the CHP provides for all families. There is no denying the fact that for a single parent, attending the Academy presents some almost impossible challenges. However, single parents have done this with careful planning and the support of their family and close friends. Keep in mind; the rewards after you graduate are well worth the initial struggle.[105]

Assistant Chief Bonita Stanton is a 28-year veteran of the California Highway Patrol. She has often been involved with recruitment. She had these insights to share about recruiting women:

   If you see the CHP at a Career Fair or similar event, you will likely see a female recruiter. Statewide, the CHP has more than sixteen full-time recruiters, plus many who recruit on an as-needed basis. Each Division makes diversity a priority when scheduling recruiters to various job fairs and recruitment functions.

   The agency has also made promoting women a priority. CHP has their first female Deputy Chiefs in the following key positions: Administrative Assistant to the Deputy Commissioner, Golden Gate Division Commander of the San Francisco Bay Area, and Department Training Division in Sacramento.

   Look for women who frequent non-traditional places to find women for non-traditional jobs such as law enforcement. Go to the minor league training camps for basketball and baseball. Check out places that sponsor female soccer teams, Olympic sports, and gyms where women are training for body building competitions. Don't forget to use family and friends as resources for recruitment.[106]

Promotional opportunities are important for women considering law enforcement as a profession. Here are figures as of December 2005 on the percentage of women who hold various ranks beginning with Sergeant:

Sergeant	11.2%
Lieutenant	13.3%
Captain	20.5%
Assistant Chief	18.2%
Deputy Chief	18.9%[107]

---

[105] California Highway Patrol Website, Woman's Issues – From A Woman's Perspective, http://www.chp.ca.gov/recruiting/html/q_c.html (Last viewed: 17 January 2006).
[106] Bonnie Stanton, Personal E-Mail Message, 23 January 2006.
[107] Melissa Hoy-Printiss, Personal E-Mail Messages, 26 January 2006 and 30 January 2006.

These are impressive numbers and demonstrate an organizational environment where women have been able to promote up the ranks.
SACRAMENTO POLICE DEPARTMENT – FITNESS CHALLENGE

The Sacramento Police Department, like nearly all agencies, was not getting the number of female candidates they desired. The problem was that female candidates were having difficulty with the physical agility phase of the testing and selection process. Recruitment staff developed a creative program call the "Fitness Challenge" that has yielded big dividends in the department's quest to attract more women.

The event involves showcasing the department for women at a large park, although anyone can attend. Many of the department's female officers work this event. The concept also involves partnering with a fitness facility that helps by doing fitness assessments and providing access to a workout facility.

The women are divided into teams for the competition. Each team is headed by a female officer from the department. The team competes in a variety of events related to the physical agility testing process. Each team receives a score based on the individual team member performance. Each individual also gets a record of her results. The women receive a body-fat testing and are weighed by fitness facility staff.

Over the next twelve weeks, the teams workout together at the fitness facility. The sessions occur at least twice a week. Individuals are encouraged to develop a routine based on their individual goals.

At the end of the twelve weeks, each person can participate in body-fat testing and record their weight. Prizes are awarded to those who obtained the best results. The teams also compete again and winning teams receive awards.

Over the course of the twelve weeks, the team leaders talk about their experience on the department and answer team member's questions. The program builds relationships among the team members.

This experience has prompted many of the participants to apply for a police officer position with the department. As a result, the department has been able to significantly boost the number of female recruits.

Prior to the Fitness Challenge, the department averaged two to three females in each Academy class of thirty. Since starting this program the number has jumped to eight to ten.

Captain Dan Schiele added these comments about the Fitness Challenge:

> We are very pleased with this program. It has been a big success and helped to brand our agency as one that is receptive to the concerns of women and willing to bring them out

into the open. Every woman we hire has either participated in the Fitness Challenge or knows about it.[108]

The department has conducted two Fitness Challenges and the third is scheduled in mid-2006. The recruitment staff is always looking to improve the event and extend the department's outreach to women.

SACRAMENTO SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT – RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION REVIEW TEAM

The National Center for Women and Policing received a grant from the U.S. Department of Justice, Bureau of Justice Assistance, to provide technical assistance to law enforcement agencies by developing and disseminating the self-assessment guide, Recruiting & Retaining Women – A Self-Assessment Guide for Law Enforcement. The guide covers many relevant and helpful topics to assist law enforcement with recruiting and retaining women.[109]

The Sacramento Sheriff's Department used the guide to conduct an extensive self-evaluation of the department. The process of reviewing the agency and making recommendations took one year. The result was recommendations in ten categories, listed below in order of priority. Each category contains varying numbers of recommendations.

> Preventing Sexual and Gender Harassment, Discrimination, and Retaliation
> Recruiting, Job Description, Selection Process
> Recruit Academy and Field Training
> Valuing Civilian Employees
> Family Friendly Policies
> Assignments and Promotions
> Mentoring
> Performance Evaluations
> Awards and Recognition Programs
> Insuring Impartial Internal Affairs and Discipline Systems[110]

The self-assessment found that many of the areas needed relatively minor adjustments, such as revising or writing new policies, which would have little or no financial impact. The area of greatest financial impact was the recruitment process. The report concluded that it was not adequately staffed or funded for a department that size. The committee went on to recommend "radical change" in the selection process.[111]

---

[108] Captain Dan Schiele, Telephone Interview, 18 January 2006.
[109] National Center for Women & Policing, Recruiting & Retaining Women – A Self-Assessment Guide for Law Enforcement, (Available at the National Women & Policing Website: http://www.womenandpolicing.org/sag.asp) Funded by a grant from the Bureau of Justice Assistance, Grant #99-LD-VX-0003.
[110] Tracy L. Foster, Team Report and Recommendations, (Internal Document, 23 April 2002): 5.
[111] Ibid, 6.

Captain Tracy Foster chaired the Recruitment and Retention Assessment Team at the time. She shared these insights about the process and outcomes.

> Doing the self-assessment was a very helpful process in terms of raising awareness of issues pertaining to women in the department. Just recently, the department implemented permanent part-time positions, which was one of our recommendations. Other changes have been made as a result of our work. Those incremental changes over time help make it a better work environment for women.
>
> We did some things right and there are things I would do differently. I would encourage other agencies doing a similar self-assessment to keep in mind the following:
>
> - Get the department's executive staff vested in the project.
> - Exercise care in who is selected to participate on the team. Those who volunteer may have a greater level of buy-in than someone else who is just assigned.
> - Include men on the team…at least half.
> - Go to the managers of selected staff to gain support. Ideally, project staff should have some release time to work on this, rather than just adding it on top of a full plate.
> - Start with goals in mind for what the agency wants to accomplish as a result of doing the assessment.
> - Realize that some people have minimal appreciation for the issues that women face in law enforcement.
> - Select a chairperson who is tactful and has credibility with the agency's leadership.
> - Keep agency executives apprised of progress.
> - Make sure adequate staff and other resources are planned for the project.
> - Include an attorney on the team to address legal issues.
> - When the process is complete, prioritize the recommendations and push for implementation of those that are most important. Too many recommendations can be overwhelming.
> - Identify someone at the executive level to monitor implementation and ensure that the decisions made are in fact implemented.
>
> Our agency has lost a number of women because of the challenges of being a woman in law enforcement and trying to balance the demands of being a wife and mother. If agencies want to recruit and retain women, they must give more consideration to creating a work environment that is conducive for women. A self-assessment is an important first step to identifying issues that need to be addressed.[112]

Taking time to assess an agency's policies relative to recruiting is important to identify potential barriers that could cause women to leave or discourage them from joining the agency. Further, the experience of the Sacramento Sheriff's Department provides useful lessons that would benefit other agencies considering a similar self-assessment.

---

[112] Tracy Foster, Telephone Interview, 20 January 2006.

In an effort to increase the number of women applying for Trooper positions, the New York State Police conducted extensive research to identify positive job attributes for women, as well as negative perceptions about a law enforcement job. These were listed earlier in this chapter.

Research revealed that women who are involved in the following areas might be excellent candidates for law enforcement:

- Home do-it-yourself projects
- Continuing education
- Hunting and fishing
- Computer technology
- Physical fitness and team athletics
- Volunteer work or community service

Another aspect of the research sought to identify factors that influenced existing female officers to join the New York State Police. The factors that were most significant included:

- Opportunity to help others, community service
- Opportunity to perform non-routine and exciting work
- Relative or friend in the agency
- Contact by a Trooper, known or unknown

Armed with the results of the study, the department conducted focus group sessions with sworn minorities and women to help identify recruitment strategies. The Superintendent sent a letter to all department employees emphasizing the importance of recruiting minorities and women. The highest ranking woman executive wrote a letter to all sworn women asking them to help with recruitment. Finally, the Deputy Superintendent, an African-American, urged minority sworn officers to help recruit other minorities.

Recruitment materials were developed using the research information. Ads targeting women addressed financial information, promotional opportunities, making a social contribution, women officers with their families, family friendly policies, defensive tactic training, and team work.

A variety of recruitment strategies were employed, including stories in the news, radio talk shows, press releases, featured newspaper articles, website advertising, banners along highways, posters, career fairs and more. Posters were put in hair salons, malls, shopping centers, movie theaters, buses, and other locations frequented by women. Other unique locations included running recruitment videos on the large outdoor screens on the Panasonic video at Times Square and Macy's.

The results increased the number of women who tested in 2004 by 77% over 2001. A total of 3,500 women tested in 2004. One of the lessons learned from this process was that

"…strategies will require time to have an impact; especially those that focus on changing perceptions."[113]

Lieutenant Bryon Christman, Human Resource Manager, shared these insights:

> …we are looking to enhance our website by adding some video content and improving the overall look. At this point, I envision a section aimed at better addressing women's concerns with respect to this type of occupation. Below are some bullet points pertaining to the recruitment of women.
>
> 1. Identify job characteristics that are important to women in your area. Our information may be able to be generalized, but consider conducting a survey of at least the women who decided to join your agency.
>
> 2. Assess whether your agency possesses any of those job characteristics that are important to women.
>
> 3. Focus recruitment strategies on educating the public with respect to the desired job characteristics that exist in your agency. Making the public aware of what the job is really like and what it has to offer is paramount. There is far too much in the media that portrays a much different picture. It will take a continuous effort to correct misperceptions.
>
> 4. Identify the concerns women have about considering a career with your agency.
>
> 5. Assess whether your agency addresses any or all of those concerns through policies, training or other programs. If the agency does, include that information in your strategies for ameliorating any negative perceptions that may not be accurate reflections of the occupational condition.
>
> 6. If your agency does not address any of the concerns women have, evaluate whether you can adjust or implement policies or training that would address those concerns, and focus strategies on getting that information to the public.
>
> 7. Perceptions are difficult to change. Education takes time. Give the strategies time to widely impact the public.
>
> I have also been thinking more about the impact "significant others" have on career choices, especially parents with respect to younger applicants. I think we need to expend some energy educating parents about the misperceptions of the job with the hope that their influence on a young person who may express an interest in a career in law enforcement will be positive. I am not sure how that will look yet, but imagine that it will add some different venues to our list of strategies.[114]

---

[113] Christman.
[114] Bryon Christman, Personal E-mail, 24 January 2006.

New York State Police have put significant effort into recruiting women and those efforts have yielded impressive results.

LOS ANGELES SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT – CONDITIONS OF RESTORATION PROGRAM

The Los Angeles Sheriff's Department values helping candidates be successful in the selection process (See: Personalizing the Recruitment Process by Courting Candidates and Family – Los Angeles Sheriff's Department – You Can Do It Seminars) and keeping recruits who have difficulty with the Academy. Good candidates are hard to find, especially those who complete the testing process and are hired. Holding on to good candidates is a priority for the department.

When a recruit fails the Academy due to problems in a particular area and staff feel that the potential exists to restore the individual, the Los Angeles Sheriff's Department may offer the recruit another chance. They have a unique program where they will develop a contract with a recruit. If the recruit fulfills his/her portion of the contract, the department will reinstate the recruit in the next available Academy slot.

The following is an example of how the program operates. If a recruit is unable to keep up with the physical demands of the Academy, the department may articulate conditions of restoration. If the recruit meets those conditions, then the department can offer the recruit a slot in an upcoming Academy. In this example, the recruit would need to improve his/her physical condition by participating in a physical fitness program, perhaps at a nearby community college. When the recruit completes the class, he/she provides the necessary paperwork and demonstrates the ability to meet a minimum physical fitness standard. If able to do this, the department will reinstate the recruit.

Conditions of restoration have been done for academic, firearms, and physical conditioning. The department has not lowered standards, but they do recognize that some people, given an opportunity to rectify conditions, can be successful. This perspective has paid dividends for the department by being able to restore recruits, rather than just counting them as another casualty.

Captain Ted Siara added these insights about the process:

> The restoration process allows former recruits who are motivated and are truly seeking a career in law enforcement another opportunity to complete academy training. Although less than ten percent of separated recruits fulfill their restoration requirements and re-enter academy training, their success rate is extremely high.

> This program has been most beneficial to women. Even with all the prep information provided to applicants, many women do not realize the difficulty that academy training truly is. More women than men have chosen to participate in the program, and they have

been successful. We believe this program has proven to be a significant benefit to the department.[115]

Each of the examples presented in this chapter represent agencies who have taken progressive steps to attract candidates and retain staff representing important and under-represented segments of the community. Agencies that are able to approach diversity recruitment using a holistic approach with a philosophy that combines these factors, appear to be having the greatest success in recruiting under-represented segments of the community. Such an approach takes patience, sincerity, a willingness to listen, tenacity, and courageous leadership.

The next chapter will focus on retention of peace officers.

<div style="border:1px solid black;">

Summary of Key Points

The following is a summary of the key points identified in this chapter.

- Take time to better understand the perspectives of those who are under-represented through open dialogue and/or conducting research.
- Ensure that there is consistency in the message communicated by agency actions in the community and recruitment messages.
- Align agency operations and culture to create an inviting work environment for minorities and women.
- Craft creative, focused outreach strategies that will help get the recruitment message to those under-represented segments of the community.
- Partner with community leaders to identify and recruit candidates.
- Mentoring candidates/recruits during the selection process, academy, and field training can be effective to both attract and retain a diverse workforce.
- View diversity recruitment from a holistic perspective in terms of being related to community relations, rather than an isolated, independent action.

</div>

---

[115] Ted Siara, Telephone Interview and Personal E-mail, 17-18 January 2006.

CHAPTER 4

RETENTION OF PEACE OFFICERS

The retention of existing staff is important for an agency for a variety of reasons. Here are just a few:

- Existing staff are a known quantity
- Investment in training
- Relationships exist inside and outside the agency
- Knowledge of agency and how it operates, including culture
- Experience

When an officer leaves an agency these qualities are lost. When a new officer is hired, each of these qualities has to be developed in that individual. Even when hiring a lateral officer, some of these attributes will need to be developed and may take considerable time.

As competition for qualified workers intensifies, it will be more difficult to find suitable replacements. This means that remaining staff will have to carry the workload for longer periods of time until replacements are found and trained. This adds to organizational stress making it more difficult to implement change and keep up with less urgent, though important tasks like planning, training, problem solving with the community, and team building.

In this section, the following topics are addressed:

- Retention statistics, such as current figures as to how many officers leave one agency for another and the cost of replacing an officer
- Subject Matter Expert Focus Group Input
- Symposium 2001 Survey
- Best Practices
- Creating Worker Friendly Policies
- Improving Supervision and Management
- Improving Organizational Communication to Enhance Retention
- Developing Strategies for Retaining Staff Longer and Keeping Retirees Engaged
- Developing a Succession Plan

Understanding information and concepts presented in this section can help an agency improve retention. By improving retention, the problem of recruitment is also reduced. Fewer people will need to be hired. Further, employees who are content and satisfied with the organization are a powerful ally to attract qualified candidates.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

How big is the retention issue? Is it bigger today than ten or twenty years ago? The next section will provide retention statistics to answer these questions.

RETENTION STATISTICS

Anecdotally, there are comments in the literature and professional circles about officers increasingly leaving one agency to work in another. Are younger officers more likely to switch agencies than officers who started ten or twenty years ago? There is little in the literature with specific information on this debate.

In the Symposium 2001 Survey, previously referenced in the Recruitment Chapter, 72% responded that retention was still a problem and 54% responded that it is a bigger problem than four years ago.

As part of the registration process for the 2005 Recruitment and Retention Symposium, most participants completed an on-line survey. A copy of the survey can be found in Appendix 7. One hundred forty-five responded to the survey. Seven questions were asked relating to retention. The results are recorded in table 35.

Half of the respondents agreed that retention is a problem. Just over half, 54%, have provided leadership training for supervisors to improve interpersonal communication. However, only a small number, 29%, have taken definitive steps to address retention and fewer yet, 10%, have developed a written plan to address the problem.

The percentages are low for seeking employees input, 29%, and developing plans to encourage employees to delay retirement or stay engaged after retirement, 22%. Only 21% agreed that the agency's efforts have improved retention.

TABLE 35. 2005 RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION SURVEY RESULTS FOR RETENTION[116]

Statement	Agree		No Opinion		Disagree	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
1. Retention is a problem for our agency.	74	50	18	12	55	37
2. Our agency has sought employee input using focus groups, employee surveys or similar approach.	42	29	28	19	76	52
3. We have taken definitive steps to address retention issues.	42	29	40	27	65	44
4. We have developed a written plan outlining steps to improve retention.	15	10	33	23	98	67

---

[116] 2005 Recruitment and Retention Symposium Survey, Items 9-15

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

Table 35, Continued						
5. We have provided leadership training to supervisors to improve how they relate with their respective staffs.	78	54	25	17	42	29
6. We have developed ways to encourage staff to delay retirement and/or keep them engaged after retirement through volunteer or part-time opportunities.	32	22	39	27	75	51
7. The changes we have made have improved retention.	31	21	65	45	49	34

The last item of the survey asked respondents to identify actions respective agencies took to improve retention in the past two years. Improvement in working conditions was mentioned most often, followed by addressing pay issues. Examples of other responses included: Engaging more retirees to do some annuitant work for the agency, providing supervisory and leadership training and promotional opportunities. Only two agencies referenced developing a retention plan.

In order to get a broader perspective on retention, the POST peace officer database was queried for the following information:

- By year, starting with 1985 and ending with 2005, for those full-time peace officers who are currently employed, provide the number of officers who have made a change from one agency to another agency, but count only those who have moved to another full-time peace officer position.
- Considering the total number of full-time peace officers (in California), how many of these officers have been employed with one or more agencies?

The current number of full-time peace officers in the POST database as of December 31, 2005 totaled 84,443; in 1985, the total was 63,694.

Table 36 reflects the results of the first query listed above. Column two of table 36 reflects the number of peace officers who transferred from one agency to another in that calendar year. Column three reflects the total number of full-time peace officers in POST agencies for the corresponding calendar year. The number of full-time peace officers who left one law enforcement agency for full-time employment with another ranged from a low of 1,248 in 1992 to a high of 2,585 in 2000. This low and high rate may well have coincided with the local budget crunch in 1991-1992 and the Federal COPS Hiring Program to put 100,000 more peace officers on patrol nationally in the late 1990's and early 2000's.

Column 4 of table 36 reflects the percent of peace officers transferring to another law enforcement agency in that respective year. For example, in 1985 there were 63,694 peace officers and a total of 1,380 transferred to another agency. Hence, 1.7% of the officers transferred to one agency to another that year.

The highest percentage, 4.7%, of officers transferring from one agency to another occurred in 1997. Since 1987, the percentage of officers transferring has not dipped below 3.1%. Between 1993 and 2001, the percent only dropped below 4.0% one time. From 2002-2005, the percent

remained in the low three percent range. This is the lowest three consecutive years since 1985-1987.

TABLE 36. NUMBER OF PEACE OFFICERS TRANSFERING TO ANOTHER AGENCY[117]

Year	Number Transferring to Another Agency	Total Officer in Database that Yr.	Percent Transferring
1985	1380	63,694	1.7%
1986	1425	65,412	2.2%
1987	1545	67,230	2.9%
1988	1624	69,581	3.3%
1989	1698	72,907	3.6%
1990	1891	75,741	4.0%
1991	1409	75,963	3.5%
1992	1248	75,170	3.5%
1993	2012	74,378	3.8%
1994	1609	75,128	4.1%
1995	1951	77,899	4.4%
1996	1709	79,332	3.9%
1997	2395	80,965	4.5%
1998	1881	81,296	3.8%
1999	2108	82,638	4.0%
2000	2585	84,408	4.3%
2001	2266	85,009	3.9%
2002	2558	86,489	3.7%
2003	2040	85,421	3.1%
2004	2011	84,013	3.0%
2005	2142	84,443	3.2%

The next area queried was to determine the number of changes officers have made and at what point in terms of years of service the transfer occurred. Table 37 reflects the results of this query. The query searched the employment records of peace officers who were employed as of December 31, 2005. This criterion resulted in drawing data from 78,050 peace officers.

More than 60,000 of these officers have only worked for one law enforcement agency. Nearly 14,000, or 17.7 percent, have worked for two law enforcement agencies. A total of 2,898 officers have been employed by three agencies, 599 have been employed by four law enforcement agencies and 163 have been employed by more than four agencies. A total of

---

[117] Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training, Percentage of Full-Time Peace Officers Transferring Within Year, 6 February 2006.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

17,493 currently employed peace officers, or 22.4 percent, have worked for more than one law enforcement agency.

Nearly one in four officers transitioned from one law enforcement agency to another at least once. Unfortunately, information as to why the officers made the transition is not available.

TABLE 37. NUMBER OF FULL-TIME PEACE OFFICERS WHO
HAVE WORKED IN ONE OR MORE LAW ENFORCEMENT
AGENCIES[118]

No. of Agencies Employed By	No. of Officers	Percent of Total
Only One	60,557	77.6%
Two	13,833	17.7%
Three	2,898	3.7%
Four	599	.8%
More than Four	163	.2%
Total	78,050	100%

Table 38 reflects at what point in the officer's career the transition occurred.[119] For example, 25% of the officers who left one agency for another made the transition to a second agency by 1.5 years of service with the first agency. Fifty percent made that transition by 3.8 years of service and 75% had made that transition by 8.5 years.

After transitioning into the second agency, 25% left for a third agency within 1.5 years. Fifty percent of those who left for a third agency did so by 4.2 years and 75% had made the transition by 9.3 years.

Of those who transitioned to a forth agency, 25% left the third agency within 1.3 years. Fifty percent made the switch within 3.2 years and 75% hit that mark in 7 years.

On the average, this information indicates that one-quarter of the officers left within 1.5 years and that 50% had left within slightly more than four years. Something did not meet the officer's expectations, which resulted in the transition. For some, this time was very short and for half of the officers it was approximately four years.

---

[118] Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training, Full-Time Sworn Personnel Employed on 12/31/05 – Employment History, Report No. ah_394a, 25 January 2006.
[119] Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training, Officer Transfer Report, 27 January 2006.

TABLE 38. NUMBER OF YEARS SPENT AT A LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCY PRIOR
TO TRANSITIONING INTO ANOTHER AGENCY

No. of Agency Transfers	Years on agency 25%	Years on agency 50%	Years on agency 75%
First	1.5	3.8	8.5
Second	1.5	4.2	9.3
Third	1.3	3.2	7.0

As competition for officers increases, will the number of officers who switch agencies increase?
While it may be difficult to say for sure, based on information about younger generations,
coupled with more potential opportunities, agencies should consider this a very real potential
threat. As such, developing strategies to retain staff should be a strategic consideration.

COST OF NOT RETAINING AN OFFICER

The cost of not retaining an officer can be misleading. There are many factors to take into
consideration in determining what those costs include. Here are some of the costs, both direct
and indirect:

Direct:
Recruitment and selection costs invested in hiring the officer who leaves
Training invested in the officer
Academy
Field
Annual
Specialized
Administrative costs to process the officer's separation
Disbursement of benefits to separating officer
Lost productivity
Overtime associated with increased workload for remaining staff
Recruitment and selection cost of replacement
Advertising
Recruitment staff & activities
Testing costs (interview, background, physical agility, CVSA, and medical
& psychological screening)
Administrative cost of processing a new employee
Training for replacement

Indirect:
Loss of morale in agency
Damage to agency reputation if the issue is wide-spread
Loss of intellectual capital and experience base
Loss of relationships with staff and constituents

One source put the cost of replacing an employee at 25 to 200 percent of the employee's annual compensation.[120] An employee who has been on the job several years may have an annual salary of $60,000 or more, plus benefits. Just considering the salary, the cost of replacing the individual could range from a low of $15,000 to a high of $120,000.

Consider one agency that recruits, screens, and then hires the candidate. After hiring, the officer is sent through a six-month academy. Upon graduation, the officer begins a three to four month Field Training Program. Upon successful completion of Field Training, the officer is transferred to a correctional facility where the officer may spend another three months in a Jail Training Program. At this point, a year has passed. The agency has invested a year's worth of salary, academy training costs, and six months of on-the-job training that includes paying training officers a five percent incentive. Another period of time will pass before the officer is familiar with the job and fully functioning.

During the time this individual is in training, other officers are handling the workload intended for this officer. There may be overtime or extra-help costs associated with handling this workload, increased stress, a decline in morale over time and grievances filed. If work is not done, there may be other ramifications.

In this scenario, it is very expensive to replace this individual and considerable time is necessary to train a replacement. Many agencies desire to hire individuals who have completed a non-affiliate academy. This certainly reduces the expense, but there is still considerable time and expense invested that will be lost if the officer leaves the agency.

Some may argue that an agency will always have retention costs. This certainly is the case, especially with respect to retirements. However, for each officer that leaves after two to five years, the replacement cost must be born again rather than after twenty or more years when that officer will retire from the profession. If, for example, the replacement cost is $50,000 and one position turns over every two years, then the agency would spend $250,000 in ten years. Add to this the cost of other positions that must be filled and the total replacement cost becomes extremely high.

Agencies are encouraged to identify the cost of losing an officer and hiring a replacement. Once an agency understands the actual cost, executives may want to invest time and energy in developing a retention plan to maximize the agency's most valuable resource, rather than just counting replacement costs as the price of doing business.

WHEN DO OFFICERS LEAVE?

A study by the COPS Office found that in small agencies retention was a significant problem where two-thirds of departing officers had served for fewer than five years. Only twenty-one

---

[120]American Management Association, Six Truths about Employee Turnover, http://www.amanet.org/books/catalog/0814405975_s.htm (Last visited 16 August 2005) article adapted from F. Leigh Branham, Keeping The People Who Keep You in Business (AMACOM; October 2000).

percent left after fifteen years or longer.[121] In larger agencies (serving populations in excess of 50,000) a third of the officers had served for fewer than five years when they left. However, forty-six percent stayed fifteen years or longer.[122]

The study also found that the rate of attrition was about seven percent in small agencies and five percent in large agencies.[123] Table 39 lists sources of attrition. About forty-five percent of those who left small agencies and twenty-four percent who left large agencies continued to work in law enforcement.[124]

TABLE 39. SOURCES OF OFFICER ATTRITIAN: PERCENTAGES OF OFFICERS LEAVING UNDER SELECTED CIRCUMSTANCES[125]

Agency Size	Retirement	Disability/Medical	Dismissal	Other
Small	20%	6%	15%	59%
Large	49%	5%	9%	36%

The POST Peace Officer Database was queried to determine how many officers leave after having become full-time peace officers. Not included in these numbers are officers who have left one agency, but accepted employment at a later date as a peace officer in another agency. Further, this reflects data on peace officers who were employed in 1979 or later when POST began tracking employment data. Included in these numbers are officers who may have left for any one of a variety of reasons, including disability and normal retirement.

During this more than twenty year span, 5,140 peace officers left law enforcement after less than one year of service as shown in table 40.[126] After the first year, the number significantly improves. There were 4,877 officers who left between one and three years of service. During this period, an average of 1,626 officers left per year of service. During years four to six, the number drops slightly to an average of 1,572 officers. The number increases slightly during years seven through ten. Fewer officers leave between years eleven through fifteen.

[121] U.S. Department of Justice, Office of Justice Programs, Hiring and Keeping Police Officers, http://www.ncjrs.org/pdffiles1/nij/202289.pdf, (Last viewed, 31 January 2006) 48.
[122] Ibid.
[123] Ibid., 46.
[124] Ibid.
[125] Ibid., 47 (Reprinted from this source)
[126] Commission of Peace Officer Standards and Training, Grand Total of Full-Time Peace Officers Who Have Terminated Employment as a Peace Officer and Have Not Returned to Full-Time Peace Officer Status – All Agencies, May 6, 2005.

TABLE 40. FULL-TIME PEACE OFFICERS WHO HAVE TERMINATED EMPLOYMENT AS A PEACE OFFICER AND HAVE NOT RETURNED TO FULL-TIME PEACE OFFICER STATUS

Employment Period Prior to Termination	Number	Average Per Year
Less than 1 year	5140	-
1 - 3 years	4877	1626
4-6 years	4715	1572
7-10 years	6325	1581
11-15 years	7244	1449
16 or more years	22,987	-

The last category grouped officers who left after sixteen years of service, including those who retired after 1979. An annual number was not calculated for this group.

After the first year, the average annual number of officers who leave appears to remain fairly stable ranging from 1,626 to a low of 1,449. Combined, the average number of officers leaving per year after one year through fifteen years of service is 1,544. Considering there are approximately 78,192 peace officers in California, the attrition rate of officers who leave the profession of sworn officers is approximately 1.975 percent annually.[127]

REASONS CONTRIBUTING TO OFFICERS LEAVING

A report on employee retention published in 2002 by the State of New York, included information from employee surveys. Among the questions asked were questions about what would make employees think about leaving and provide opinions as to why co-workers left.[128] Below are the reasons given for what made employees think about leaving and opinions about why co-workers left.

- Reasons that made employees think about leaving:
    o Low salaries
    o Too much time between tests
    o Career mobility issues
    o Takes too long to earn a promotion
    o "Too much bureaucracy that prevents me from getting the job done."

- Opinions why co-workers left:
    o Money/Salary issues
    o Lack of career mobility

---

[127] Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training, Current Employed Personnel-Agency Type/Agency/Appointment Status Summary, (April 4, 2005), 14.
[128] New York State Department of Civil Service and the New York State Governor's Office of Employee Relations, Our Work Force Matters – A Guide to Work Force and Succession Planning for New York State Agencies, (New York, 2001), 7.

- Leaving for more money and greater incentives, such as weekends off for nurses
- Too much bureaucracy – creativity of individual was stifled.

An on-line study by Executive Update, found that respondents cited poor management and lack of career development as the top two reasons they left employers. Interestingly, respondents felt other employees left for a better salary. One might assume that what employees cited as reasons for leaving may, in fact, be different for why they actually left. While salary is important, older workers put challenging work ahead of salary and benefits. Younger workers with less than five years experience put quality of interpersonal relationships and flexible hours ahead of compensation. Salary alone was not adequate to keep employees long-term.[129]

In the article, Five Principle Reasons People Change Jobs, the following reasons are cited:

- *It doesn't feel good around here*…the culture is the primary issue, although for others it was the company's reputation or physical conditions.
- *They wouldn't miss me if I were gone*…the issue is that they do not feel valued or important.
- *I don't get the support I need to get my job done*…frustration over red tape, bureaucracy, or incompetent supervisors or co-workers push people out the door.
- *There's no opportunity for advancement*…the issue is primarily about lacking learning opportunities that will hone their skills and give them new ones.
- *Compensation is the last reason people most leave*…workers want fair compensation, but it is not the most important thing to them. The others listed above, if strong, constitute an important retention factor.[130]

In the book, The 7 Reasons Employees Leave, the author says that if four fundamental human needs are not met employees will begin to disengage. Some will leave and some will remain, although disengaged. The four fundamental needs focus on trust, hope, sense of worth, and feeling competent. [131]

The reasons employees leave are linked to these needs not being met. The reasons employees leave are largely related to those already mentioned: unmet job expectations, poor job fit, lack of coaching and feedback on performance, lack of professional development and promotional opportunities, not feeling valued or recognized, workplace stress due to job demands and work-life balance conflict, and lack of trust and belief in senior leadership.[132]

Based on his experience in conducting exit interviews with employees who left different companies, Mr. Branham found that an over-whelming number of exits were voluntary. Further,

---

[129] Executive Update, Straight Talk, Issue – July 2001, http://www.centeronline.org/knowledge/article.cfm?ID=555&ContentProfileID=122318&Action=searching (Last viewed: 4 January 2006).
[130] Retention Connection, Five Principle Reasons People Change Jobs, Retention Connection Website: www.hermangroup.com/retentionconnection/retention_5reasons.html (Last viewed: 21 March 2005).
[131] Leigh Branham, The 7 Hidden Reasons Employees Leave, (New York: American Management Association, 2005), 19.
[132] Ibid, 29.

a significant number of the reasons people left could have been controlled or addressed by the employee's immediate supervisor or manager.[133]

While salary and benefits are not directly within the control of agency leadership, efforts can be made to support increases for staff. The good news, however, is that many of the reasons employees leave are tied to factors within leadership control, such as:

- Career enhancement opportunities
- Mentoring and coaching
- Rewards and recognition
- Agency bureaucracy
- Challenging work
- Building trust
- Valuing employees
- Reducing organizational stress
- Organizational communication

In fact, these factors would contribute greatly in developing a culture of retention. Such a culture is the result of taking deliberate proactive steps over time to increase job satisfaction and will contribute to a reduction in turnover.[134]

The flip side to this discussion is, what are the factors that would keep an employee in an organization? A survey of 8,000 people in 35 industries asked respondents what was keeping them on the job. Here is what they felt was important:

- Exciting work and challenge
- Career growth, learning and development
- Fair pay and benefits
- Relationships with great people
- Supportive management, a great boss
- Pride in the organization, its mission and its product
- Great work environment or culture
- Being recognized, valued, and respected
- Meaningful work, making a difference
- Autonomy[135]

These factors are consistent with other information in this report. People want to feel good about the work they do and the people they work with and for. They want to feel good about the organization, the culture, and receive recognition for their contribution. A work environment that offers these qualities does not happen by chance. It happens as a result of leadership who

---

[133] Ibid, 27.
[134] E. Stewart Hickman, "Hiring and Retaining Top-Performing Employees," American Society for Training and Development – Info-Line, (November 2000), 9.
[135] Beverly Kaye and Sharon Jordan-Evans, "Retention in Tough Times, Training and Development, (January 2002), 34.

has taken the time to plan and implement policies and practices aimed at improving the quality of life in an organization.

The next section will address input provided by subject matter experts relative to retention.

SUBJECT MATTER EXPERT – FOCUS GROUP INPUT

As previously mentioned, a cadre of subject matter experts (SMEs) were invited to participate in one of three focus groups. A list of participating subject matter experts is included in Appendix 2. These SME's shared their thoughts relative to best practices in retention. Based on the input provided by the three focus groups, the following themes emerged.

1. Develop Effective Supervisors/Managers – This clearly received the most attention among all three focus groups relative to retention. Improving skills in supervision, management, and leadership was strongly recommended. Consistently practicing such skills as management by walking around, employing a coaching model with employees, recognizing good performance – both small and big accomplishments, being personable, treating people with dignity and respect, avoiding micro-management, helping people see their value to the organization, and employing good listening skills were viewed as important. Supervisors and managers could benefit significantly by using "360 degree feedback" to get a perspective of how others view them and then working to improve how they interact with others.

2. Develop An Employee Friendly Culture and Policies – Employees want to feel that the organization is concerned for them and their families. Many employees desire more balance between their personal and work lives. Flexible schedules, being treated with dignity and respect, having the opportunity to participate in employee surveys with an expectation that the feedback will be acted upon, developing a sense of camaraderie/team building, feeling informed, having clear performance expectations (especially for new employees), receiving feedback from both the supervisor and constituents, and fair promotional processes were suggested. Employees who feel like an organization cares about them are more likely to be committed, stay with the organization and recruit others to the organization.

3. Develop a Retention Plan – Agencies would benefit from developing a plan to retain employees as long as possible. Such a plan would include employee feedback about what they do and do not like about the agency, what would keep them working longer, and why they decide to leave. Another consideration is looking for ways to keep people and their intellectual capital longer by providing options such as part-time positions, special projects, telecommuting, and volunteer opportunities to keep them working in some capacity. The military actually has a Retention Specialist position that is responsible for contacting people prior to the end of their enlistment period to discuss how that person might be retained longer. Other suggestions included looking for ways to free officers from mundane tasks by using temporary help or other alternatives, succession planning to identify and groom staff for promotion, and using senior staff to mentor other people who may eventually replace them.

4. <u>Engage Employees</u> – A number of suggestions focused on looking for ways to engage employees to create a sense of ownership and demonstrate their value to the organization both as an important stakeholder, and a source of expertise. This may be accomplished by soliciting their input on a wide spectrum of agency matters via focus groups, committees, or special project teams.   Sincere efforts to embrace employee input were viewed as critical to keeping employees engaged and supportive of leadership.

5. <u>Improve Communication</u> – Employees want to feel included. Up-to-date information, especially on high profile topics, should be provided to the staff. People are interested in newsy types of information that are often found in agency newsletters. There was recognition that communication involves both "telling" and "listening." It was also suggested that communication be proactive in dealing with potentially negative issues in a positive manner where possible.

6. <u>Develop Staff</u> – Providing multiple opportunities for career growth was strongly recommended. While some people may promote, many others will not. Agencies should look for ways to allow professional growth to keep employees engaged, to have a broader perspective of how the agency operates, create movement, and enhance skills. One retention study concluded that employees want challenging work and a rational/enriched work environment (rational meaning that employees recognize what behavior you want). One suggestion was that employees be afforded opportunities to fill in behind other employees in specialized areas for up to six months in order to learn more about that area, develop an appreciation for how his/her regular assignment could better interface with the specialized area, and create a desire to continue professional growth.

7. <u>Improve Operations</u> – Efforts to improve operations can result in a better work environment and a feeling of satisfaction for employees who help make the changes. Benchmarking best practices help employees see other ways to doing business and engage them in the process of improving operations. One suggestion for improving operations was through a peer review where peers from another agency come in and look at your operation, interview your staff and make recommendations. The agency can then take steps to enhance operations. Another aspect of this process is considering what policies and practices are negotiable and which are not. Traditional ways of doing things are not necessarily required nor the best to retain today's workers.

8. <u>Address Cost of Housing Issue</u> – In many communities around California, the cost of housing is beyond the means of peace officers who work in those areas. This can contribute to officers leaving one agency for employment at another closer to where they live. Employees who do not live in the community tend to be less vested than those who do. Several programs were mentioned as possible options. One of those was the Coastal Housing Partnership serving the Santa Barbara and Ventura areas. This program focuses on assisting both private and public employees in finding affordable housing.

Previously, the 2001 Symposium Survey was mentioned. Item 16 of the survey asked respondents to write their opinions regarding what has worked best in terms of recruitment and retention. A copy of the survey is located in Appendix 5.

Two categories of responses addressed most of the comments related to retention. The first category was competitive pay, good benefits and a "3@50" retirement. The second category pertained to working conditions. Within this category, expanding specialized assignments and the "3-12" shift schedules were mentioned most often. Examples of other responses included mentoring, commute vehicles, and off-set schedules to avoid peak commute times.

Respondents were also asked what would most help improve recruitment and retention. Increased pay and benefits, housing assistance, and more lateral and upward opportunities were mentioned most often.

This section has provided insights into many aspects of retention. Identifying retention issues present in a particular agency and taking steps to address the issues would help agencies improve retention.

The next section will provide information about best practices.

Summary of Key Points

The following is a summary of the key points identified in this chapter.

- Considering currently employed full-time peace officers, employed as of December 31, 2005, 22.4% have worked for more than one agency and some for more than four agencies.
- The cost of replacing an officer is considerable, ranging up to 200% of an employee's salary. Unnecessary attrition is a drain on agency resources.
- A national study on the retention of peace officers found that two-thirds of departing officers in small agencies had served fewer than five years. In large agencies, one-third of departing officers left in fewer than five years.
- The same study found that attrition due to retirement in small agencies accounted for 20% of the officers and 49% in large agencies. Moreover, 45% of those who left small agencies and 24% of those who left large agencies continued to work in law enforcement.
- A study of California peace officers found that between 1979 and May 2005, more than 5,100 officers left with less than one year on the job and did not return to a full-time peace officer position. Departures that occurred between years one and three averaged 1,626 per year. The lowest number occurred between years eleven and fifteen when the average number of peace officers who left each year was 1,449.
- Two sources assert that employees largely leave as a result of a poor supervisor/manager

or for reasons that were under the control of the immediate manager or could have been addressed by that person. While salary is an issue, most sources agree that money is not at the top of the list of why employees leave. Poor management, lack of career development, and lack of challenging work were more likely to contribute to an employee leaving.

- Subject matter experts agreed that the most significant factor in retention is an employee's relationship with the immediate supervisor or manager. Training supervisors and managers in people skills, such as communication skills, using positive reinforcement, treating people with dignity and respect, and coaching skills were strongly encouraged.
- Employees who feel like an organization cares about them are more likely to be committed, stay with the organization, and recruit others to the organization.
- Retention does not happen by chance. Developing and implementing a retention plan is strongly advised. Such a plan starts by identifying factors that employees like and dislike about the organization, as well as what would encourage employees to stay longer.
- Look for strategies to actively engage employees, stimulating a sense of ownership and valuing employee expertise and perspectives.
- Improve organizational communication to ensure that employees feel both informed and listened to.
- Look for ways to develop employees through training and opportunities; to work in different areas of the organization, to enhance skills, and give them a broader perspective of the organization in its entirety.
- Strive to improve operations to create a better work environment by benchmarking best practices and engaging employees to make positive changes.
- Look for creative ways or programs to help employees deal with the high cost of housing.
- Long commutes can contribute to attrition and employees being less vested in the community.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

Page intentionally left blank

PART TWO

BEST PRACTICES

The purpose of Part Two is to present twelve best practices. These best practices were an outgrowth of the suggestions offered by subject matter experts. The 2005 Recruitment and Retention Symposium was developed using a problem-based learning format built around the best practices…each constituting a separate track.

Each track consisted of up to twenty working professionals, including one or more members of the Recruitment and Retention Advisory Council, and a subject matter expert. Symposium participants were predominately involved with law enforcement recruitment in police and sheriff's agencies. However, about twenty percent were human resource professionals from participating jurisdictions.

The information presented in Part Two was heavily influenced by participants in the symposium. Part of the problem-based learning process included developing an action plan for the conference problem and assigned sub-problem. The resulting plans became the basis for each best practice presented in the report, supplemented by other pertinent information to assist law enforcement agencies in building a more successful recruitment program.

The twelve best practices include:

> Developing a Recruitment Strategic Plan
> Developing an Advertising Plan
> Improving the Selection Process
> Developing External Partnerships to Improve Diversity Recruitment
> Personalizing the Recruitment Process by Courting Candidates and Family
> Selecting the Right Staff as Recruiters and Training Them
> Developing an Employee Referral Program
> Creating Worker Friendly Policies
> Improving Supervision and Management
> Improving Organizational Communication to Enhance Retention
> Developing Strategies for Retaining Staff Longer and Keeping Retirees Engaged
> Developing a Succession Plan

These practices constitute a framework, largely internal to the agency, which will provide the right information for the right people to more effectively recruit the right candidates to meet the human capital needs for agencies today and in the future, especially in the face of increasing competition for qualified candidates.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

This page has been left blank intentionally.

CHAPTER 5

DEVELOPING A RECRUITMENT STRATEGIC PLAN

The crux of success in recruitment and retention is planning. In fact, in the report, <u>Where the Jobs Are: The Continued Growth of Federal Job Opportunities</u>, the authors sum it up with these words, "Planning, Planning, Planning."[136] The importance of this report is that it underscores concern about recruitment at the federal level to prepare for talent shortages that "will crimp important government initiatives."[137] The report continues with these recommendations:

1. Emphasize aggressive follow-up to workforce planning
2. Promote workforce planning at all levels within federal government and departments.
3. Require agencies to develop and annually update recruitment plans.
4. Make federal workforce data and projections consistent with private sector measurements.
5. Create a central resource center to share proven workforce planning models and recruitment strategies.
6. Publish an annual summary of projected federal hiring needs.
7. Fund departmental and government-wide recruitment initiatives.
8. Encourage government-wide recruitment efforts for critical, hard-to-fill positions.
9. Upgrade corporate recruitment and marketing activities.[138]

The goal of these recommendations is to get federal agencies and departments to accept more responsibility for the recruitment process and see it as an aspect of day-to-day management.

A recruitment strategic plan is one, if not the most important, step an agency can take in developing a successful recruitment program. The plan should help the agency meet the challenges it will face in the coming years. Examples of challenges include:

1. Finding qualified applicants
2. Creating a diverse workforce to mirror the community
3. Hiring processes tend to be lengthy
4. Increasing attrition both of retirees and younger officers
5. Finding cost effective ways to advertise openings
6. High cost of housing in the area

The purpose of a recruitment strategic plan is to develop a plan that capitalizes on the strengths of an agency, identifies potential opportunities, and identifies and mitigates weaknesses and threats, where possible, in order to position the agency to accomplish its recruitment goals.

---

[136] The Partnership for Public Service and National Academy of Public Administration, 12.
[137] Ibid, 1.
[138] Ibid, 12-14.

The Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI), for example, realized that the type of agent they want has changed. According to an article in USA TODAY, the FBI now wants "more independent, self-directed people who are linear, logical thinkers."[139] The shift in desired candidate characteristics should impact the recruitment plan, because the previously used strategies may no longer be effective in finding their current ideal candidates.

A group of participants who attended the 2005 Recruitment and Retention Symposium developed much of the information on this topic. The subject-matter experts who participated in the focus groups also contributed input.

Developing a recruitment strategic plan is divided into two sections: Analysis and Strategic Plan Outline. Analysis pertains to developing the information necessary to mount a successful recruitment campaign. Strategic Plan Outline focuses on the elements that make up the strategic plan. These two sections will help agencies develop a sound recruitment strategic plan.

ANALYSIS

In order to accomplish this task, a variety of information is needed. Analysis, then, is a key element of developing a plan. What information is needed to develop a recruitment strategic plan? The following are examples of questions an agency will want to consider in the process of developing a recruitment strategic plan.

The questions are grouped in different categories. Review the list and identify those that are most pertinent. There may be others that are unique to the agency, and should be added to the list as appropriate. The answers to these questions will provide important background that will have a significant impact on the development of a recruitment strategic plan and the action plan.

Many agencies skip this process. To do so will leave them without important information and consequently, without a solid footing upon which to build a successful recruitment plan.

CANDIDATES

- Who is the ideal candidate for the agency?
- What has attracted qualified candidates to the agency?
- How did those qualified candidates learn about openings?
- Why is the pool of qualified candidates shrinking?
- What is the value system of the new generation and how can the agency package itself to show potential candidates that the agency has what they desire?

---

[139] Toni Lucy, "New breed of FBI recruits training to take on terror," USA TODAY, 27 May 2005, http://www.usatoday.com/news/nation/2005-05-26-fbi-recruits_x.htm?csp=34 (Last viewed: 18 January 2006)

TESTING PROCESSES

- Are all the steps in the recruitment process necessary and, if not, why are they part of the process?
- What part of the testing process takes too much time or is performing less than optimal?
- What constraints are imposed by policies, law, city/county charters, etc.?
- How do candidates feel about the process?
- At what point in the process are candidates "falling out?"
- How does the process compare (ease of use and time) to other agencies in the area?
- How closely does the agency work with the Human Resources/Personnel Department if it is external to the agency?

DIVERSITY

- How many women and other members of protected classes/targeted populations are employed as peace officers, and how does that compare to the community the agency serves?
- How do those individuals feel about working for the agency? Have they experienced discrimination and, if so, when did that last occur?
- Would they recommend the agency to others?
- Why do we lack diversity?
- What research exists to "tap into" the target audience?
- What internal resources are available to assist in the development of the strategic plan?
- How do you evaluate recruitment success?
- What are the time constraints?

BUDGETARY

- What is currently allocated for recruitment and advertising?
- What are the budgetary constraints?
- Is there a need to increase the recruitment and advertising budgets and, if so, how can a commitment be obtained to get the needed increases?
- If more resources are needed, how will they be used? What benefit can be anticipated?

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

RECRUITMENT STRATEGIES

- What has worked or not worked in terms of recruitment strategies and advertising in the past?
- Are signing bonuses or other incentives important?
- How can current employees be ambassadors for the agency and help recruit qualified candidates?
- What recruitment materials does the agency already have and how current are they?
- Does the agency have a recruitment website and how many hits is it generating?
- Has the agency used paid advertisement in the past and, if so, what value did it add to the recruitment process?
- What strategies is the agency using to attract the interest of grade school up to high school students?
- What ancillary programs are in use to bring high school and college students into the agency as cadets, interns, explorers, or part-time paid positions?

AGENCY PERCEPTION

- What is the perception of city/county government about the agency and its needs?
- What is the perception of the community toward the agency, especially populations desired for employment?
- What do current officers like about working for the agency and what has contributed to them staying?

EMPLOYMENT COMPETITION

- Who are your competitors both in the public and private sectors?
- How can the agency positively and uniquely present what it has to offer?
- What are the recruitment problems/successes of the private sector?
- What seems to be working well for other agencies?

AGENCY FACTORS

- What has been the attrition rate for the past five years?
- Who are the stakeholders and what are their expectations (city, county, community, etc.)?
- What will be the review and approval process for the plan?
- What have been the hiring trends for the past five years?

- What changes are on the horizon for the next three years that will stimulate staff increases or decreases?
- What is considered short range/long range for the agency?
- Who should be responsible for implementing the action plan?
- Are exit interviews conducted to determine why staff is leaving?

This information will help as the strategic plan is developed. Furthermore, the responses will impact the strategic plan as issues are identified that may need to be addressed in order to meet agency goals.

SAMPLE STRATEGIC PLAN OUTLINE

The following is an outline that can be used to help in the process of developing a recruitment strategic plan. There are eight sections, which include:

Identify Stakeholders
Analysis of current agency practices
Trends – What is happening in the surrounding environment?
Decide on a time frame
Identify overall goal
Establish objectives
Develop an Action Plan
Review and Evaluate

The information developed in the analysis section will help complete different sections of the outline.

I. IDENTIFY STAKEHOLDERS
Internal
1. Command staff
2. Employees
3. Agency personnel/Bureau or Division
4. Planning division
5. Fiscal administration
6. Others?

External
1. Citizens
2. Community leaders
3. Human resources
4. Board of Supervisors/City officials
5. Others?

II. ANALYSIS OF CURRENT AGENCY PRACTICES: A thorough analysis and review –
Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities, and Threats (SWOT)

What are the organizational strengths? Examples may include:
1. Retirement and benefits
2. Variety of assignments
3. Advancement/career opportunities
4. Incentives
5. Job stability/security

What are the organizational weaknesses? Examples may include:
1. Budgetary constraints
2. Hiring process: timeline/complexity
3. Applicant pool quality/quantity
4. Lack of diversity
5. Negative perception of law enforcement

What are the organizational opportunities for enhanced recruitment? Examples may include:
1. Technology
   a. On-line recruitment information
   b. On-line application submittal
   c. On-line application processing
   d. On-line testing
   e. On-line background investigation packages
   f. Using on-line internet advertising
   g. On-line targeted advertising

2. Advertising
   a. Website and "hit" tracking
   b. Media
   c. Public Service Announcements

3. Job Fairs
4. Community partnerships
5. Church groups
6. Minority groups
7. Schools
8. Service clubs
9. Military
10. Corporate sponsorships: e.g., Shaquille O'Neal
11. Referral program
12. Other

What are the organizational threats? Some examples may include:
1. Competition by other agencies/"Poaching"
2. Private sector
3. Public perception of law enforcement

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

        a. "Negative" police contacts
        b. "Negative" press
    4. Parental objections
    5. Labor unions and Memorandums of Understanding, such as over use of seniority.

Conduct other analysis, as necessary, based on questions listed in Analysis Section above.

III. TRENDS: What is happening in the surrounding environment? Examples may include:

    1. Baby boomers retiring
    2. Generation X and Y characteristics
    3. Smaller applicant pools
    4. Military Reserve deployments
    5. Enhanced retirement plans in other agencies
    6. Housing and commute time
    7. Integrity issues and values
    8. Legislative initiatives/issues
    9. Other "facts in custody"?

IV. DECIDE ON A TIMELINE
    1. Short term
    2. Long term
    3. "Timeless"
    4. Identify overall goal(s)
    Example: To identify your recruitment strategies in order to hire and retain qualified
    applicants for law enforcement.

V. ESTABLISH OBJECTIVES
    Example: To create a more diverse workforce in partnership with community
    leaders/groups that better reflects community demographics

    1. Identify short term objectives
    2. Identify long term objectives

VI. DEVELOP AN ACTION PLAN: The purpose of the action plan is to create a road map to
    accomplish your respective objectives.

    1. Identify the hiring goals, including targeted population(s), and timelines.
    2. Identify an agency individual who will have primary responsibility for
       implementing the action plan.
    3. Identify agency personnel who will be directly involved as recruiters.
        a. May be full-time, part-time, or volunteer.

        b. Should be motivated and interested in recruiting, especially targeted populations.

        c. Should have targeted population representation on the recruitment team.

        d. Provide selected individuals with appropriate training.

4. Look for ways to involve all department employees in recruiting qualified candidates.

5. Identify, research, and contact organizations representing targeted population.

6. Create and foster community partnerships to assist with recruitment efforts through referrals.

7. Partner with others and share qualified candidates who do not meet agency qualifications.

8. Utilize employment information and job fair services (i.e. Jobing.com, Careerbuilder.com, POST.CA.GOV, MilitaryStars.com, CalOpps.org, and LawEnforcementJobs.com).

9. Create and utilize quality advertising media that demonstrates diversity within your organization (i.e. ethnicity, gender).

10. Utilize available technology to enhance current recruitment advertising efforts, especially the internet.

11. Identify tools to track program effectiveness, such as surveying candidates who show up at testing sites as to how they heard about the openings, number of recruiter community events/activity, etc.

12. Implement action plan

VII. REVIEW AND EVALUATION

1. Implement an evaluation tool(s) to assess the effectiveness of your action plan.
       a. Did you meet your short/long term objectives?
       b. What attracted the greatest number of qualified candidates to testing sites?
       c. What yielded the greatest return from different advertising media used?
       d. Does the plan need to be revised?

2. Make changes as necessary to improve effectiveness

A sub-component of developing a recruitment strategic plan includes developing an advertising plan. The next section will provide insights as to what to consider in developing an advertising plan.

Summary of Key Points

The following is a summary of the key points identified in this chapter.

- Planning is an essential function of a successful recruitment process.
- Analysis is the under-pinning of a good recruitment strategic plan.
- The analysis component should provide information in key areas. Examples of

---

categories include those that focus on questions about candidates, testing processes, diversity, budget, recruitment strategies and agency perception.
- A recruitment strategic plan outline is provided to help agencies begin to develop a strategic plan.

Page intentionally left blank

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

CHAPTER 6

DEVELOPING AN ADVERTISING PLAN

Webster's Dictionary defines 'advertise' as, "…to tell about or praise (a product, service, etc.) publicly, as through newspapers, handbills, radio, television, etc., so as to make people want to buy it…to call the public's attention to things for sale or rent, help wanted, etc., as by printed or broadcast notices; sponsor advertisements…"[140]

An advertising plan involves identifying a goal or goals of what an agency wants to accomplish, who the advertising is designed to reach, what the agency wants to say to the intended audience, how this will be accomplished, and the necessary resources. It is an opportunity to create a "brand" for the agency by sending out a specific and consistent message that communicates unique qualities about the agency that will resonate with potential candidates, evoking them to contact the agency for more information or apply.

Developing an advertising plan can be a daunting task, especially considering working with advertising professionals in the development of television or radio commercials. While working with advertising professionals may be beneficial for some agencies, there is so much more that is involved in developing an advertising plan.

In this section, steps will be recommended that will help agencies through the process of developing an advertising plan. Did you know, for example, that an employee referring potential candidates is one of the best forms of advertising according to a survey of recruiters? Or that, in a study of affiliated academy recruits, recruits most attracted to the employing agency are due to the positive reputation of the agency? Knowing this kind of information is an asset when considering ways to improve recruitment.

Developing an advertising plan involves these steps: Develop a Recruitment Strategic Plan, Identify Strategies for Advertising, Prioritize Advertising Strategies, Implement the Advertising Plan and Evaluate the Results. Much of the material in this section was developed by a group who focused on this topic at the 2005 Recruitment and Retention Symposium.

---

[140] Michael Agnes, Editor in Chief, Webster's New World College Dictionary, Fourth Edition, (Cleveland: Wiley Publishing, Inc., 2002), 20.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

DEVELOP A RECRUITMENT STRATEGIC PLAN

An advertising plan is built on having good information. This information is appropriately identified and captured in a Recruitment Strategic Plan. If a Recruitment Strategic Plan has not been developed, time should be set aside to conduct research that will provide the agency with the needed information. Gathering this information will take coordination, cooperation of employees in different areas of the agency, HR/Personnel, access to past data, a survey or focus group work, and time.

Examples of information that are needed include:

- Past, current and projected future hiring trends
- Identify characteristics of the ideal candidate(s)
- Determine what has attracted new employees, as well as what keeps senior employees on the job
- Determining where the agency is in terms of diversity compared with the community, including projected changes in demographics
- Identifying what kind of advertising has yielded the best results for the agency in the past, as well as what did not work well
- Identify stakeholders, including community groups with whom the agency has a good relationship
- Identify the resources available for recruitment, such as staff, budget, and expertise
- Identify venues where individuals with the ideal characteristics can be found
- Identify strategies that will reach the ideal candidates
- Determine the message the agency wants to communicate to potential candidates

Some would recommend doing a SWOT analysis. This would involve identifying an agency's strengths and weaknesses relative to recruitment, as well as possible opportunities and threats that may exist.

For example, the Phoenix Police Department realized that the affordable housing in the city created an opportunity considering the high cost of housing in Southern California. Phoenix Police Sergeant Tony Lopez stated, "Los Angeles is really the only place I can go and say our houses are only $250,000, and people will get excited about that. I can't do that in Oklahoma or Texas, but I can do that in L.A."[141]

This type of information is needed in order to have a clear understanding of the agency's recruitment realities. Armed with this information, the agency is in a position to proceed with the other steps in the planning process for an effective advertising plan.

Without having this information, an agency will be at a significant disadvantage in developing an effective advertising plan. For instance, without knowing who the ideal candidate is becomes very difficult to focus advertising. Without knowing what has worked in the past, an agency

---

[141] Josh Kleinbaum, "Phoenix trying to cop an edge," Daily News, 16 September 2005.

may duplicate efforts that historically did not yield good results. Without having a perspective of current and future recruitment needs, an agency may not develop an appropriate advertising plan resulting in too few qualified candidates to meet agency needs.

The steps suggested in the following outline offers useful ideas:

1. Survey "Our Community" Stakeholders
   a. Employees - Small diverse group from department (rank, sworn, non-sworn, gender, ethnic)
   b. Constituency – Who we serve
   c. Customers – Those we come in contact with while providing service
   d. Special Interest Groups – Such as, Neighborhood Watch members, and children

2. Analyze the feedback
   a. What is the community expectation?
   b. Are there areas that need improvement?
   c. To what degree does the community trust the agency?
   d. What does the agency do well?
   e. Would stakeholders want a member of their family to work for the agency?
   f. What does the community consider to be ideal characteristics for an officer?

3. Communicate the results to stakeholders

4. Determine the best approach to reach desired candidates
   a. Consider using a professional advertising agency
   b. Process should be concerned with both recruitment and overall public relations

5. Research is critical for developing an effective advertising plan. For more information on planning, see "Developing a Recruitment Strategy." Once the information has been collected, then it is appropriate to identify strategies for advertising.

IDENTIFY STRATEGIES FOR ADVERTISING

Given the information gathered in the previous step, take time to brainstorm strategies for advertising agency openings. The idea is to identify as many ideas as possible. Do not allow money or other challenges to interfere with the brainstorming process. Remember, the eventual

goal is to develop an advertising approach that is multi-faceted, cost-effective, and that will work well for your agency.

Here is a list of ideas to consider that may work for your agency:

- Form Partnerships with:
    - University/college/high school communications, art and computer science programs – Ask them to help develop current, up to date animation, graphics and interactive programs, print materials, etc.
    - Student Interns – To work on developing advertising plans or other aspects of advertisement, including evaluation
    - Local media – Ask for help to produce public service announcements (both informational and recruitment oriented) and directed news stories regarding department programs and activities
    - Professional production companies and advertising agencies – Many are willing to do pro bono work or discount the cost of video/CD/DVD development
    - Other city departments or agencies to advertise
    - Community groups to help find qualified candidates
- Develop or enhance website design
    - Stand alone website – separate from the city website, but linked
    - Use up-to-date graphics and animation
    - Keep information current
    - Design it for information and recruitment
    - Make it simple to navigate
    - Look for ways to link the website to other sites
- Develop a recruiting DVD
    - Develop a format that is different from other agencies
    - Develop specific segments (or stand alone) for specific groups that the agency wants to target, such as military, female or ethnic groups
    - Distribute copies of the DVD to job applicants, handout at job fairs, schools, community events, etc.
    - Make it available on the agency's website
- Develop an interactive DVD-based game designed for young people
- Develop an Employee Referral Program
- View every opportunity to speak to the community as an opportunity to get the recruitment message out
- Develop attractive, professionally printed recruitment materials
- Develop a process to mentor candidates through the process
- Provide current information to candidates during the process, so they know where they stand and what is expected of them at any point in time
- Keep in mind the advertising plan should address marketing openings to parents and other family members
- Develop a regional testing approach
- Put recruitment bumper stickers on agency vehicles
- Display banners on the front of the building
- Broadcast radio/television commercials

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

- Print recruitment information on pizza boxes
- Host pizza parties or provide other support for college clubs/groups as part of a plan to develop relationships with college students who may be possible candidates
- Attend job fairs/community events
- Put printed recruitment information in patrol vehicles to be distributed by officers
- Have recruitment materials at every point of public assess to agency offices

Some of these ideas are common, while others are not. Consider other options as well. These are simply a few ideas to stimulate brainstorming. Further, include stakeholders in this process where ever possible.

Some agencies have contracted with outside firms to do this work when in-house expertise was not available. There are three basic approaches to consider as shown in table 41.[142]

TABLE 41. OPTIONS FOR DEVELOPING CREATIVE ADVERTISING AND
IMPLEMENTING THE ADVERTISING PLAN

Type of Agency	Services Provided
Full-service agency	Does research, selects and purchases media, develops ad copy and produces artwork.
Limited-service agency	Specializes in one aspect of creative process; usually provides creative production work or only buys media space.
Media sales representative	Often, a publication or broadcasting station can assist with production and scheduling. There may or may not be a charge. They can also provide information on their reach and recommend the best schedule for the available budget.

The decision to use an outside firm should take into consideration at least some of the following factors:

- Availability of in-house expertise
- Advertising goals
- Level of creativity needed
- Media being considered, such as television commercials
- Cost
- Knowledge of the area

---

[142] Wisconsin Department of Tourism, Developing Your Advertising Plan, http://agency.travelwisconsin.com/Programs/es98d.shtm, (last viewed, December 6, 2005).

- Expertise in reaching the desired audience
- Experience with recruitment
- Current and former clients

Once a variety of ideas have been generated, begin to prioritize them.

PRIORITIZE ADVERTISING STRATEGIES

Now that a number of ideas have been developed, the list should be prioritized. By the end of this step, the agency should have identified the strategies that will constitute the core of the advertising plan.

Different options are available to help prioritize ideas, such as cost, degree to which the idea could be used to do focused recruitment, capability or ease of development for the agency, and existing strategies that may already be in place.

For most agencies, cost is a factor. As recruitment becomes more challenging, agencies will need to approach recruitment more strategically and provide some level of consistent, on-going funding.

Most of the items on the list of ideas in the step above could be implemented at little cost beyond staff time committed to the project. In fact, employees have repeatedly been identified as one of the best tools for recruitment. Developing a plan to encourage employees to help with recruitment does not have to be expensive. It may be as easy as keeping employees informed and making sure information and materials are conveniently available.

On the other hand, some agencies have attached incentives that include monetary rewards or time off for candidates who are hired, successfully finish the academy, and complete probation. Developing an employee referral program that has incentives will take more time to develop, since there are legal issues and approval processes that will need to be addressed.

The form, Prioritizing Recruitment Ideas, may be useful in this process and is included in Appendix 8. It provides space to list the idea, cost, time required to develop, capability to do the idea in-house, ability to sustain the idea over time, and a space for other considerations.

If the agency does not have in-house expertise, what options exist to get that assistance outside of the agency? Does the agency have the resources to go outside for assistance or is there a firm that may be willing to help for little or no cost? Consider the discussion in the previous section if an outside firm is being considered.

One benefit in using an advertising firm is the familiarity with demographics and what it may take to penetrate a desired audience. They may have conducted market research or have access to market research that will help determine which newspapers, radio stations, or television

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

stations have the greatest penetration into the targeted audience. However, newspaper publishers and broadcast companies have conducted market research and know what markets they penetrate and will share that information with potential clients when requested. It is best if the research has been conducted by a reputable third party.

The process of prioritizing advertising strategies should include input from key stakeholders. What experience do they have with these ideas or others? What ideas are of interest to them? What ideas do they think would work best for the agency? What is affordable and/or sustainable over time?

If cost, for example, is a key factor impacting what ideas are selected for implementation, then what combination of little or no cost ideas will work for the agency? Can some past approaches be abandoned or limited in order to reallocate funds to more promising ideas? For example, if the traditional job fairs are not effective, can the time and resources historically used for this purpose be reallocated to help fund another strategy?

Time is another critical factor. Some ideas will need more time than others to develop. Considering the testing and selection time frames, can the idea be developed and implemented within the available time? Ideally, this process should take place well before the recruitment process begins, so ideas can be fully developed and ready to implement to get optimal benefit.

If ideas are identified, but adequate time is not available, what other options exist to develop the idea. Is another agency using the idea? If so, are they willing to provide a copy of the staff work to help expedite the development process?

If adequate time does not allow for this recruitment process, could someone be tasked with developing the idea for the next recruitment period? Part of the Advertising Plan should include desired future steps. Include a time frame for when this idea should be developed. On the other hand, an agency may want to consider postponing the application and selection process until the advertising ideas are ready for implementation.

Developing a multi-faceted approach is advisable. One idea may work better than another, and reach some potential candidates that another idea may not. It makes sense, too, that a multi-faceted approach recognizes that some approaches will work better than others. Selecting only one approach that does not generate the right results can be disastrous to the process.

It is important at this point to get approval, as appropriate, especially if additional resources will be required. Having taken the time to conduct research, this background information will be very useful in supporting the need to allocate additional funding, as well as to try approaches that may be new to the agency. Getting approval before implementation ensures that as work progresses, both internal and external stakeholders will know which direction the agency is moving. This will increase support as well as reduce the chance of objections that will derail the advertising plan.

Once the list of advertising strategies have been prioritized and selected, the next step is to implement the advertising plan.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

IMPLEMENTING THE ADVERTISING PLAN

The advertising plan is ready for implementation. Work can now begin to develop the identified advertising priorities.

Good project planning skills are important. Key aspects to consider include: assigning responsibility, setting timelines, monitoring progress, identifying obstacles, and keeping agency executives informed. Taking time in the beginning to identify tasks and steps to complete tasks for each advertising goal is important and will minimize mistakes later.

If creative ad work is needed it should be completed now. The final selection of media should be made, such as which newspaper, radio station or other outlet will be used. Contracts will need to be finalized.

Keep in mind that rates charged by media vendors vary widely based on location in the newspaper, day of week, time of day for radio or television commercials, etc. Compare rates based on projected penetration of the desired audiences. The industry standard is cost per thousand (CPM).[143] For each media vender consider the cost of the ad and divide by the circulation or number that the ad will reach. For example, if the ad cost is $1,500 and it has a circulation of 20,000 people, then the CPM is $.075. This allows one to compare the costs. Negotiate with these vendors to get the best price!

Develop criteria for evaluating the response for each strategy selected. When candidates show up at a test site, for example, survey them as to how they heard about the opening. Some agencies have applications on-line. In order to get an application, candidates are queried to ascertain how they heard about the openings. The information gathered is critical in determining what does and does not work.

As the plan is implemented, take time to evaluate results. Evaluating results will help an agency determine whether or not a particular strategy is producing results.

EVALUATE THE RESULTS

A common term in the literature today is ROI or return on investment. Evaluation is the process of determining the return on the advertising investment. It allows an agency to determine if the goals are being achieved and which strategies are working best.

---

[143] Businesstown.com, Media Plans, http://www.businesstown.com/advertising/basic-media.asp (last viewed, December 7, 2005).

Examples of evaluation criteria include:

- Number of paper versus on-line applications turned in
- Number of people applying that match diversity goals
- Number of people who do not show up as scheduled
- Problems that arise with technology or complaints by candidates
- Responses to surveys showing the message is penetrating the desired audiences
- Advertising cost per candidate
- Number of employee referrals
- Number of recruits who complete the academy and/or field training

The evaluation results will help an agency identify problems that need to be addressed, strategies that are or are not working, and provide other useful information. Based on the results, strategies may need to be modified, abandoned, or expanded to better achieve recruitment goals.

Summary of Key Points

The following is a summary of the key points identified in this chapter.

- Advertising should be anchored on a recruitment strategic plan that is under-pinned with good analysis.
- There are many advertising strategies. A multi-faceted approach using a combination of approaches is usually best.
- There are different types of advertising agencies that may be needed depending on the availability of in-house expertise and other factors ranging from a full-service firm to a media sales representative.
- Prioritizing advertising strategies based upon cost, in-house capabilities, likelihood the strategy will reach the desired market in sufficient numbers, time constraints and/or other considerations specific to the organization.
- Develop a method to evaluate the advertising results. Strategies that do not deliver desired results should be re-evaluated. Strategies that are working should be considered for expansion.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

Page intentionally left blank

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

CHAPTER 7

IMPROVING THE SELECTION PROCESS

The goal of this section is to focus on improving the agency's selection process by streamlining it without compromising the integrity of the process. The selection process, depending on the jurisdiction, includes recruitment to generate timely applications correctly completed, followed by a: written test, physical ability test, oral interview, background investigation, conditional job offer, medical examination, psychiatric screening, and final hiring decision.

The process described above generally takes nine months or longer. As competition heats up for available workers, this time must be shortened as much as possible. Some agencies have been successful in shortening this time frame to less than six weeks.

A Police Hiring and Retention Survey found that nationally small agencies took an average of 6.84 weeks to conduct the screening processes, while large agencies took an average of 11.51 weeks.[144] This is a considerable length of time to wait for a job, especially when, as previously mentioned, a survey of college graduates said they would be unwilling to wait more than thirty days for a government job.

There are those who believe that interested candidates will wait however long it takes. A question to consider is, "How many good candidates will be lost because they have family demands or other obligations that necessitate making career choices in time frames much less than nine months…or six months…or four months?" The paradigms we have been operating under must be challenged to see if they are still current.

Efforts must be made to simplify the process and make it more user-friendly. Processes that treat people poorly or as "numbers" will alienate potential candidates who have other options.

The process described above generally involves little interaction with candidates, except to advise them of the next step when it approaches. Candidates who are investigating other career opportunities may lose interest or drop out as other options arise.

Improving the hiring process is a strategic issue for federal agencies. In 2004, three federal agencies volunteered to participate in an "Extreme Hiring Makeover" in an effort to improve the hiring process. The three agencies are the National Nuclear Security Administration, Centers for Medicare & Medicaid Services, and Department of Education. The results of a ten month study were released on July 20, 2005.[145] Case studies of each of these are available on-line. Key elements of these makeovers are presented below.

---

[144] U.S. Department of Justice, Office of Justice Programs, Hiring and Keeping Police Officers, 42.
[145] Extreme Hiring Makeover, Extreme Hiring Makeover Gives Federal Hiring a Facelift, 20 July 2006, Website: http://www.extremehiringmakeover.org/pr_20050720_facelift.asp (Last viewed: 18 August 2005).

National Nuclear Security Administration (NNSA)

Problem: A review of the hiring practices found that job announcements were filled with jargon, lots of facts and information, and extensive list of job duties which made it difficult to identify major features and selling points of the job. Recruitment was passive…NNSA waited for applicants to apply.

Makeover: They created a new look and used plain English to convey the importance and excitement of their positions, as well as why they were a great place to work. They added photos to depict the unique work environment at NNSA. They implemented an internet-based targeted recruitment strategy to identify potential candidates from job boards and other locations. The results produced 28 qualified candidates, up from three unqualified candidates in the previous recruitment process.

They also sent recruiters to fifteen universities in the South and West to recruit interns with an emphasis on diversity. Using the updated recruitment materials and state-of-the-art flash presentations, they successfully recruited 30 highly qualified interns. Each intern was assigned a sponsor to mentor the intern and assure meaningful assignments and challenging work.

Lessons Learned:
• Top leadership commitment is critical
• Everything flows from strategy
• New ideas fuel innovation
• A picture speaks a thousand words
• Recruiting flexibilities make a difference[146]

Centers for Medicare & Medicaid Services

Problem: Federal law changed requiring the agency to add 500 new positions. The length of time to complete the hiring process was long and the quality of candidates was lacking. The automated staffing system in place was believed to be inadequate to meet the demands of the hiring needs. The agency wanted top talent and a faster process.

Makeover: The agency started with an "end-to-end" mapping of the hiring process and identified both short and long term fixes. They used focus groups to document the process, identify roles and responsibilities, and assess obstacles. Through the process the agency eventually reduced the number of steps in the hiring process by more than twenty percent.

Other key things they did included better marketing positions using visually appealing, plain-English announcements, proactively targeting qualified candidates via internet

---

[146] Partnership for Public Service, The Science of Marketing: National Nuclear Security Administration, no date, available at this website: http://www.extremehiringmakeover.org/pdf/NNSA_casestudy.pdf, (Last viewed: 18 August 2005), 1.

resume databases and built tools to effectively screen applicants to ensure they were a good fit for the position.

They eventually assigned responsibility for the process to one person at the executive level. The agency is in the process of shifting their view of recruitment and hiring from an administrative function to a critical, strategic function.[147]

U.S. Department of Education

Problem: The hiring process took too long and did not always deliver qualified candidates. Upon mapping out the hiring process, it was discovered that there were 114 discrete steps with over 45 handoffs between different managers, administrative officers and HR specialists. As it turned out, managers were disengaged from the hiring process. Job descriptions were problematic. When managers could not find good candidates they had a tendency to sit on the list, until ultimately it was re-posted.

Makeover: The hiring process was streamlined by eliminating redundancies and unnecessary steps resulting in a reduction of more than half of the steps…down to 53. The automated process for assessing applicants has been overhauled and questions are more closely aligned with skills needed to be successful on the job. Work continues to be done to strengthen the hiring process. The process of change has not been easy and has taken a commitment of time and effort on the part of leaders, HR, managers and others involved in the hiring process.[148]

These three case studies show that complex hiring processes can be streamlined to improve and shorten the hiring process, as well as deliver qualified candidates. Key points taken from these case studies include:

- Obtain executive support and involvement
- Assign oversight of the hiring process to one executive
- Involve all impacted (those involved with the hiring process) stakeholders
- Map out the hiring process from beginning-to-end
- Analyze the hiring process to eliminate duplicative, unnecessary steps
- Develop clear job descriptions that focus on essential skills and knowledge
- Prepare creative, appealing job postings and other recruitment material, written in plain English, incorporating pictures that help communicate a strong recruitment message
- Do not rely only on passive recruitment, use the internet to find qualified potential candidates
- Automate the hiring process and make it work for the agency by screening out applicants who do not meet the hiring standards, as well as tracking applicants through the process

---

[147] Partnership for Public Service, Prescription for Hiring Success: Centers for Medicare & Medicaid Services, no date, available at this website: http://www.extremehiringmakeover.org/pdf/CMS_casestudy.pdf, (Last viewed: 18 August 2005), 1.
[148] Partnership for Public Service, Hire Education: U.S. Department of Education, no date, available at this website: http://www.ourpublicservice.org/usr_doc/edcasestudy.pdf, (Last viewed: 18 August 2005), 1.

- Adopt a philosophy of continuous improvement, looking for ways to further improve and shorten the hiring process

These case studies are rich with information that agencies can use to improve the hiring process. Reviews of the full case studies are encouraged.

The following steps will be covered in this section:

- Review the current process…beginning-to-end
- Seek stakeholder buy-in
- Ideas for improving the process
- Evaluation

Much of the information in this section was developed by a group of participants who focused on improving the selection process at the 2005 Recruitment and Retention Symposium.

REVIEW OF THE CURRENT PROCESS BEGINNING-TO-END

The first step is to review the current process. Start at the very beginning with the job vacancy and map out the process through to when a hire takes place. Inform key stakeholders of the review process and invite them to participate. Key stakeholders include agency leadership, HR, recruitment, and others directly involved with the hiring process. If stakeholders understand what is occurring and why, there will be less suspicion and a greater willingness to assist.

During the review process, consider the following questions:

- Where does the process start and end?
- What processes are in place between the beginning and ending points?
- What is required in each phase of the process (i.e., POST or civil service)?
- How long do these steps take?
- Which steps can be modified, combined, eliminated, or outsourced?
- What is the perspective of candidates who have participated in the process?
- Does the process identify the best candidates in terms of skills, knowledge, and abilities desired by the agency (i.e., service oriented versus adventure oriented)?
- Does the process differentiate between candidates who are not trained, those who have graduated from a POST certified academy, those who are laterals from other agencies, and those who work for the agency and are seeking to promote into a peace officer position?
- What is the current cost per candidate?
- Once a list is established, what rules apply as to how the names are certified for consideration, such as by individual score versus those ranked in broad bands?
- Is there a time limit for the agency executive to make a hiring decision?

- What responsibilities or roles are assigned to the law enforcement agency versus the Human Resource/Personnel Department?
- Who has ultimate responsibility for the hiring process? Is it one person?
- Do community representatives participate in any of the processes, such as the oral interview?
- Which aspects of the process are automated, if any?
- How does the current process compare with other agencies that are able to complete the process much faster or more effectively?
- Can steps on the process be automated? If so, can they be improved?

After this review is complete there should be a good understanding of the process and where problems or opportunities exist. With this information in mind, establish some goals for improvement. What can be done with minimal time or resources? What is within the agency's power to change? What changes need the support of other stakeholders? List the goals in order of prioritize.

SEEK STAKEHOLDER BUY-IN

There are a number of potential stakeholders involved with improving the selection process. Communication and involvement are important to getting support during this process. Involving key stakeholders during the review stage will naturally generate some support. The following adage applies here: **People support what they help to create!** Additionally, stakeholder involvement allows perspectives to be shared about the process that can both assist with improvements, as well as identify potential obstacles from the beginning.

The following is a list of the types of stakeholders who have a direct interest in improving thepeace officer selection process:
- Human Resource/Personnel staff
- Law enforcement executives
- Law enforcement staff (i.e., those involved with recruitment, backgrounds, and training)
- Community leaders and members
- Community groups, such as churches or ethnic interest groups
- State or municipal government executives in various capacities
- Information Technology staff
- Finance staff
- Civil Service Commission or equivalent
- Legal Counsel
- Equal Employment Opportunity Committee in the jurisdiction
- Special interest groups, for instance the Latino Peace Officer Association
- Union representatives
- Applicants

There may be others pertinent to a specific agency. Identifying and involving stakeholders can prevent objections at a later point in time.

IDEAS FOR IMPROVING THE PROCESS

The following is a list of different phases in the selection process. For each phase, suggestions are presented that may help improve the selection process.

1. Application Submission Process:
    a. Use an on-line/automated application process
    b. Use email as opposed to postal mail to communicate with applicants
    c. Put a preliminary background questionnaire on the department website so applicants can assess their background to potential disqualification factors before applying
    d. Assign responsibility to designated staff to answer phone calls and respond to email questions promptly
    e. Provide a list on the agency's website of the documents applicants must provide at the beginning of the background phase

2. Examination Process:

    a. Designate personnel (HR&PD) to law enforcement recruitment and exams
    b. Team build with human resources and the police agency staff to facilitate and streamline paper flow and processes
    c. Standardize the physical ability exam
    d. Do more than one part of the examination process on the same day to shorten the time frame
    e. Accept T-scores from POST written examinations from other agencies (within 6 months) to expedite applications
    f. Waive physical abilities examination if the applicant is a recent academy graduate or lateral
    g. Do regionalized testing so multiple agencies can benefit from "bulk testing"
    h. Review mandated vs. optional rules, interviews, etc. to determine what can be streamlined or eliminated
    i. Revise eligibility list guidelines to make more candidates available for consideration
    j. Move the POST required oral exam into the hiring process rather than examination process
    k. Conduct continuous testing with pre-notice of testing dates
    l. Allow applicants to self-schedule appointments through the agency's website
    m. Agencies share information on non-selected applicants with other agencies to which they are applying

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

n. "Banding" applicants in an experience pool so the agency does not have to go back and forth with HR until the agency obtains qualified applicants
o. Encourage POST to develop an on-line written test (administer & score)
p. Have applicants complete and hold psychological and medical history forms until after the conditional offer of employment
q. Research Americans with Disabilities Act, Federal Employment Hiring Act (FEHA), and other applicable regulatory statutes to avoid changes that may constitute discriminatory or adverse action complaints

3. Background Investigation Process

   a. Add more staff to conduct background investigations
   b. Provide assistance to applicants in filling out the on-line POST Personal History Statements, so they are complete and legible
   c. Make sure applicants know what documents are required for the background investigation process in order to obtain the documents in advance
   d. Outsource as much of the process as possible
   e. Applicants should be able to access their progress throughout the hiring process using the agency's website
   f. Allow officers attending training in another jurisdiction to contact references

4. Hiring Process

   a. Give the appointing authority a deadline to decide on an applicant so the decision-making process is expedited
   b. Hold hiring sessions where key decision-makers review multiple background packages and make hiring decisions during the meeting
   c. Authority to overfill (having more applicants ready than there are positions available so a pool of applicants is always ready)

EVALUATION CRITERIA

The last part in the process is establishing criteria for evaluation. It is important to consider evaluation during the planning process, so that as changes are implemented data can be gathered to allow for reevaluation when appropriate. The data may provide early detection of problems requiring changes. When it comes time to conduct a formal evaluation, available data can be compared with data collected prior to the changes being made, as well as to the goals that were established.

1. Identify a time frame for evaluation

   a. 18 – 24 months based on probationary period
   b. Longer if sending to academy

2. Who or what position will be responsible for doing the evaluation?
3. Conduct a cost/benefit analysis, such as

   a. Success rate of candidates through the selection process, academy, probation, etc.
   b. Monetary savings
   c. Staff time reduction

4. Determine applicant satisfaction with the new process.
5. Re-evaluation of the process for further improvements, identifying strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats.

The process presented in this section provides a roadmap that will help an agency chart the hiring process, identify stakeholders, analyze the hiring process, and determine where the process can be streamlined by eliminating or combining steps as appropriate. The information relative to evaluation is important to developing a process to see if the new process is meeting anticipated goals.

Summary of Key Points

The following is a summary of the key points identified in this chapter.

- In a national study of police agencies, large agencies, on the average, take nearly twice as long as small agencies to complete the hiring process.
- Three recent federal agency recruitment and hiring "extreme makeovers" provide important lessons in improving the recruiting and hiring process. Key to the process is securing executive level buy-in and participation, as well as mapping out the process from beginning-to-end to identify redundancies and unnecessary steps.
- Identifying and engaging stakeholders are important… "People support what they help to create."
- A number of ideas to improve the hiring process are categorized within the following processes: Application Submission, Examination, Background Investigation and Hiring.

CHAPTER 8

DEVELOPING EXTERNAL PARTNERSHIPS TO IMPROVE DIVERSITY RECRUITMENT

Developing external partnerships in this context is about better connecting with community groups, associations, or others outside the agency, especially those that represent women, ethnic groups, or others that are particularly sought after for employment. It means more than a superficial relationship or periodic meeting.

Partnership implies establishing an ongoing relationship, understanding each others' perspectives, having open and meaningful dialogue, developing trust, and strategizing as to how the relationship can benefit each party. While recruitment is the focus of this section, partnering with ethic community groups often means addressing a broader array of issues that may have been simmering from years of animosity. Some of these other issues, if present, may need to be addressed before meaningful recruitment-oriented dialogue can occur.

Agencies who are committed to **community policing** will want to look for ways to include these groups in meaningful ways beyond referring potential candidates. The Sacramento Police Department, for example, was one of five agencies in the United States awarded a Hiring in the Spirit of Service federal grant. As part of Sacramento's approach:

- Various community leaders were involved in focus groups to identify service-oriented traits that could be used to better market openings to service-oriented potential candidates

- Focus groups were conducted with female and minority employees to identify concerns they had and gather information to help improve their success rate in recruiting a diverse candidate pool

- A Community Recruiters Program was established, which involved identifying minority community leaders and providing training to both equip them to understand the agency, as well as recruit qualified police candidates from neighborhood and business associations, faith-based and educational institutions, and ethnic community groups

- Community members were invited to participate in the oral interview process for police cadets[149]

These efforts have improved the Sacramento Police Department's relationship with the community, enhanced their ability to better market the department to the community, and increased the number of women and minorities entering the academy.

---

[149] Scrivner, 21.

An important first step is identifying the "community" or "communities" an agency is trying to reach. This would ordinarily occur when developing a recruitment strategic plan or advertising plan. Collecting and comparing community demographics with agency staff is important. Identifying which ethnic groups are most under-represented is important in this process, as is understanding community demographic trends. Gathering this information helps to identify the "ideal" law enforcement candidate.

Symposium participants who recently considered this topic generally believed that many in law enforcement "talk" more about partnering with the community than actually "do" something about it. In what number of California communities might the following statement be true?

> Law enforcement may be misunderstood and not respected by the minority community. This includes a lack of trust between the community and agency, and a lack of understanding as to the benefit of entering the law enforcement profession.

Developing partnerships is a way to facilitate communication, develop understanding, cultivate trust, and create an avenue for recruitment.

What steps might be considered in developing partnerships? This was one focus at the 2005 Recruitment and Retention Symposium. The following are suggested steps to consider.

1. Compare department and community demographics to determine which groups are underrepresented.

2. Survey and communicate with officers from the underrepresented groups to determine motivation, interests, or concerns in order to attract candidates.

3. Attain executive sponsorship to establish a community-based Law Enforcement Recruitment Advisory Group comprised of known and credible minority group leaders. The purpose of the group is to:

   a. Generate and develop trust between department and underrepresented applicant and minority groups.
   b. Open lines of communication with the department and community's diverse populations regarding the benefits of public service/law enforcement to the applicant.
   c. Create a collaborative plan for community outreach and focused recruitment.
   d. Participate in recruitment such as when executives are making presentations in the community.

4. Obtain a stable recruitment budget endorsed by and supportive of the "advisory group" and its recruitment activities.

5. Create and implement a multimedia and/or multi-lingual advertisement and marketing campaign focusing on the recruitment of the identified underrepresented groups. A professional marketing or advertising firm may be needed to do this.

6. Implement pre-test orientation and preparation workshops on:

    a. Written Test Preparation
    b. Physical Agility Preparation
    c. Oral Interview Techniques

7. Partner with local colleges/high schools to provide preparation courses and recruitment.

8. Provide feedback to candidates and community groups regarding test performance and trends

9. Develop a mentoring program to encourage and assist candidates through the selection process, academy, and field training.

10. Stage events to engage family members' concerns through open forums, open-houses or other events. Include interpretive services where necessary.

11. Re-evaluate the hiring and testing processes for hidden hurdles, time delays, and unnecessary barriers that hinder the hiring process.

12. Sponsor new recruits through the academy.

13. Introduce new recruits to the community where they will be working.

Longer range actions might include state-wide or local efforts to develop a public service announcement plan, recruitment CD or interactive DVD campaign or production targeting:

- Image building of the law enforcement profession for the general population.
- Underrepresented groups with a message that "we need you" and the benefit of public service career in law enforcement.
- High School and college students using a video game adventure series.
- POST to take the lead in production or web-based distribution venue.

One concluding comment is that the recruitment of quality candidates cannot be the sole responsibility of the hiring agency. It MUST be shared by society and the community served.

Summary of Key Points

The following is a summary of the key points identified in this chapter.

- Developing external partnerships can help provide a pipeline of candidates, as well as develop understanding and cultivate trust among potential partners.
- Community policing is about partnering with the community and others to help solve problems. Recruitment is one such problem where the community is a key stakeholder.
- Thirteen steps are identified to assist in developing partnerships.

Page intentionally left blank

CHAPTER 9

PERSONALIZING THE RECRUITMENT PROCESS BY COURTING CANDIDATES AND FAMILY

Many of those in leadership positions today remember when there were hundreds, and even thousands, applying for peace officer positions. There was an abundance of candidates…even qualified candidates. Today, this is not the case.

As candidates have more opportunities for employment, law enforcement agencies will find it a greater challenge to attract qualified candidates. In a survey of college students, they were asked how long they would be willing to wait for a government job. Two-thirds answered not more than thirty days.[150] While few agencies could complete the hiring process in this amount of time, except perhaps for lateral candidates. Are there other ways to keep candidates interested longer until the process is complete?

A survey of academy recruits asked for ideas on how agencies could improve the recruitment process. Listed below is a sampling of actual written comments from respondents, both affiliated and non-affiliated.

- "Keep contact with people. It is very frustrating not knowing what is going on and not being able to get a hold of anyone. Explain (the) hiring process (time, cost & training)."
- "There is a lack of contact through the process…get a more personalized recruit hiring process."
- "…and that some agencies would take more time communicating to the recruits applying for their agency."
- "Speed up the hiring process and continual contact through the hiring process so recruits are informed…"
- "…more personable recruiters"
- "Become more interested in your applicants, and correspond with them, keeping them abreast of the current status."
- "Make an effort to let the applicant know their status during the hiring process. Be a little more helpful during recruitment…give more info during application and be friendly."[151]

Clearly, maintaining contact with candidates is important. However, it goes beyond simply contact, but looking for ways to personalize the process for both the candidate and the candidate's family. This is especially true for candidates from different ethnic groups where the family has considerable influence on career choices for children. It is also true for families who are bilingual or may have come from countries where the police are very corrupt.

---

[150] Partnership for Public Service, <u>The Hiring Process</u>, 1.
[151] Recruit Survey, Item 16.

Two agencies that have made significant efforts to personalize the recruitment process are the Riverside Sheriff's Department and the San Mateo Police Department. The Riverside Sheriff's Department assigns each candidate to a recruiter who regularly keeps in contact with assigned candidates via e-mail or phone calls. Lieutenant Shelley Kennedy-Smith had this to say:

> The goal and vision for attracting lateral applicants to the Riverside County Sheriff's Department is to build a winning team. Lateral applicants are treated like our extended family members who are already committed to the law enforcement profession. They are treated with respect and are provided one-on-one personalized service in order for them to have a full understanding of our organization and to determine if they want to become part of Sheriff Bob Doyle's All-Star Family.
>
> We provide them with tours of our department, ride-a-longs, one-on-one meetings with personnel bureau supervision, opportunities to speak with other laterals who have made the transition, etc. We determine what their needs are and what they are looking for in a department and give them a birds eye view of our department so they can make sure this is the "home" for them.[152]

The San Mateo Police Department has made strides to personalize the process both by keeping in contact with candidates, as well as reaching out to their families. "The entire hiring process for officers is a team effort. Once the application is received, the Police Department must treat the candidate as a team member, not simply as a name on a list."

"The candidate's family is also a vital part of the team that cannot be overlooked. When the Background Sergeant makes the initial contact with the candidates, and later with their family and friends, the positive relationship with the Police Department is made. There is constant personal contact throughout the entire hiring process. The candidates and their family are constantly encouraged to contact the Background Sergeant with any questions they may have. The Background Sergeant keeps the candidate updated as the process moves forward."

"The final step in this candidate/family relationship comes on Family Night. Family Night is exactly as the name implies – it is for the family. Family Night takes place in the very first week of in-house training right after the candidate is officially hired. The newly hired officer invites anyone who is important to them to attend. This is an opportunity for the family to hear all about the agency and to ask questions. The candidates almost always have the support of those close to them."

"This is our opportunity to meet and build a bond with them. The important people in the candidate's life leave Family Night with valuable insight into the Police Department and the police culture as a whole. We have found that Family Night provides long lasting relationships with the important people in the new officers' lives that we otherwise would not have met."[153]

Lieutenant Tom Daughtry added these comments:

---

[152] Lieutenant Shelley Kennedy-Smith, <u>Telephone Interview</u>, 21 December 2005.
[153] Lieutenant Tom Daughtry, <u>Personal E-mails</u>, 4 January 2006.

This has improved recruitment in the sense that we treat candidates as "people" not just a name on a list. It leads to a friendship. Candidates who have applied to multiple agencies almost always tell us how they appreciate the way we treat them and keep them informed. This includes lateral officers from other agencies.

Word gets out about the San Mateo process and we are welcomed by academy recruits when we meet with them. The feedback we get on a regular basis is that we are friendly, promote a family type atmosphere and are professional in our hiring.

It helps with retention because the high number of new/young officers seems to appreciate the way they were brought onboard. They are our best salespeople. They spread the word and a steady stream of applicants comes in. Many applicants come with a reference already hired by us. Kinda makes it easy![154]

Recently, Lieutenant Tom Daughtry, Leticia Juarez, and another colleague were awarded the Quarterly Achievement Award by the City of San Mateo for reducing the average hiring process from application to swearing-in to fourteen weeks. Previously it had taken several months longer.

This issue was the focus of a group of participants at the 2005 Recruitment and Retention Symposium. They suggested the following ideas for personalizing the recruitment process.

- Adopt a Customer-Focused Hiring Philosophy
- Expose Family to Law Enforcement Culture/Family Orientation
- Develop a Regional Recruiting Center
- Military Transition Program
- Developing Candidates Through Early Outreach

Each of these suggestions is expanded below.

ADOPT A CUSTOMER-FOCUSED HIRING PHILOSOPHY

Adopting a customer-focused hiring philosophy is about personalizing the recruitment process by:

- Developing a database to facilitate tracking candidates through the process
- Assigning a recruiter to each candidate throughout the process and have the recruiter make regular contact by phone or e-mail with the candidate
- Providing candidates access to the recruitment team
- Scheduling meetings when appropriate
- Mentoring candidates

---

[154] Ibid.

- Surveying recruits after the process to obtain feedback to improve the process

Candidates are seen as individuals who are important, not as numbers or faceless people looking for jobs. Relationships are developed that demonstrate value in the candidate while personalizing the experience.

Some companies, like Microsoft, have started e-mail newsletters for people who express interest in the company by visiting the website. Customer-relationship management software enables companies to tailor e-mails with articles about the company's culture, interest articles, and pictures to begin building a long-term relationship. When the person decides they are ready for a career change, the long-term e-mail relationship can result in a recruitment success.[155]

Mentoring is another way to build relationships with candidates and one that helps the candidate through the process. Some approaches are more time intensive than others. The approaches range from helping coach the candidate through the process to an on-going relationship that may begin prior to hiring and extend through completion of the Field Training Program.

Prior to the starting the academy, the Los Angeles Sheriff's Department provides classes to all applicants who are in the background process. Training Bureau Staff offer twice-weekly physical fitness training sessions to prepare candidates for the rigors of the physical training portion of the academy. The Academy Staff offer monthly seminars entitled, "You Can Do It", to address the academy curriculum, physical demands, academic requirements, and other aspects of the academy.[156]

The Blue Springs Police Department, in Missouri, has a mentoring program that begins at hiring and extends through probation. The goals of the program are to:

- Improve success rates for new hires
- Provide support and answer questions
- Resolve problems for recruit
- Increase understanding and teamwork between Blue Springs Police Department Units
- Build loyalty to the department
- Improve long-term retention of quality personnel[157]

Another idea was establishing an Internet Chat Forum for interested candidates and recruits. The following ideas could be implemented:

- Link to Frequently Asked Questions
- Provide advice and support information
- Project a family focus

---

[155] Regan's Management Resources, "Build interest and loyalty with prospective employees through e-mail career newsletter," Employee Recruitment & Retention , (October 2005), 1.
[156] Merrick J. Bobb, The Los Angeles County Sheriff's Department – 20th Semiannual Report, Police Assessment Resource Center (August 2005), 18.
[157] Wayne McCoy, "A Recruit Peer-Mentoring Program," Published in CALEA Update (June 2005): 3. Also, Blue Spring Police Department, CALEA Exemplary Project Submission – Recruit Peer Mentoring Program, (13 December 2004), 2.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

- Interactive where recruitment staff can answer questions…even in real time
- Provide an on-line newsletter
- Phone directory for recruitment staff, chaplains, family support, etc.
- Display links to other law enforcement agencies or related sites

A study entitled, Perceived Fairness in Personnel Selection: Determinants and Outcomes in Different Stages of the Assessment Procedure, found that assessment center feedback content and feedback treatment were main predictors of job attractiveness.[158] Feedback content referred to overall test scores. Feedback treatment referred to giving applicants the opportunity to respond to assessment results, clear justification about how the overall assessment score was established, clearly explain the results and the personalized manner the assessment results were provided to the applicant.

The importance of this study is the aspect of the feedback treatment. In this instance, feedback treatment left the applicant with a stronger degree of job attractiveness. Positive feedback was associated with a more personalized process where the applicant was given a clear understanding of how the overall score was established, the results were clearly explained, and the manner in which the results were delivered by assessment staff. A personalized process leaves an applicant feeling better about the job, even when the results may not be favorable.

Efforts such as these serve to personalize the process, build relationships, improve success, and enhance both recruitment and retention.

EXPOSE RECRUIT'S FAMILY TO LAW ENFORCEMENT CULTURE/FAMILY ORIENTATION

Exposing candidates and family members to the agency can provide a sense of the agency's culture and family orientation. There are a variety of ways to do this, such as:

- Invite families to "Know Your Local Police" at neighborhood meetings
- Develop printed recruitment materials for distribution in various languages
- Stage an Open House for candidates and family members
- Allow family ride-a-long opportunities
- Allow job shadowing (such as watching dispatchers) for family members
- Have family attend an academy orientation
- Schedule department family-oriented meetings where officers, their wives and other family members share their experience and answer questions
- Include family in Swearing-In Ceremony (if not doing so already)

---

[158] Annelies E. M. Van Vianen, Ruben Taris, Eveline Scholten and Sonja Schinkel, "Perceived Fairness in Personnel Selection: Determinants and Outcomes in Different Stages of the Assessment Procedure," International Journal of Selection and Assessment, vol. 12, no. 1/2, (March/June 2004), 156.

- Provide interpretive services at meetings where candidate family members do not speak English

These steps demonstrate the agency's interest in both the candidate and family members.

DEVELOP A REGIONAL RECRUITING CENTER

Another approach is the development of a Regional Recruiting Center (RRC) that would involve different agencies working together out of one centralized location and/or traveling to different locations to collaboratively conduct testing. A regional testing approach reduces the candidates testing time, while expanding the number of employment options.
Factors to consider in setting up a RRC include:

- Identify agencies that may be willing to participate
- Develop representative advisory board and memorandums of understanding
- Establish program goals, budgets and protocols
- Locate space
- Select and train staff
- Develop advertising strategies
- Develop testing strategies that participating agencies can support
- Involve other stakeholders, like citizenry

Laying a solid foundation is important when developing this type of program, especially when working with a variety of agencies, both large and small.

In 1990, POST piloted a Regional Testing Pilot Program in Contra Costa that involved fifteen or more local law enforcement agencies. An advisory group provided input in developing the program. An advertising budget was developed where each agency contributed money to a common fund based on agency size. A brochure was developed that represented the participating agencies. Monthly written testing was conducted at three community colleges in different areas of the county. Test results were distributed to the participating agencies at the same time. In spite of local funding issues in 1992, some agencies are still participating in testing and sharing results.

MILITARY TRANSITION PROGRAM

Men and women leaving the military can be an excellent source of law enforcement candidates. Knowing how to reach qualified military candidates is possible through different programs. Understanding issues facing military candidates is also important.

Here are some ways to reach potential military candidates.

- Attending career fairs on military bases
- Advertising in military publications and on military bases
- Advertising on college campuses
- Local advertising focusing on attracting military veterans
- Connecting with military personnel through programs designed to help them transition back into civilian life

  - Partnership for Youth Success (PaYS Program - www.armypays.com)
  - Army Career and Alumni Program (ACAP - www.acap.army.mil)
  - Military Spouses (www.milspouse.org)
  - Defense Manpower Data Center (http://www.dmdc.osd.mil/ot)
  - Operation Transition (http://www.dmdc.osd.mil/ot/)
  - Department of the Navy (www.staynavy.navy.mil)
  - Department of the Air Force (www.afcrossroads.com/employment)
  - U.S. Marines (www.tampusmc.mil)
  - Department of Defense (http://dod.jobsearch.org)

These sources, and others, can be helpful in reaching military personnel and veterans.

DEVELOPING CANDIDATES THROUGH EARLY OUTREACH

According to the survey of 850 academy recruits, more than half decided they were interested in a career in law enforcement by the time they graduated from high school. The respondents also frequently recommended that agencies reach out to students to inform them about a career in law enforcement and encourage them to avoid activities that could disqualify them. Suggestions included:

- Explorer Programs
- Cadet Programs
- Law Enforcement Magnet Programs
- Regular involvement at youth clubs, such as Boy Scouts, Girl Scouts, Boys and Girl's Clubs
- Participation in junior high and high school career events
- Police Athletic Leagues or other sporting groups
- Church groups
- Colleges, both clubs and career events
- Internships, both high school and college

(According to a recent survey conducted by the National Association of Colleges and Employers it stated in the report, Taping America's Potential, "…organizations feel internships are the most effective means of bringing in new talent."[159]

- Take Your Kids to Work Day
- Establish School Resource Officer Positions who interact with youth on elementary, junior high and high school campuses
- Provide DARE presentations on school campuses

While these are all excellent ideas, an agency should consider which can be sustained over time and that best fits with the agency's culture, staff talent, and interest.

CULTURAL OUTREACH

California is very diverse and becoming more so. Attracting diversity among candidates is a priority for many agencies. As mentioned above, the families of candidates, as well as friends and peers, influence candidates career decisions.

Building relationships with these groups is not only important for recruitment, but also for the broader community policing perspective that they are part of the community. To be effective means partnering with them to address crime and quality of life issues.

Cultural outreach is important in the relationship building process. Identifying groups in the community and their respective leaders is a first step. Seeking to understand each group's culture opens the door to better communication as part of the relationship building process. Attending cultural functions facilitates understanding, as well as demonstrating interest and promoting goodwill.

Over time, relationships can grow. The interaction helps these groups understand their law enforcement agency better. Underlying issues will often come up as communication improves. While an agency may be focused on recruitment, these other issues may need to be addressed as a part of building a relationship and resolving problems.

Cultural outreach is not without challenges. However, confronting and working through these challenges are essential for relationship building. By developing the trust necessary to gain support from community leaders; families and peers are more likely to encourage potential candidates to seek employment in law enforcement.

These different aspects of personalizing the recruitment process are important to recruit qualified candidates and retain them. Determining what the best approach is may take time, but it is worth

---

[159] Partnership for Public Service, Tapping America's Potential: Expanding Student Employment and Internship Opportunities in the Federal Government, 8.

the investment. Some of these options may overlap with other strategies already in place. If so, it may be easy to add recruitment as an additional focus.

Summary of Key Points

The following is a summary of the key points identified in this chapter.

- Comments by respondents who participated in the Recruit Survey yielded a number of responses supporting the need for a more personal approach to recruitment.
- The experience of the San Mateo Police Department and Riverside Sheriff's Department demonstrate that a more personal approach is possible and beneficial.
- Including family members can pay dividends in gaining support for the candidate pursuing a career with an agency.
- Adopting a "customer-friendly" hiring philosophy can lead to a variety of changes that will resonate with potential candidates.
- Mentoring candidates through the hiring, academy and field training program helps with both recruitment and retention
- Early outreach can connect with potential candidates before they begin searching for a career. Internships were identified as one of the best tools for recruitment.

Page intentionally left blank

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

CHAPTER 10

SELECTING THE RIGHT STAFF AND TRAINING THEM AS RECRUITERS

Selecting the right staff to represent the agency is among the most important decisions in establishing an effective Recruitment Unit. It is essential that agency leadership understand the relevance of recruitment to future agency performance and make it an agency priority.

Selecting the right staff as recruiters really starts with the agency head. What is his/her vision for the future in terms of agency goals, especially toward professionalism, diversity, and philosophical mindset? Is the agency service-oriented in the context of community policing or more traditional? Does the agency head understand the importance of recruitment in achieving agency goals? The answer to these questions will contribute to determining the priority recruitment is likely to be given.

The agency head will need to educate other command staff, those responsible for managing the recruitment process and other stakeholders in the criticality of recruitment to achieving the agency's vision and goals. It is important for others in the agency to hear a clear message of support in order to attract and select the best people as recruiters.

Whoever supervises or will supervise the recruitment function should have an updated list of duties and responsibilities for the position of Agency Recruiter. However, the list of duties should have flexibility to allow creativity.

The selection process should be well publicized and articulate the steps involved. Use community members as a resource in recruiting efforts in specific communities, especially related to diversity. Community members have contacts and resources in place that can benefit an agency, along with credibility, versus a recruiter starting from scratch. Identify what skills or characteristics are needed to be successful. Some skills or characteristics to consider include:

- Public speaking ability
- Planning and coordination skills
- Time management
- Professional appearance and conduct
- Flexibility to attend weekend, evening, and perhaps out-of-town events
- Writing skills
- Advertising and/or marketing background
- Leadership ability
- Diversity
- Creativity
- Sales experience
- Other important factors as determined by the agency

If an agency is serious about attracting a diverse pool of candidates, consideration must be given to having diversity on the recruitment team. Members of different ethnic/minority groups and women want to see others who look like them as recruiters. They are often more comfortable in talking with a recruiter they feel can relate to them.

Smaller agencies may not need a full-time recruiter. Other agencies may not be able to have more than one full-time recruiter, yet need more assistance or diversity representation. Consequently, part-time recruiters can play an important role in the recruitment process.

When it is necessary to use a part-time recruiter, ensure this individual has the same skill set as noted above. Whether part-time or not, they still represent the agency and may be the only person with whom a potential candidate comes in contact. The first impression may be the only opportunity an agency has to connect with a potential candidate.

When a selection is made, notify the agency that has been selected. Ask agency staff to be helpful toward the individual and welcome him/her to this important position. Ensure this person is properly introduced to the community leaders and the community, at large, as well as other key stakeholders. Set the stage for the recruiter to be successful.

Once the recruiter(s) have been selected, provide the appropriate training needed to be effective. The skills and knowledge necessary should include:

- Public Speaking
- Diversity Training
- Website Training
- Marketing/Sales Training
- Time Management
- Knowledge of the city/county selection process
- Computer Skills
- Planning
- Military Recruiting Perspective
- Department goals with respect to diversity and other priority areas
- Community versus agency ethnic makeup
- Coaching or mentoring

Debbie Eglin, Master Instructor, developed a course entitled, Strategies for Law Enforcement Recruiting. As a result of her needs assessment, she identified the following topics for recruiters:

- Recruiting
- Marketing
- Presentation
- Retention
- Staffing issues
- Use of grant monies for funding

She identified the following critical and non-critical tasks associated with training law enforcement recruiters:

- Recognize the challenges facing law enforcement recruiters (non-critical)
- Understand why we face these challenges (non-critical)
- Identify current recruiting strategies (non-critical)
- Know how to develop viable and cost-effective strategies aimed at increasing the quantity of law enforcement applicants. (critical)
- Know how to develop viable and cost-effective strategies aimed at increasing the quality of law enforcement applicants. (critical)
- Know how to develop viable and cost-effective strategies aimed at increasing the diversity of law enforcement applicants. (critical)

Over the three day course, the majority of the learning took place through the sharing of ideas and brainstorming by the multi-agency group. The group also participated in a military career fair, which gave class members the opportunity to evaluate each other's booth and handouts. The dialogue, and hands on training was crucial to the course. [160]

It is important for agencies to identify the types of candidates to be recruited, so the agency can make the best choices for recruiters. Once the recruiters are selected, the next step is to train them. Finally, ensuring agency support throughout the process is the key to success.

A limited training needs-assessment was completed by fifty recruiters representing eight agencies as a part of this project. The agencies who participated included: Los Angeles Police and Sheriff Departments, California Highway Patrol, Walnut Creek Police Department, Monterey Sheriff's Department, Santa Ana Police Department, Fresno Police Department, and San Diego Police Department.

The survey asked respondents to rate to what extent they agreed or disagreed that fifteen different recruitment topics were important for recruiters to know. Respondents used a scale of one to seven with one being strongly disagree and seven being strongly agree.

Table 42 shows the average rating each of the sixteen items received. The top five needs for this group, in order of highest ratings received included:

- Making an effective recruitment presentation
- Understanding and improving the selection process
- Developing a recruitment strategic plan
- Developing an advertising plan, including ads
- Selecting and training the right staff as recruits

Comments for Item 16, Other, included understanding retirement plans and having the right management team for support. Two additional comments that were noteworthy addressed time management and making sure recruiters had up-to-date materials and equipment.

---

[160] Debbie Eglin, Strategies for Law Enforcement Recruitment – Instructional Systems Design, Final Project for Master Instructor Development Program, Class 16, No publication date, 3.

TABLE 42. LAW ENFORCEMENT RECRUITMENT NEEDS ASSESSMENT RESULTS – AVERAGE RATINGS

Training Topic	Avg. Rating
Making an effective recruitment presentation	6.6
Understanding and improving the selection process	6.6
Developing a recruitment strategic plan	6.4
Developing an advertising plan, including ads	6.4
Selecting the right staff as recruits and training them	6.4
Tips for using the internet for recruitment	6.3
Engaging employees in assisting with recruitment	6.3
Personalizing the recruitment process	6.1
Tips for improving diversity recruitment	6.1
Scheduling and coordinating pre-employment testing	6.0
Understanding the generations in the workforce	6.0
Getting the most out of career fair events	6.0
Mentoring high potential candidates through the selection process	6.0
Effectively using sales techniques	5.8
Courting candidates and their families	5.3
Other (Please specify in the box below):	6.7

While training is important for recruiters, there appears to be limited training opportunities available. Many agencies send staff to training provided by the National Law Enforcement Recruiter's Association based in Arlington, Virginia. However, most recruiters receive no formal training and learn on-the-job. Some new recruiters are filling a vacancy and have no one to train them.

The California Highway Patrol, for example, has invited military recruiters to provide training to their recruiters. The Sacramento Police Department invited a corporate Fortune 500 recruiter to provide training to recruiters. Agencies may be able to find similar assistance from others in the public or private sectors.

Another approach is to develop in-house training or partner with other agencies in the region to develop and provide training. The training could be as simple as monthly networking sessions where challenges are discussed or a specific topic is addressed by an experienced recruiter.

Without receiving necessary training, new recruiters face a steep learning curve and may never be as productive as they could be with appropriate training. Standard law enforcement training does not address many of the topics recruiters need to be effective.

Selecting and training the right staff as recruiters is important for successful recruitment. However, taking time to evaluate recruitment results is also important. What are the recruiters doing that is yielding the best results? Where could improvements be made? The answers to

questions like these will identify areas of strength and challenges that should be appropriately addressed. This feedback can help recruiters grow professionally and improve results.

Summary of Key Points

The following is a summary of the key points identified in this chapter.

- Recruitment is crucial to both filling positions and impacting the future of the agency for many years. The priority an agency head places on recruitment will have considerable impact on who is selected as a recruiter, as well as how effective they will be.
- In order to be most effective, recruiters need a variety of training in such areas as public speaking, time management, computer skills, diversity, marketing, and coaching/mentoring.
- A few agencies have found creative ways to obtain training for their recruiters through the military and corporate recruiters.
- A limited Recruiter Training Needs Assessment identified making an effective recruitment presentation and understanding and improving the selection process as the two highest priority topics for recruiters.

Page intentionally left blank

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

CHAPTER 11

DEVELOPING AN EMPLOYEE REFERRAL PROGRAM

Surveys of recruiters and new recruits both confirm that employees are one of the best recruitment tools. Employees can be an asset with recruitment for a variety of reasons:

- They know the job and demands.
- They have a vested interest in who are hired, since they may work with the individual.
- They will likely pre-screen candidates, encouraging those who may be a good candidate.
- They may already have a relationship with the potential candidate.
- They may know when the agency is testing, where to go to get an application, and have experience with the selection process.
- They may follow up with candidates and encourage them, or answer questions the individual may have.

Emayeneme Gbemiye-Etta in her article, Employee Referral Programs, adds cost-effectiveness, high quality candidates, and longer tenure for candidates recruited by employees to this list.[161]

Consider also that there are more employees in an agency than there are recruiters. Employees are, in effect, a force-multiplier when it comes to recruitment.

Dave Lefkow in his article, Improving Your Employee Referral Program and Justifying Your Investment identifies several barriers to an effective employee recruitment program.[162] They include:

- Lack of communication – Initial and ongoing communication with employees about recruitment and encouraging them to help is important. However, the reality check is whether or not an employee knows about the program and can cite key elements.
- Lack of tracking – Ongoing tracking of how many people are referred, by whom, and whether or not the individuals are hired is important.
- Administrative burden – When employees do refer candidates someone must track and follow up on the referrals. Unless there is an adequate method and staff to do this follow up, the burden of processing referrals can bog the system down and undermine its success.

---

[161] Emayeneme Gbemiye-Etta, Employee Referral Programs, International Public Management Association for Human Resources Website, http://www.impa-hr.org/index.cfm?navid=83&id=3347&tcode=nws3 (last viewed: December 14, 2005).
[162] Dave Lefkow, Improving Your Employee Referral Program and Justifying Your Investment, Electronic Recruiting Exchange Website, http://www.erexchange.com/articles/db/69A437E7CFB744F38D06B4B74124D8FA.asp (last viewed: December 12, 2005).

He also believes that successful employee referral programs have the potential to generate 50-75% of an organization's hires. Successful programs, he says, establish measurable goals up front, automate the program without losing a personal touch, do not just focus on cash and start with an initial kick-off, but have a plan for ongoing promotion to keep awareness high.[163]

Employees who are informed and encouraged to address strategic issues facing an agency are generally more satisfied. On the other hand, discontented employees can work against recruitment efforts. Further, discontentment fuels attrition, adding to the recruitment challenge.

Agencies that do not recognize the importance of involving employees in the recruitment process may fail to provide the information and materials pertaining to the process. Without this information, an employee has to do their own search. Some may go to that extent; however, many will not.

The crux of the question then is, "How can agencies be proactive in involving employees in recruitment?"   This occurs on three different levels, each level more progressive than the previous one.

LEVEL ONE - AWARENESS

The first step is raising the awareness of the recruitment issue facing an agency. Let employees know what the challenges are and the importance of employee assistance for the agency.

Mount a marketing campaign for employees. Get the word out multiple times using different mediums to connect with the different learning styles in the workplace. Be sure the Chief of Police and/or Sheriff is outspoken in his support of both the need to recruit and the important role that employees play.

Depending on the size of the agency, conduct one or more employee focus groups to obtain input on structuring and marketing the program to employees. Employee input in the structuring is valuable for several reasons.

- First, it is the employees that are the key to making the program successful.
- Second, those who participate are more likely to be advocates of the program and help promote it in the areas they work.
- Third, employees often know the best places, times, and people to enhance program effectiveness.
- Fourth, these individuals can become part of an ongoing working committee to provide feedback and ideas on an on-going basis.

---

[163] Lefkow, 2.

- Finally, involving employees in the process contributes to developing a culture of valuing employees and engagement, which bolsters retention and ultimately helps with recruitment.

Provide a fact sheet that employees can use that summarizes key information, such as the number of vacancies, testing dates and locations, telephone numbers to call for additional information, and location applications must be submitted. Review this information during briefings with officers and small group discussions in other work areas. Ensure that all employees working at public windows are included and informed

In addition to raising employee awareness, provide materials for employees to pass out to potential candidates. Get this information literally into the hands of employees. Put additional copies of the handouts in areas that employees regularly visit. Update and restock supply on a regular basis.

Use employees in the advertising campaign wherever possible. Engage employees in doing short vignettes sharing personal reasons about what was attractive about working for the agency and what aspects were most enjoyable about the career. This can even be included in printed materials which helps create interest and support. This kind of personal information is great marketing information that will resonate with potential candidates, especially when involving women and minorities as part of an agency's diversity outreach.

Develop a Speaker's Recruitment Kit for anyone going out into the community to speak. The kit should include the following kind of items:

- Current fact sheet
- Up-to-date recruitment flyers that include who to call for more information
- Items with recruitment advertising messages, such as pencils, key chains, etc.
- Interest list where anyone can provide contact information for a recruiter to follow up

When an employee does refer a candidate, express appreciation and let the employee's supervisor know. Advise employees what limitations exist as to what information can be released or made available to them.

Consider writing formal Letters of Appreciation when an employee refers a candidate who is hired and invite referring employees to the Swearing-In Ceremony.

Look for other avenues to recognize an employee's assistance and raise awareness of the recruitment challenge. The Sacramento Sheriff's Department, for example, includes current issues during the promotional process. One such issue has been recruitment. Employees competing for promotion address strategies the department could take to improve recruitment. The Los Angeles Police Department prints brief recruitment information on business cards.

These actions help to raise employee awareness and engage one of the best recruitment tools an agency has. Promotional incentives can take this to the next level.

LEVEL TWO – PROMOTIONAL INCENTIVES

As a part of raising employee awareness and participation, consider adding promotional incentives. The addition of incentives underscores the agency's desire to engage employees in the recruitment process. The idea pertains to offering incentives that include items other than monetary, vacation or compensatory time off. It is not always about cash.

Who will be eligible for incentives? Are only agency employees included in the program, or will the program apply to employees of other city or county departments? How about community members who refer candidates? This is especially important in a Level Three program where money is available.

In order to do this, the agency needs some way to track referrals. Typically, the candidate provides the name of an employee who referred them to the agency on the application or through some other process. Another alternative is to have the employee submit paperwork after the candidate has applied, confirming the referral.

The next consideration is the incentive. The incentive should be something that employees would want. The larger and more expensive the item, the more interest the promotional incentive will generate.

One avenue is to limit the incentive to donations from businesses, corporations or other similar sources. For example, a weekend get-away including hotel, dinner, and entertainment passes could be obtained by donation, and could make a great Grand Prize. Getting businesses to donate other items adds to the incentive and ensures that there are multiple prizes available.

The drawback, however, is the time required to contact companies and ask for the donation. Further, there may be ethical issues in accepting donations from some businesses.

Another avenue is for the department to purchase a number of items that will be the incentive for that recruitment cycle. Getting approval for doing so may include addressing local policy pertaining to what may be considered a "gift of funds." Addressing legal issues is also important.

The final consideration is the rules for participation. How will these prizes be awarded? Will it be based on confirmed referrals? Could each referral result in earning a ticket for a drawing at some point? Could everyone who referred employees be invited to a special dinner or other event?

Whatever criteria are used should be thought out in advance. Where appropriate, obtain legal input to avoid conflicts with local policy and other laws. Obtain the appropriate approval before implementing incentives.

Increasingly, agencies are taking employee referral programs to the next level where a monetary or time off provision is included.

LEVEL THREE – PAID REFERRAL INCENTIVES

The inclusion of monetary or time off provisions in the form of additional vacation or compensatory time off (CTO) is becoming more popular. The incentives can range from a $50 to $1,000 stipend or up to two weeks additional vacation.

At a recent speaking engagement, a group of some sixty attendees were queried as to whether any represented agencies had an Employee Referral Program and, if so, what incentive was provided. One agency acknowledged giving an employee who referred a candidate that was hired an additional two weeks of paid vacation. Two other agencies acknowledged allowing one-week of paid vacation for hired referrals. The low end was a $50 stipend paid for a referral that was hired.

An article in the King County Journal reported that, due to staffing shortages, the King County Sheriff's Department has started "…offering a week's paid vacation if they recruit a deputy." The recruit has to successfully complete the academy and field training program in order for an employee to earn the vacation.[164]

How does one decide what is an appropriate amount to offer? Consider what it costs for each candidate that applies. For example, if an agency spends $10,000 to run a series of advertisements in the newspaper over the period of a month and 20 people apply as a result of the ads, then the advertising cost per candidate is $500.

On a larger scale, each recruitment cycle may involve sending officers to multiple job fairs, advertising in newspapers, radio and/or television, placing ads on internet sites, developing and printing brochures, etc. These efforts will attract a number of candidates to apply. Add all these costs, including the hourly rate for officers and divide by the number who applied as a result of these efforts. Do not include those candidates who applied as a result of other outreach programs, such as employee referral. The end result is a more accurate cost per candidate. With this information in mind, an agency can articulate a rational for offering a monetary incentive equal to or less than the identified amount.

Another avenue is to survey other agencies to establish a benchmark on what is available in other programs. One study by the Society for Human Resource Managers found that employee referral programs cost companies approximately $1,000 in incentives and rewards for exempt employees and about half of that for nonexempt employees.[165]

Using one or both of these approaches will provide the information necessary to identify an appropriate amount and support that recommendation during the approval process.

Once the incentive is determined, an agency must estimate the number of referrals in order to calculate how much money might be needed to support the program. This step is essential, so

---

[164] Jamie Swift, "Sheriff Offers Bonus to Bring in New Deputies," King County Journal, (Bellevue, Washington, 12 December 2005).
[165] Emayeneme Gbemiye-Etta.

that adequate money is budgeted. Consider the number of vacancies to be filled, past statistics involving employee referrals, and other in place strategies. If an agency has offered incentives in the past, what numbers of candidates were referred by employees? Estimate the number of potential referrals and multiply that by the incentive to be paid. The result is a budget estimate. There may be other costs to include, such as developing an employee referral process and brochures.

Now that an employee referral program budget is determined, steps must be taken to fund the program. Depending on the jurisdiction, some agencies will need to find the money within an existing budget, others may need to be augmented by the city council, or the money may be part of the HR/Personnel budget in another city or county department.

As with Level Two above, structuring the program, seeking legal advice and obtaining approval are essential. Additionally, as with Level One, marketing the program to employees is critical. The ideas suggested previously apply here, as well: make the program easy to understand and participate in is important to gaining employee buy-in.

Two examples of agencies that provide a paid incentive include the Riverside Sheriff's Department and the Ventura Sheriff's Department. Table 43 provides a summary of the amount each agency pays, under what conditions, and other details.

TABLE 43. PAID INCENTIVE PROGRAMS

Agency	Amount Paid	Conditions	Notes
Riverside Sheriff's Dept.	1% of maximum salary step, $300 min.	Payable when referred employee is hired and completes 90 days of employment.	Applies to positions deemed "Difficult to Recruit."
Ventura Sheriff's Dept.	$1,000 for deputies and dispatchers	Maximum $5,000 per year per employee, some employees are not eligible, employees not eligible for referring family member.	Sunset clause cancels program in 2007

Agencies interested in adopting paid incentives will need to obtain local approval. Governing law pertaining to police and sheriff departments may be different. Obtaining legal counsel in the process is advisable.

Once the program has been approved and implemented, it is important to monitor and evaluate the program. Some questions to consider include:

- How many referrals occur each month?

- Are employees experiencing problems with the program?
- Is the ongoing promotion working to increase referrals?
- How many employee referrals are successful through each phase of the testing and selection process?
- How many referred candidates are hired, graduate the academy, and complete field training?
- How much in employee referral funds are actually spent?
- How can the program be improved?

The answers to these types of questions will provide information that may result in the need to modify the program over time, increase incentives, modify other strategies, or take other action. This information will also help in conducting a cost comparison with other strategies and generally evaluate the effectiveness of the program.

Summary of Key Points

The following is a summary of the key points identified in this chapter.

- Employees can be an asset as recruiters, because they know first-hand about the career and what kind of individual fits within the agency's culture. They may know the individual and can encourage the candidate through the process, adding a personal aspect for the candidate, as well as provide coaching.
- Employee referral programs are cost-effective and can provide great results.
- Barriers to an effective employee program include lack of communication, lack of training, and administrative burden.
- Three levels of employee referral programs are presented. Level One involves raising awareness and soliciting employee assistance with recruitment. Level Two adds promotional incentives. Level Three adds paid referral incentives. Suggestions are offered for consideration at each level.

Page intentionally left blank

CHAPTER 12

<u>CREATING WORKER FRIENDLY POLICIES</u>

Subject matter experts and articles pertaining to recruitment and retention address the importance of reviewing agency policy to ensure they are employee friendly. Doing so is an important step to creating a work environment that is both attractive to potential employees and meets the needs of existing employees.

Other reasons for taking time to do this include:

- Ensure that existing policy meets current laws, such as the Family Medical Leave Act.
- Ensure agency policy is consistent with industry standards.
- Identify potential areas that can be improved.

The discussion of worker friendly versus employer friendly policies is an issue that has been around for some time, likely starting in large measure with the Industrial Age as workers left farms and rural areas to work in factories. The evolution over time has been from employer friendly policies toward worker friendly policies.

According to an article entitled, <u>Reducing Turnover</u>, "Employees" top career concern in the new millennium involves balancing family and work demands - even above job security and earning a competitive salary - according to research commissioned by Robert Half International, Inc. Increasingly, employees are asking for corporate programs that reflect a more flexible business environment."[166] As employment options increase, workers will be attracted to those opportunities that reflect values and work environments that meet their needs.

While new millennial-worker values may be different than their parents, another factor is that, "By the year 2005, fifty-seven percent of all new entrants into the workforce and almost fifty percent of that workforce will be women."[167] Further, a high number of couples are both employed full-time. With working mothers and dual income families increasing, stressors mount with trying to care for children and, in some cases, aging parents.

Some employers are becoming very creative to address worker interests. The following example of worker friendly policies come from Google, a company in the private sector. While this may

---

[166] Institute of Management Accountants Website, <u>Reducing Turnover</u>, http://www.imanet.org/ima/rhi/ReducingTurnover.asp, (Last viewed, 13 December 2005).
[167] Diane E. Schmidt and Gilbert Duenas, "Incentives to encourage worker-friendly organizations," Public Personnel Management, Fall 2002, http://www.findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_qa3779/is_200210/ai_n9085336 , (Last viewed, 15 December 2005).

not be possible for public sector agencies, realize that Google represents the competition, especially if you are located in the Silicon Valley region.

A partial list of Google's "I bet you don't have that where you work" benefits include:

- Flex hours for nearly every professional employee
- Casual dress everyday (and this goes well beyond business casual)
- Employees can bring their dogs to work, everyday
- On-site physician
- On-site dental care
- Health benefits that begin as soon as an employee reports for work
- Free massage and yoga
- Shoreline running trails
- Stock options everywhere
- Free drinks and snacks everywhere (espresso, smoothies, red bull, health drinks, kombucha tea, you name it)
- Free meals, including breakfast, lunch and dinner (some have described this as a feast with multiple locations and world-class chefs, including one that cooked for the Grateful Dead)
- Three weeks vacation during the first year
- Free recreation everywhere, including video games, foosball, volleyball, and pool tables
- Valet parking for employees
- Onsite car wash and detailing
- Maternity and parental leave (plus new moms and dads are able to expense up to $500 for take-out meals during the first four weeks that they are home with their new baby)
- Employee referral bonus program
- Near site child care center
- Back-up child care for parents when their regularly scheduled child care falls through
- Free shuttle service to several San Francisco and East and South Bay locations (San Francisco is 45 miles away from the main campus)
- Fuel efficiency vehicle incentive program ($5,000 assistance if you buy a hybrid)
- Onsite dry cleaning, plus a coin-free laundry room
- A Friday TGIF all-employee gathering where the founders frequently speak
- A 401k investment program
- A "no tracking of sick days" policy
- Employee interest groups (formed by Google employees, these are all over the map and are said to include Buffy fans, cricketers, Nobel prize winners, and a wine club)
- An onsite gym to work off all of the snacks

Note: These benefits are not all available to employees who do not work on Google's Silicon Valley main campus.[168]

---

[168] Dr. John Sullivan, A Case Study of Google Recruiting…Can any firm compete against this recruiting machine?, Electronic Recruiting Exchange Website, http://www.erexchange.com/articles/db/06465389A59D4E0FAA6F0EFFD4A78126.asp, 5 December 2005 (Last viewed: 14 December 2005).

While the Google example may be rare in its totality, increasingly companies are rethinking worker policies, especially as competition heats up. Many agencies are taking steps to address policies making them more worker friendly.

Workplace flexibility is a key aspect of worker friendly policies, especially for working mothers and can take different forms such as:

- Scheduled flexibility – Allows workers to set or alter their day-to-day schedule
- Unanticipated leave – Allow workers to take leave for personal reasons, such as attending a parent-teacher meeting
- Anticipated paid leave – Gives time off for vacation, longer-term illnesses, and family care-giving
- Work location – Offers flexibility in the location of work, allowing employees to telecommute
- Career flexibility – Offers workers the chance to move in and out of the labor market, as necessary, to balance their work and family life[169]

A survey of over 10,000 people in thirteen countries found that 37% said they'd leave for more flexible working hours.[170] This underscores the importance of flexible work hours.

Other examples include: child care, elder care, compressed work schedule, and employee assistance programs.[171] Diane E. Schmidt and Gilbert Duenas in their article, Incentives to Encourage Worker-Friendly Organizations, identify four levels an agency can pursue in addressing child care programs. They include providing information to employees about facilities in the area, reducing costs by securing discounts for employees, setting up an on-site facility, and providing a site that includes not only pre-school, but K-12, as well.[172] They also articulate similar levels for addressing elder care needs.

Which of these are important for an agency to consider? The answer is, "It depends." Steps to identifying which areas an agency should consider include:

- Identify what employee related policies are already in place
- Determine if what is currently in place is meeting employee needs and, if not, what would meet their needs
- Conduct research to see what other government agencies and other key private sector employers in the area provide

---

[169] Heather Boushey, Family-Friendly Policies: Boosting Mothers' Wages, Center for Economic Policy Research, Washington: D.C., 6 April 2005, http://www.cepr.net/publications/labor_markets_2005_04_06.pdf , (Last viewed: 15 December 2005), 2.
[170] Jonathan Kramer, "Retention: Keeping the Best and Brightest", Business Psychology News – Volume 99.1, http://www.businesspsychologist.com/bpnews201.html, c. 2002, (Last viewed: 15 December 2005).
[171] Schmidt, 7.
[172] Schmidt, 8.

Once this information is collected, an agency is in a much better position to determine what steps can be taken and which to address through employee bargaining units as a part of benefit negotiations.

Flexibility in the workplace is also important. A study of 129 firms with up to 5,000 employees by Ceridian Employer Services, found the most important perk to attract, reward, and retain was casual dress.[173] Other perks getting high marks were flextime, personal development (coaching, classes), entertainment and discounts, food and drinks, and telecommuting.

Creating worker friendly policies is dependant on leadership in an organization. Leaders set the tone of the organization by formal and informal policy, personal actions, what is rewarded or disciplined, promotions, communication and much more.

The Santa Cruz Consolidated Emergency Communications Center (SCCECC) was established in 1996 and provides dispatch services to four law enforcement agencies, nine fire districts and the county-wide ambulance provider. They have a staff of 55 employees of which 42 are dispatchers.

According to Rosanna McKinney, Training Supervisor, SCCECC has a 1% annual turnover rate, compared to an industry rate of 17% as cited by The Association of Public-Safety Communications Officials, International.[174] This amazing retention rate was the result of leadership committed to quality improvement and a willingness to try different approaches to deliver better results.

Rosanna McKinney recommended beginning by focusing on two things – selection and training of new staff and organizational processes. As SCCECC started this effort several years ago, managers began calling candidates who were not successful in the recruitment process and asking questions to identify potential issues. One of the primary issues was the length and complexity of the process. As a result, efforts were made to combine phases of the process, eliminate unnecessary ones and improve communications with candidates. As a result, the time required to complete a selection process was cut in half from six months to three.

One interesting aspect of this new process was including line dispatchers. Top candidates spend time with a Peer Review Panel, which is comprised of line dispatchers. The focus of this process is to get dispatcher feedback into whether the candidate is someone the dispatchers would want to spend a shift with as working partners. Another panel of dispatch supervisors also meets with the top candidates. The input of these two panels is provided to the manager who considers it along with background information and makes the final decision.

---

[173] Jonathan Kramer, "Perks for Hiring and Retention," Business Psychology News, vol. 2001.1, http://www.businesspsychologist.com/bpnews701.html, (Last viewed: 22 December 2005).

[174] Mary Jean Taylor, Veronica Gardner, Phil Clark and Barbara McCombs, Effective Practices Guide and Staffing Workbook, (Colorado: University of Denver Research Institute, Funded by DOJ/National Institute of Justice, August 2005), 41.

Another aspect of this program is the focus of training. Instead of a focus of washing out new hires during the academy or training program, it has shifted to trying to ensure the candidates success. Both the academy and training officers try to help candidates be successful. The mindset shift went from what could be described as adversarial to mentoring or coaching oriented.

The training academy was also broken into two phases. In between the two phases, new staff worked at mastering skills learned in phase one of the academy before moving on to the second phase of training. This shift in the training approach helped with the retention of information giving confidence to new hires before moving on to more challenging aspects in the program.

In terms of organization process, SCCECC listened to employees. Staffing assignments were previously based on seniority, which meant that senior staff was on days and junior staff was on nights, which was a real detractor for recruiting new staff. By implementing a rotating schedule all staff could be assured they would be assigned to days and nights over the course of a year.

Allowing dispatchers to participate in the interviews of candidates communicated a sense of value to the dispatchers and supervisors. But their involvement does not stop here. Management includes dispatchers in staff meetings, strategic planning, and other facets of organizational life that affect them. Management also looks for opportunities to allow dispatchers to get involved in projects that will give them a break from the normal routine and broaden their perspective in areas such as administration and technical support. Decisions in staff meetings are made by consensus, ensuring buy-in at all levels.

Supervisors are encouraged to acknowledge good behavior. Each supervisor has coupons that provide for an extra 15 minute break. Not using any sick leave during the year earns the employee an extra day off.

Organizationally, there is a strong focus on customer service, the quality of work, and teamwork. Recognizing that quality assurance process is typically difficult for employees to accept, a creative approach to this has been taken as well. Quality improvement is documented in the form of "Dispatcher Olympics." The results are posted monthly with rewards to both teams and individuals. The team award is typically a $30 Starbucks card and the supervisor must pick up and deliver their order. Individual rewards include selecting from a box of items gathered for this purpose. These items may include bags obtained at various conferences, travel/safety mugs, locker shelves, key chains, and items purchased from 9-1-1 Cares (www.911cares.com).

These steps have resulted in a worker friendly environment where staff feels valued and involved. The result is great retention and a happy workforce.[175]

A group of participants addressed this issue at the 2005 Recruitment and Retention Symposium hosted by POST. Below is a list of leadership related considerations for creating worker friendly policies.

- Team building activities to build relationships and create a sense of team spirit

---

[175] Rosanna McKinney, Telephone Interview, 12 January 2006.

- Provide leadership mentors for supervisors
- Promote continuing professional development for all staff
- Require managers to work patrol periodically and help with the work
- Create policy requiring consistent and frequent staff reports, including face-to-face dialogue, and making them available to all staff
- Bring in motivational speakers to address leadership and promote workplace development
- Support a "Book Club" Forum to facilitate staff growth and discussion
- Promote empowerment through
    - Town Hall Meetings
    - Seeking honest feedback on how to improve the workplace
    - Holding staff, at all levels, accountable
- Conduct employee satisfaction surveys to identify issues that need to be addressed and address them
- Promote physical and emotional well being of staff through
    - Employee Assistance Programs
    - Critical incident counseling
    - Physical presence when staff are injured or facing personal/family difficulties

Creating worker friendly policies relates to what goes on in the workplace. It is both formal and informal. It involves the actions of those in leadership. One might say it is a perspective about the importance of workers in an agency. It has much to do with organizational culture, which is a by-product of many of the things discussed in this section. However, one thing is certain - as competition for workers intensifies those agencies who have a worker-friendly environment will present a more attractive work environment to prospective candidates.

Key Points - Summary

The following is a summary of the key points identified in this chapter.

- Workers entering the workforce value work-family balance.
- More women than men are entering the workforce, as they do they will be looking for work environments that are family friendly.
- Workplace flexibility is an important consideration for many workers and may take the form of scheduling (start/end time) flexibility, unanticipated and anticipated paid leave, work location, compressed work schedule, and career flexibility.
- The Santa Cruz Consolidated Emergency Communication Center has enjoyed a 1% turnover in an industry with a national average attrition rate of 17%. Their success is attributed to leadership's commitment to quality improvement and a willingness to try different approaches to deliver better results. They value employees by listening to them, engaging them in planning and decision-making, and are creative in recognizing good behavior. They also have looked for ways to enhance employee skills by allowing special projects that give the employee exposure and experience in areas outside their normal job description.
- Creating a worker friendly environment starts with a leadership perspective that values employees. Identifying and addressing issues in the workplace that employees find problematic is an excellent place to begin.

Page intentionally left blank

CHAPTER 13

IMPROVING SUPERVISION AND MANAGEMENT

The subject matter experts identified supervisors and managers as one of the most important considerations to improve retention. After an agency has expended considerable time and resources to hire qualified staff, it can be demoralizing to an agency to have these employees leave early in their careers.

One of the experts anonymously said, "People do not quit organization, they quit supervisors." However, that statement is not without merit. The following statement is from a recent study entitled, Staffing and Retention in Public Safety Communication Centers:

> A study of retention in human resources organization reported that the most important factor affecting employee decision to leave or stay was the quality of their relationship with a supervisor or manager. [176]

Researchers have identified the following reasons why employees leave:

- Bad management practices
- How people are treated on the job
- Poor communication
- Need for more challenging or exciting work
- Need for more opportunities to grow and learn
- Lack of recognition or rewards for good performance
- Insufficient control over their jobs and life
- Not feeling that their work matters.[177]

The study of emergency communication centers linked the following factors to turnover nationally: adequacy of training; methods for managing workload and schedules; opportunities for career advancement; respect from administrators; organizational recognition; workloads and staffing levels; clarity of roles; and participation in decision making.[178]

Another study conducted by the Families and Work Institute concluded that "Employees who have immediate supervisors/managers who are more open to and supportive of the needs they

---

[176] Mary Jean Taylor, Veronica Gardner, Phil Clark and Barbara McCombs, Staffing and Retention in Public Safety Communication Center – Effective Practices Guide and Staffing Workbook, (University of Denver Research Institute, August 2005), 45.
[177] Ibid.
[178] Ibid.

have in their personal and family lives are more likely to plan to stay with their current employer."[179]

As noted previously, the book, 7 Reasons Why Employees Leave, identified the following types of reasons for employees leaving: unmet job expectations, poor job fit, lack of coaching and feedback on performance, lack of professional development and promotional opportunities, not feeling valued or recognized, workplace stress due to job demands and work-life balance conflict, and lack of trust and belief in senior leadership.[180]

A common theme in these sources is the failure of supervisors or managers to successfully create an environment that meets the needs of employees. Hyrum Smith, creator of the Franklin Day Planner and author of the Franklin Reality Model, writes that all of us have a need to live, love and be loved, feel important, and experience variety.[181] People will behave in ways, both healthy and unhealthy, to attempt to get their needs met. That includes leaving one employer for another.

Improving skills in supervision, management, and leadership was strongly recommended. The following skills are examples of those as important to improving a supervisor or manager's relationship with employees.

- Management by walking around
- Employing a coaching model with employees
- Recognizing good performance – both small and big
- Being personable
- Treating people with dignity and respect
- Helping people see their value to the organization
- Employing good listening skills
- Keeping employees informed
- Promoting employee participation in decision-making and other decisions impacting their work environment
- Supporting empowerment within acceptable limits

While these concepts are straight-forward, many supervisors and managers miss the mark and unknowingly contribute to retention problems. The encouraging aspect of this is that supervisors and managers can, if they choose, behave in ways that can help change this.

A group of participants at the 2005 Recruitment and Retention Symposium suggested a number of ideas to improve supervisory and management practices. The participants represented line officers, first line and management, administration, and human resources.

---

[179] Families and Work Institute, Highlights of the National study of the Changing Workforce. No.3, (New York, NY: Families and Work Institute, 2002): 35, http://wfnetwork.bc.edu/statistics_template.php?id=831, (Last viewed, 9 January 2006).
[180] Branham, 29.
[181] Hyrum W. Smith, The 10 Natural Laws of Successful Time and Life Management, (New York: Warner Books, 1994), 133.

The old adage, "Begin with the end in mind," has relevance in developing good supervisors and managers. Good supervisors and managers begin with hiring the right people who exhibit leadership potential or already possess leadership skills and/or experience.

Developing good supervisors and managers is divided into five stages and include: the Application Stage, New Recruit Trainee Stage, Officer Stage, Supervisory Stage, and Manager Stage. The five stages are followed by practical ideas for supporting supervisory and/or management growth.

APPLICATION STAGE

It is imperative to invest in future leaders early and consistently. In terms of applicants, leadership skills need to be in the forefront. Be alert for applicants with demonstrated leadership abilities. Often, there are candidates who are looking for a career change who have supervisory and management experience from the military, government, or private sector. Also watch for candidates who have the potential to be developed into leaders.

Consider asking one or more questions during the interview that address leadership experience. An assessment instrument that would measure emotional intelligence skills (emphatic skills, ability to recognize attributes in others, etc.) is one approach to help identify emotional maturity. Another option is to include practical exercises allowing evaluators to observe those behavioral and emotional skills possessed by the candidates which would help select candidates who have good leadership qualities.

NEW RECRUIT TRAINEE STAGE

Leadership activities should be purposely included during the academy experience that ensures integrity, decision-making, problem-solving and critical thinking. Agency mentors should be available to trainees to encourage effective leadership skills. Recruits could be encouraged to be platoon leaders, squad leaders, class president, or other similar activities that promote leadership growth.

The use of field exercises that help develop leadership skills in new officers is encouraged. Following Field Training, opportunities could be provided where new officers might have an opportunity to take on leadership roles in appropriate assignments. Early in a new officer's career, consider mentoring and/or career planning to encourage staff to prepare for future leadership roles as part of an agency's succession planning.

OFFICER STAGE

There should also be leadership development opportunities for officers. Ideas include:

- Promoting "teach-back" opportunities where officers teach their peers important information they gleaned at outside training they attended.
- An atmosphere for open and constructive feedback, as well as timely evaluation.
- Encourage officers to look for ancillary opportunities as committee chairs or similar experiences that promote leadership growth.
- Promote personal responsibility and accountability.
- Send officers to leadership programs to develop them before promotion.

  The Los Angeles Sheriff's Department, for example, has developed the Deputy Leadership Institute (DLI). This program is modeled after the Supervisory Leadership Institute. "The purpose of the Deputy Leadership Institute is to develop and enhance the leadership qualities of all members of the Los Angeles County Sheriff's Department."[182]

- Add a leadership component to the evaluation process. In law enforcement, there are many opportunities to exhibit leadership characteristics on the street and in the office. Including leadership as part of the evaluation process underscores the importance of leadership in the organization and helps identify and record leadership accomplishments. The old adage, "What gets measured gets done," also applies to leadership.
- Recognize and reward good leadership behaviors. This involves aligning rewards and recognition to promote identifying good leadership behavior and appropriately recognizing it.

SUPERVISOR STAGE

Good supervision starts by selecting the best supervisory candidates. Assessment centers are one approach. If it is an external process it should include internal input. Part of the process might include a shadow phase with a senior sergeant following the aspiring sergeant through the process. It was also felt that Human Resources would be the ideal vehicle to dispense the written test to ensure objectivity in scoring.

Another process that has improved supervisory and management selection is the use of a promotability process, which is designed to identify candidates with demonstrated leadership experience. The Sacramento Sheriff's Department, for example, has for many years included a

---

[182] Los Angeles County Sheriff's Department, Deputy Leadership Institute Curriculum, provided by personal e-mail by Lt. Gilbert Aguilar on 9 January 2006.

promotability process that requires the candidate to provide examples of various aspects of leadership experience, such as coordination, motivation, and ethics. Each example is reviewed by a supervisor or manager who is knowledgeable about the event. An internal panel rates the examples. This rating contributes to the candidate's final rating and position on the promotional list.

The new supervisor should be given clear expectations of the job. A manual with a check-off list should be developed to ensure that all areas of supervision are learned. The Field Training Officer format could be used to address supervisory responsibilities. Shift, assignment rotation and cross-training should occur for all sergeants. There should be a system to affirm that all skill sets necessary for the job have been learned. Training overlap might be a method of making certain this occurs.

Consider establishing a mentoring program for new supervisors that promotes a people-centered approach designed to help a supervisor develop personal, yet professional relationships with staff. These will create an environment that meets the employee's needs, especially the need for the feeling of importance and to experience variety…as suggested above by Hyrum Smith.

Evaluations are an important process for identifying a supervisor's strengths, as well as growth areas. Evaluations must be honest, consistent, timely and have an accountability component to facilitate professional development.

In terms of training, agencies must meet the POST standards for training supervisors in a timely manner (80 hour facilitated course) and to continue to increase the job skills and efficiency through continuous mentoring and through the use of diverse leadership styles matched to the needs of those supervised.

Consider implementing "360 Evaluations". This type of evaluation allows subordinates, peers, and supervisors to evaluate an individual's performance. As a part of the process, the individual also evaluates himself/herself. Ratings of subordinates, peers, and superiors are compared with those of the individual. Discrepancies in the rating are identified. Growth areas are identified. The process is most beneficial when combined with setting performance goals for the individual. Progress is reviewed to facilitate growth.

It would be helpful after three to five years as a sergeant to take a 40-hour supervisory seminar designed for supervisors to update their leadership skills and to review current and emerging legal issues and trends. While POST does not currently mandate this type of training, it would be beneficial. Topics in the training should minimally include:

- How to prepare and give performance evaluations
- Establish performance improvement plans
- Provide an update on legal issues
- Address contemporary leadership styles and skill sets
- Provide information or activities aimed at improving communication skills

Programs such as the Sherman Block Supervisory Leadership Institute promote individual and professional growth in supervisors. The curriculum takes students through an analysis of management (planning, organizing, directing, etc.) and leadership (inspiring, challenging, developing, etc.) and how each discipline compliments the other. The course progresses from self-evaluation, to interpersonal evaluation, to organizational relationships over the eight 24-hour sessions.

During the program, a typical successful student develops the ability to:

- Correlate the relationship between personal and organizational principles and values
- Exercise greater leadership in personal and professional activities
- Increase personal influence with individuals and groups to accomplish organizational goals
- Analyze issues from multiple perspectives
- Develop increased self-confidence and confidence in the ability of others
- Provide support and development for peers and subordinates
- Recognize and address areas for personal improvement
- Effectively integrate management skills and leadership qualities[183]

Career planning updates should be reviewed and changed where necessary. Job shadowing should be provided when appropriate and desired. Those who demonstrate initiative and leadership skills should be encouraged to apply for projects or positions with leadership opportunities and challenges. Most of all, agencies should prepare their staff to take promotional tests, so they can look forward to a testing process that is not only familiar to them, but can offer them a possible successful outcome.

MANAGER STAGE

Much of what has already been covered relative to supervisors applies to those entering the management ranks. Promoting of the most qualified, mentoring new managers, providing relevant training, ensuring substantive evaluations, offering career counseling and growth opportunities will help managers to get off to a good start and prepare them for the challenges that lie ahead.

---

[183] Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training, Sherman Block Supervisory Leadership Institute, POST Website: http://www.post.ca.gov/training/sbsli/default.asp, (Last viewed: 12 January 2006).

PRACTICAL IDEAS

The list below has examples of practical ways to help supervisors and managers improve the work environment in ways that help meet employee needs.

- Send supervisors to training where they could learn to bring fun into the workplace.
- Develop an instrument to find out both the officers' and supervisors' perceptions of each others' jobs.
- Allow officers to spend time in a sergeant's position as an acting supervisor.
- Conduct agency-wide town meetings where all ideas would be heard with no negative repercussions.
- Learn about what motivates the newer generation.
- Provide more training on innovative and proactive leadership.
- Regularly send staff to outside training to provide the opportunity for networking and exposure to different ideas.
- Rotate and cross-train supervisors.
- Give line officers a voice at staff meetings.
- Include line officers in annual goal-setting planning sessions.
- Provide job shadowing opportunities.
- Allow for the "fail forward" (learning from mistakes) culture in the workplace.
- Develop ways of building and cultivating trust and confidence in the organization by discussing what behaviors demonstrate agency values.
- Place sergeants in the positions that build on their strengths.
- Catch people doing the right thing and provide positive reinforcement.
- Cultivate a regular exchange of ideas between line officer, staff, supervisors, and managers to foster a more inclusive attitude.
- Conduct team building activities.
- Apply the problem-based learning approach to implement new projects and manage existing ones.
- Conduct exit interviews to ascertain the reasons(s) staff leaves.
- Conduct an employee satisfaction survey to find out what is, and is not, going well.
- Develop a mentoring program for supervisors and managers.
- Make leadership material available for staff to read.
- Consider a Leadership Book Club where agency employees read contemporary leadership material, discuss key concepts and discuss how to apply those concepts to improving the organization.
- Facilitate agency and city/county management buy-in to support innovative contemporary management and supervisory training that would be on-going, fresh and encourage culture of life-long learning.
- Offer supervisors and managers competitive salary and benefit packages.
- Identify the desired leadership qualities and communicate those to agency staff.
- Identify the best innovative, successful supervisory training available.
- Develop a succession plan.

- Update supervisory and management selection and evaluation criteria and consider adding a "360 Feedback" element.
- Equip supervisors and managers to create a safe work environment for all staff by preventing harassment and affirmative action violations.
- Demand training that embraces adult learning concepts.
- Portray the police position as prestigious and professional.
- Determine how to make sure supervisors are able to use situation leadership skills.
- Develop a program to promote life-time fitness.

Taking proactive steps to improve supervisory and management is important. While some may argue that aspects are costly, and there are costs, the benefits of good supervisors and managers extend well beyond the retention of staff.

Summary of Key Points

The following is a summary of the key points identified in this chapter.

- Supervision and management have much to do with employee satisfaction and retention rates. Several studies are cited that speak to the importance of developing strong relationships with employees and creating a work environment that demonstrates the value of employees…an environment characterized by good communication, recognition for good performance, including employees in on matters that impact them, providing opportunities to grow and learn, and offering work that both matters and is challenging.
- When an employee feels that their basic needs are not being met, they begin the process of leaving the organization, and some will stay physically on the job even though they are emotionally absent. One source identified the following reasons employees leave: unmet job expectations, poor job fit, lack of coaching and feedback on performance, lack of professional development and promotional opportunities, not feeling valued or recognized, workplace stress due to job demands and work-life balance conflict, and lack of trust and belief in senior leadership.
- Good supervision and management skills can do a great deal to correct these problems. Employing a coaching model with employees, keeping employees informed, striving to allow employees to participate in the decision-making process, and being friendly and professional with employees are just some of the behaviors that are recommended.
- Good leaders begin by hiring people with the right leadership skills and/or experience, grooming them over time to prepare them for future leadership opportunities. As leaders move up in the organization, have a plan to keep them growing through mentoring, continued leadership training, and providing feedback on their performance.
- There are many practical ways to help leaders grow. Utilizing "360 Evaluations" to gain insights on how subordinates and peers view a supervisor or manager can be helpful. A Leadership Book Club can help introduce new concepts and facilitate open discussions about leadership. Many other ideas are presented to help develop leaders.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

CHAPTER 14

IMPROVING ORGANIZATIONAL COMMUNICATION TO ENHANCE RETENTION

Communication is the life-blood of an agency. As such, it is the flow of information up and down, and laterally, through an organization that helps an agency accomplish its mission. Effective communication also reaches appropriate stakeholders outside the organization. Without effective communication an agency cannot function optimally.

In an agency where communication works well, an individual gets the information necessary to do what needs to be done in that clear direction and expectations are communicated in a way that the employee understands. Increasingly, employees have an expectation that their perspectives, ideas, concerns or questions will be heard and acted upon appropriately.

When this occurs, employees feel valued and important because their perspectives matter to the organization. They feel informed about matters that may impact them. They feel included as a member of the organizational body.

Communication occurs in many ways in an organization. Consider the following list to determine which apply to your organization.

- Formal Communications

    - Evaluations, commendations, write-ups/discipline, counseling, orientation, acknowledgements, etc.
    - Contracts, partnerships
    - Surveys - Electronic/e-mail, pen/paper, focus-groups
    - Suggestion Boxes
    - Equipment, accommodations, badges, etc.
    - Policies/Procedures
    - Town hall Meetings

- Informal Communications

    - Associations, advisory committees, friendships, clubs, cliques, alliances, affiliations, interviews, etc.
    - Pictures/drawings, sticky-notes

- Formal and/or Informal

    - Culture
    - Actions vs. verbalized/policy

- o Employee meetings
- o Training
- o Teams
- o Newsletters
- o Briefing/debriefings

- Technology

  - o E-mail, blogs, intranet, PowerPoint, Blackberry, text-messaging, voice-mail, intercom, police radio, MDT, telephone, Nextel

- Media

  - o Radio, television, newspaper, books
  - o Music, dancing, art, comedy

- Innuendo – Wink/nod, "do as I say, not as I do"
- Through others – Intermediaries, arbitrators, delegation
- Management by Walking Around
- Verbal

  - o Discussion, dialogue
  - o Choice of words (hostile, friendly), tone/inflection, laughter
  - o Gossip, rumors
  - o Grapevine

- Non-Verbal
  - o Body language, facial expressions, hair-styling, etc.
  - o Sign-language
  - o Silence, emotion
  - o Actions, attitude
  - o Clothing, jewelry, accessories, tattoos

- Bulletin Boards

These various forms of communication can send both positive, proactive messages through an organization, or they can convey negative, reactive messages. When formal communication is ineffective, informal communication tends to increase to meet the need for information.

Communication involves various components. The components include a sender, receiver, message, channel of communication, interpreting the message, feedback, and noise. The sender sends a message through the channel to the receiver who must interpret the message. However, there is almost always some degree of noise or static that the message must travel through. The louder the noise, the more difficulty the receiver will have in receiving and interpreting the message as intended by the sender.

The noise may be caused by external or internal sources. For example, labor negotiations can create noise/static in an organization that makes it hard for employees to hear a message sent by management. On the other hand, an individual may have personal challenges that make it difficult for him/her to hear or understand a message.

The best communication tends to occur when the sender sends a clear message through a channel with little static that is received and interpreted by the receiver as intended by the sender. Such communication does not happen by chance. Rather, it is the result of planning, timing, trust, and an understanding of how communication occurs in an organization.

Good communication meets both the employee's need for information, as well as the need to feel included. Receiving needed information and feeling included work together to create a sense of importance and value. People need to feel valued…that they matter to the organization, not a pawn to be moved around by management at will. When employees feel valued they are less inclined to leave an organization.

What steps can be taken to improve communication? This was a topic of discussion at the 2005 Recruitment and Retention Symposium. Listed below are ideas that were suggested.

- Develop a shared vision and mission
- Strive to develop trust by consistent actions and following through on commitments
- Acknowledge organizational strengths and address weaknesses
- Practice accountability at all levels
- Solicit and listen to new ideas, giving due consideration. Provide a quick response acknowledging receipt of the idea, take action where appropriate, and provide feedback to the employee who submitted the idea.
- Publish new ideas and give credit to the employee who submitted it
- Practice an "open door" policy, but actively pursue opportunities to communicate with employees in areas where they are most comfortable
- Use email to distribute information
- Include civilian employees in the process
- Bring in outside experts/consultants when appropriate to help address complex issues
- Check with agencies who have a reputation of good communication to see what steps they have taken to improve communication
- Use surveys, including focus groups, as a way to obtain information or address issues
- Develop a Suggestion Box or computer-based Idea-box with a response within 48 hours
- Conduct large and small group meetings, as needed, and allow management to engage the whole group
- Establish Advisory Committees to engage employees
- Encourage Chief/Sheriff and command staff to be more open and visible
- Publish Management Staff Meeting Minutes for all employees to see
- Practice Management by Walking Around (MBWA)
- Create a Wellness Officer Position whose responsibility it is to promote the physical and mental health of employees

- Consider establishing a C.A.R.E. Officer focus on Communication, Assistance, Relationships and Evaluation
- Develop a culture that encourages openness, making it okay to disagree
- Manage conflict in healthy ways
- Create an Ombudsman Program
- Plan BBQ's, Family Days, and Socials to bring employees together
- Celebrate agency successes
- Establish a Liaison Officer for Chief/Sheriff to facilitate communication

These ideas work best in an environment where the following values are in place. It is sometimes easy to believe these values are in place. However, survey employees to determine what values they believe are in place. This is a good way to determine what values are actually at work, as well as those that may need some work.

- Consistency – Must be maintained in order for any undertaking to be effective
- Participation – Must be encouraged…buy-in is essential
- Compassion – Empathetic understanding and respect for individuals is key
- Trust
  o Quality is impossible where there is a lack of trust
  o Individuals need to feel they can count on peers, supervisors, and subordinates
- Diversity (in ranks) – Exclusivity does not allow for open and constructive dialogue/discussion
- Honesty – Lies will only divide and weaken the organization
- Objectivity – Fairness and equity bring about good will
- Do NOT be afraid of failure – Individuals need to feel "safe" in order to "try"
- Embrace Change – Individuals in the organization should be ready to adapt
- Make communication a priority
- "One-size" does NOT fit all – Different employees have different needs and learn in different ways
- Effective Communication – Depends on a complete communication cycle ensuring that meaning/understanding are exchanged

As leaders consider ways to improve communication there are specific factors that should be considered. The following ideas for improving communication include recommendations for effective implementation, along with needs to consider, positive (expected) outcomes, and negative (possible) outcomes:

- Surveys
  o Recommendations: Get everyone to participate; include a message from the chief to get buy-in
  o Needs: Participation; ask the "right" questions; publish results; legitimate questions/purpose/content (objectivity); Trust
  o Positives: Quick; reliable; snapshot; feedback
  o Negatives: Unreliable/unobjective; low response

- Informal Communications
  - Recommendations: Facilitate interactions to make these possible
  - Needs: Respect; integrity; trust, inclusiveness
  - Positives: Individual ideas are allowed; proactive
  - Negatives: Exclusion; private; skewed viewpoints

- Formal Communications:
  - Recommendations: Mentoring, Question and Answer Sessions
  - Needs: Trust; consistency; compassion; willing mentors
  - Positives: Consistent; informative; direction for newer employees
  - Negatives: Conformity; lack of feedback

- Technology:
  - Recommendations: Clear policies
  - Needs: Money; planning; education; support
  - Positives: Fast; access to the "masses"
  - Negatives: Abused/overused; outdated (if not maintained)

- Workshops/Meetings:
  - Recommendations: Meeting management; less meetings
  - Needs: Training
  - Positives: Solutions generated
  - Negatives: Indecisiveness; unmanaged, wasted time

- Debriefings:
  - Recommendations: Inclusive
  - Needs: Trust; integrity; participation; respect; knowledge; emotional intelligence (EI)
  - Positives: Saves lives; learning process
  - Negatives: Blaming; disrespectful delivery

- Expressions/Body Language (Non-verbal):
  - Recommendations: Realize the power of these messages
  - Needs: Self-awareness
  - Positives: Powerful; effective; human nature
  - Negatives: Misperceptions; powerful divider

- Bulletin Boards/Memos
  - Recommendations: Accessible
  - Needs: Rules; location; meaningful
  - Positives: Masses; pertinent items
  - Negatives: May not be valuable to employees

Effective organizational communication involves an environment built on solid values that demonstrates the individual is important. There is an appreciation among leaders for the communication process and it is used effectively to ensure that the individual gets the

information he/she needs in a timely manner and in a form that they can process. Feedback is sought to ensure that the communication is received as intended.

Effective communication is an important consideration to improve retention and creates an environment where employees can thrive. Contented employees are a powerful force to help attract qualified candidates who want to work in a good environment.

Summary of Key Points

The following is a summary of the key points identified in this chapter.

- Supervision and management have much to do with employee satisfaction and retention rates. Several studies are cited that address the importance of developing strong relationships with employees and creating a work environment that demonstrates the value of employees…an environment characterized by good communication, recognition for good performance, including employees in on matters that impact them, providing opportunities to grow and learn, and offering work that both matters and is challenging.
- When an employee feels that their basic needs are not being met, they begin the process of leaving the organization, and some will stay physically on the job even though they are emotionally absent. One source identified the following reasons employees leave: unmet job expectations, poor job fit, lack of coaching and feedback on performance, lack of professional development and promotional opportunities, not feeling valued or recognized, workplace stress due to job demands and work-life balance conflict, and lack of trust and belief in senior leadership.
- Good supervision and management skills can do a great deal to correct these problems. Employing a coaching model with employees, keeping employees informed, striving to allow employees to participate in the decision-making process, and being friendly and professional with employees are just some of the behaviors that are recommended.
- Good leaders begin by hiring people with the right leadership skills and/or experience, grooming them over time to prepare them for future leadership opportunities. As leaders move up in the organization, have a plan to keep them growing through mentoring, continued leadership training and providing feedback on their performance.
- There are many practical ways to help leaders grow. Utilizing "360 Evaluations" to gain insights on how subordinates and peers view a supervisor or manager can be helpful. A Leadership Book Club can help introduce new concepts and facilitate open discussions about leadership. Many other ideas are presented help grow leaders.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

CHAPTER 15

DEVELOPING STRATEGIES FOR RETAINING STAFF LONGER AND KEEPING RETIREES ENGAGED

With large numbers of Baby Boomers retiring, as well as peace officers retiring younger due to enhanced retirement programs such as "3@50," a significant level of institutional knowledge is leaving. Agencies that have not done succession or workforce planning may not be ready to deal with this challenge.

One aspect of a succession or workforce plan is giving strategic thought and planning to find creative ways to encourage staff to delay retirement and, when they do retire, provide options for them to stay engaged. Doing so allows the agency to accomplish several things:

- Delay the loss of institutional knowledge
- Allow time to transition younger employees into more responsible positions
- Use senior staff to mentor their successor
- Maintain access to an important knowledge base

The paradigm in many organizations has been that there is plenty of talent to hire and others to move into positions when someone retires. That paradigm does not fit in many organizations today and, in fact, will not apply to most organizations in the coming years unless agencies take steps to prepare for these workforce challenges.

Concerned about these very issues, the State of New York developed a working group to study employee retention. This group surveyed the literature, conducted focus groups with various employees, and developed a written survey on employee retention for employees.

They concluded that there was no one-strategy, but rather a combination of approaches that should be pursued. One key point was that responsibility for retention is a joint effort on the part of control agencies, agency heads, managers, human resources, training and development, and organizational development offices, and unions/employee organizations.[184]

Placer County surveyed employees regarding future retirement plans. A total of 710 employees responded to the survey. The surveyed employees were asked what kind of factors would cause them to delay retirement. The top four responses by percentage of employees who selected that option were:

- Reduced workweek   39%

---

[184] NYS Department of Civil Service and NYS Governor's Office of Employee Relations, Employee Retention – Report of the Employee Retention Workgroup, (September 2002), 22.

- Ability to telecommute   24%
- Transfer to a new position   16%
- Flexible schedule   16%[185]

Further, 85% of the respondents indicated that they would be interested in part-time employment after retirement. Six-two percent indicated they would be interested in 1-2 days per week.[186]

Thirty-five percent of the respondents said they would be interested in doing volunteer work for the county. The Library and Museum were identified as the places of greatest interest to do volunteer work.[187]

In a separate study, Placer County sought to identify the strongest job satisfaction enhancements as perceived by employees. The results showed the following factors as most important:

- Retirement benefits
- Health benefits
- Salary
- Working with co-workers
- Flexible work schedule[188]

According to Nancy Nittler, Placer County Director of Personnel, this survey and others were a part of developing a succession plan aimed at keeping employees longer and engaged after retirement. "In essence, we asked, how can we energize you, what causes you to stay and what skills do you need to grow professionally," she said. "The process communicated to employees we are listening and interested in them." She continued:

> More than just listening, the responses helped guide the county in changing policies and practices. For example, the county changed the reinstatement policy to make it easier for employees to return if they felt the need to see if the grass was greener on the other side. This allowed employees who returned within two years and return with the same vacation accrual rate as they had when they left. In fact, they could also get back sick leave balances not cashed out when they left.
>
> We changed our evaluation process to include a component on career development and goal setting. We want employees to set career goals and identify specific steps within timeframes to attain them. This automated evaluation process sends out reminders as dates approach reminding the individual and the supervisor of the goal.
>
> A survey of employee skills revealed that existing staff were not always prepared to move to higher levels of responsibility. We have increased the types of training we offer and the frequency those classes are offered.

---

[185] Nancy Nittler, Jim Gandley, and Mary Egan, Placer County Workforce Planning Briefing and Status Report, Internal Report, (January 2005), 11.
[186] Ibid, 12.
[187] Ibid, 13.
[188] Placer County, Placer County Workforce Analysis and Transition Planning, Internal Report, (February 2004), 6.

We have put an emphasis on encouraging job sharing. This allows employees who do not want to work full-time to stay with the County. This offers both a family friendly option as well as a transition to retirement.

We have looked for other ways to keep people on the job. For example, two clerical staff in my office both reached retirement age the same year and were considering retirement. I asked what it would take to keep them. One of them said she would be willing to stay another year if she could reduce her work week. This allowed her more time with her grandchildren. The office benefited because she stayed longer and was able to transfer knowledge to new staff.

In another case, a Sheriff's Captain was due to retire and was interested in a specific assignment. When a vacancy occurred, he got the assignment, extending his time with county for at least another year.

We are encouraging managers to structure work in different ways. Many managers and supervisors have specialized expertise but spend most of their time in overseeing the work of others. As part of our retention program, we look for ways to pair up a new supervisor or manager with an experienced one to help train and to free up the experience employee to use their knowledge for specialized projects.

To encourage this we have paid people out of class pay or in the short-term, double filled the position where funding would allow. The goal is to find ways to keep people energized and growing.

Prior to making these kinds of changes, the county predicted over 200 retirements per year. In 2004 and 2005, roughly 130 employees retired. My gut feeling is that our efforts are paying off. However, we are currently reviewing the numbers and assessing our progress in the various departments to analyze our recent work force planning outcomes and to predict future retirements.

For those who do retire, we have increased the number of opportunities to come back to the county in a temporary capacity to work on short-term projects, or be involved in training. This provides an increased opportunity for knowledge transfer.

This process has also changed our thinking about recruitment. We began thinking about our selection and hiring processes from the perspective of a candidate. What would make a job with the county interesting and viable? We've changed our approach to advertising and the words we use to describe the job and the county as an employer to better resonate with potential candidates. [189]

Clearly, Placer County has elevated keeping employees longer, and succession planning, to a strategic priority. It is just this kind of action local government must consider to be competitive in the market place.

---

[189] Nancy Nittler, Placer County Director of Personnel, Telephone Interview, 13 January 2006.

A group of participants at the 2005 Recruitment and Retention Symposium considered steps that could be taken to keep employees engaged longer. Here are ideas that were suggested.

- Implement a Delayed Retirement Program (DROP) – Allows an employee to continue after retirement, but the retirement is paid into a special account that the employee cannot access until he/she opts out of the program or reaches the maximum time allowable
- Customize benefits - Offer cafeteria style options
- Address quality of life issues
- Change retirement laws - Allow continued full employment after retirement
- Look at the structure of retirement jobs or assignments
- Provide alternative work schedules – Such as telecommuting and non-traditional hours or days
- Assist with Retirement planning - Offer agency programs to assist employees and spouses in pre-retirement planning
- Allow employees to return as reserves, volunteers, or mentors
- Create agency fraternal associations for retirees
- Create retiree focus groups to provide training and mentoring
- Provide longevity pay
- Allow shared time contracts, or "Permanent Part-Time" positions
- Target needed skills or capabilities for retention within scope of applicable laws
- Provide training to supervisors and managers that will help them be more effective in working with employees

What steps are necessary to know what action an agency should take? The following steps can help an agency develop a strategy.

1. Identify recent retirees and those approaching retirement
   a. Identify who to focus on such as employees who are within five years of retiring and those who have retired
   b. Determining if other city/county agencies will participate.

2. Gather information
   a. Interview, survey or employ focus groups comprised of potential retirees and recently retired individuals to see what would attract them to stay or return (e.g. job satisfaction, empowerment, alternate benefits, pay)
   b. Interview separated employees after 3, 6, and12 months (longitudinal studies)
   c. May benefit from using outside company or objective third party to conduct surveys and interviews
   d. Use the information from the surveys and interviews for further development of retention strategies

3. Engage staff and stakeholders in developing strategies
   a. Identify and include stakeholders
   b. Select a process to use that will facilitate issue identification and strategy development
   c. Customize issues, ideas, and action plans to agency

4. Recognize Contributions
   a. Tailor recognition to target employee groups using survey information
   b. Designate parking spaces
   c. Use specialty assignments as rewards
   d. Service "Wall of Fame" listing all "25 Year" employees in public area
   e. Individualized gifts or awards

5. Seek Legislative Action (Federal, State and/or Local)
   a. Lobby, initiate, or actively promote legislation to support post-retirement employment in PERS, 1937 Act, and Charter City Systems
   b. Institute or obtain 401a or 401k supplemental retirement plan provisions (DROP) in addition to existing plans

6. Consider Work Structure Flexibility
   a. Consider non-traditional options
   b. Increase flexibility for employees
   c. Consider alternative work schedules (e.g. permanent part-time, job share, telecommute)
   d. Offer work as reserves, volunteers, or mentors
   e. Conduct focus groups of employees approaching retirement to determine what would cause them to delay retirement or return after retiring in some capacity
   f. Foster a work environment that promotes employee participation and involvement to increase morale and satisfaction

7. Redesign Benefit Options
   a. Offer retirement planning assistance
   b. Consider non-traditional benefits, like educational sabbaticals
   c. Use a cafeteria style – Allow staff to change benefit options after a specified number of years of service.

8. Conduct Cost-Benefit Analysis
   a. Examine costs of benefits that could be available to retain targeted employees longer compared to cost of hiring new recruits
   b. Potential benefits for analysis: continuing education, sabbatical, supplemental retirement options, other negotiated benefits that address retiree interests (survey results)

This section is rich with information and ideas that cities and counties, as well as individual departments, can use to keep employees longer or engaged after retirement. However, keeping employees longer should be part of the longer view of succession planning. The next section will address succession planning.

Summary of Key Points

The following is a summary of the key points identified in this chapter.

- Keeping staff longer and engaging them after retirement can benefit an agency by delaying the loss of institutional knowledge, allowing time to transition younger employees into more responsible positions, using senior staff to mentor successors, and maintaining access to an important knowledge base.
- Placer County has done considerable work in succession planning. A survey of employees asked what factors would cause them to delay retirement. The following four factors received the highest rating: reduced workweek, ability to telecommute, transfer to a new position, and flexible schedule. A large majority of employees indicated they would be interested in part-time work after retirement. Employee input has guided Placer County in making changes that have resulted in employees delaying retirement and help meet other succession planning goals.
- Creative approaches such as delayed retirement programs (DROP), customized benefits, longevity pay, part-time opportunities, and alternative work schedules can help meet workforce needs.
- Eight steps are suggested as a roadmap for keeping employees longer or engaging them after retirement: Identify recent retirees and those approaching retirement, Gather information, Engage staff and stakeholders in developing strategies, Recognize contributions, Seek legislative action, Consider work structure flexibility, Redesign benefit options, and Conduct cost-benefit analysis.

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

CHAPTER 16

DEVELOPING A SUCCESSION PLAN

Organizations, including law enforcement agencies, experience personnel life cycles that involve the hiring of staff who work for the agency and then exit at some point, perhaps after spending a career with the agency. "Succession planning involves looking at the entire agency personnel life cycle and providing tools for employee success at all levels to ensure managers and leaders are selected and developed throughout their careers in law enforcement."[190]

Why should an agency consider developing a succession plan? Here are reasons that are applicable to many agencies.

- Baby Boomers are retiring in large numbers, accelerating attrition and the loss of knowledge
- Enhanced retirement program for law enforcement allows peace officers in many jurisdictions to retire at younger ages
- Many jurisdictions are having an increasingly difficult time in recruiting qualified candidates
- Significant turnover allows agencies to modify and restructure both job descriptions and performance expectations of an entire classification of employees
- Promotional opportunities are opening to younger staff with less experience and who may not have had training development opportunities, especially in supervision and leadership
- The community may have broader expectations of public employees
- Many communities are diverse and will likely become even more diverse, therefore a succession plan identifies the current deficiencies and creates a plan for recruiting a more diverse workforce
- Community policing requires a broader skill set than traditional policing
- The use of technology is growing and, in some cases, becoming more complex and new recruits will have more advanced skills
- Worker skills become obsolete without regular training

Agencies who take time to develop a succession plan identifying practical and creative recruitment, development and deployment strategies, will find it easier to respond to the changing environment by attracting and developing a well trained, contemporary workforce. Furthermore, as the competition for qualified workers gets more challenging these agencies will be in a better position to recruit and retain staff.

---

[190]Major Cities Chiefs and Federal Bureau of Investigation – National Executive Institute, Succession Planning, (2004), vi.

In the report , Succession Planning, produced by Major Cities Chiefs, Federal Bureau of Investigation, and the National Executive Institute identified the following as basic steps in developing a workforce plan.

- Develop or update the agency's strategic plan
- Conduct analysis to identify core competencies for position classifications, including future needs identified in the strategic plan
- Assess employees to ascertain current skill levels
- Plan and communicate methods to close the gaps between required competencies and current employee skill levels to manage human capital.[191]

The State of New York produced a report on workforce and succession planning for state agencies entitled, Our Work Force Matters – A Guide to Work Force and Succession Planning for New York State Agencies. This report identifies the following steps:

- Scope – What is the issue, initiative, or organizational unit that needs your attention? Is it an immediate critical need or do you have time to plan?
- Context – What is your agency's direction and how will it affect the issue, initiative, or organization of concern?
- Work – What functions will need to be performed? Will the work be the same, evolving, or brand new?
- Demand – What staffing levels and skill sets or titles will be needed to perform the function?
- Supply – Where will the people come from to staff the functions? What does the data on the current work force tell you about the likely availability of qualified people when you need them?
- Gaps – What positions, titles or functions require special action to ensure that you can recruit, appoint, and retain the people with the skill sets you need?
- Priority – What is the importance of addressing the gaps you have identified?
- Solutions – What specific actions will you take to address the priorities?[192]

This report was developed as a guide for New York State Departments and was intended as a road map to help them address retention and other aspects of succession planning.

At the 2005 Recruitment and Retention Symposium, a group of participants considered succession planning and identified a number of factors to consider. The input this group provided is summarized below.

---

[191] Ibid, 37.
[192]New York State Department of Civil Service and the New York State Governor's Office of Employee Relations, Our Work Force Matters – A Guide to Work Force and Succession Planning for New York State Agencies, (New York, 2001), 4.

DEVELOP OR UPDATE THE AGENCY'S RECRUITMENT STRATEGIC PLAN

In the process of developing or updating the agency's strategic plan, the following are factors to consider for succession planning.

- Identify the age and years of service of the current workforce, including retirement credits earned in reciprocal systems (PERS and 37 Act, for example). Create documentation summarizing the projected retirements by classification, by division, by specialty, etc. to determine the true potential impact on the agency.
- Identify opportunities to modify and improve the job description and recruitment processes to obtain desired candidate pool. Review deployment practices and job structure to enable reorganization upon retirement of a large number of employees in certain classifications
- Project 3, 5, 10 and 15 year staffing needs, including projected costs associated with staff increases
- Estimate 5, 10, and15 year population/demographics
- Consider significant changes in the community that may impact the workforce, such as a large employer relocating to the area
- Evaluate service needs and priorities
- Assess agency values in conjunction with the strategic plan
- Identify future promotional opportunities
- Assess attrition rate and vacancy trends; determine where transitioning employees are going. Is this agency losing employees to another law enforcement agency?
- Identify labor issues
- Identify current and future levels of community involvement

    Importance of involving community in succession plan
    Community panels/advisory boards
    Personnel selection participation
    Strengthen lines of communication

- Identify hard to fill positions
- Consider economic forecasts and Census results

These factors will help identify where to focus further analysis.

- Identify core competencies for each position classification and consider updating the current job description and examination materials to reflect these core competencies. Core competencies may be defined at the practical application of knowledge, skills and abilities to produce specific results.[193]

- Identify and prioritize future needs/skill sets.
- Identify positions compatible with allowing more flexibility in work schedules, such as:
    - Telecommuting
    - Flex hours
    - Part-time staffing
    - Rehiring retirees
    - Increasing number of civilian positions or civilianization of duties
    - Cross-training employees to allow more flexibility

- Identify ways to allow more flexibility to keep staff longer and/or after retirement in some fashion.
    - Part-time
    - Special projects
    - Delayed Retirement Program
    - Volunteer Opportunity

Assess Employees to Ascertain Current Skill Levels

- Conduct a skills assessment questionnaire for all employees or critical positions to determine current skill level.

- Consider asking employees when they anticipate leaving the organization and record this information for use in recruitment planning.

- Analyze attrition in specific positions, especially those that have higher turnover rates.

- Assess leadership skill development in light of goals identified in the strategic plan and desired organizational values. Some leadership values to consider include:
    - Integrity/ethics
    - Team player
    - Dependable
    - Loyalty to agency values
    - People skills
    - Sense of humor
    - Competence & common sense

---

[193] Ibid, 37.

- o Appearance
- o Risk-taking
- o Decisive
- o Problem-solving skills
- o Motivation
- o Open minded/creative/ Visionary
- o Multi-tasking
- o Minimal requirement for technology competence

- The following are skills that may be considered in a succession plan to prepare leaders for greater levels of responsibility:
    - o Consensus building
    - o Decision-making
    - o Program implementation
    - o Motivation concepts
    - o Effective meetings and discussion
    - o Problem-solving
    - o Planning skills
    - o Coaching employees
    - o Counseling employees
    - o Team charters

- Assess work environment and job satisfaction

- Conduct exit interviews to determine if the agency could modify working conditions to retain employees.

- Assess if awards and recognition are meaningful, consistent with department goals, and appropriately available and used:
    - o Assignment opportunities
    - o Community recognition
    - o Professional recognition or awards
    - o Individual development opportunities
    - o Recognition from agency leadership, formal and informal
        - ▪ Awards
        - ▪ Commendations

DEVELOP A PLAN TO CLOSE THE GAP

Develop a plan to close the gap between where current competencies are and where the agency needs them to be in order to meet goals identified in the strategic plan. Once the plan is developed, communicate it throughout the agency. Support may be needed from a variety of

other individuals or groups to make this a reality. Prioritize elements in the plan. Identify costs associated with the plan with a multi-year budget.

- Identify leadership development and supervisory courses/venues that focus on the skill sets most needed by the agency.
    - Communication skills
    - Emotional intelligence
    - Career coaching
    - Accurate assessment of performance standards using performance management[194]
    - Team building

- Mentoring for all levels
    - Identify and match mentors with candidates
    - Seek outcomes linked to agency goals
    - Create and support a network of learning resources
    - Take a long view seeing mentoring as a long-term effort, rather than a short-term project

- Career Enhancement Opportunities
    - Use skills assessment to choose best candidates
    - Incorporate special assignment familiarization into Field Training Officer Program
    - Develop a cross training and performance development plan
    - Develop a method for employees to express interest in different assignments

- Continuing Professional Development (CPD)
    - Consider a variety of training approaches
    - Web-based training
    - Computer-based training
    - Blended learning
    - Traditional classes
    - Tuition reimbursement
    - Educational incentives
    - Establishing educational requirements for specific assignments
    - Integrate CPD into performance evaluations
    - Encourage instructor development and promote instructor requirements
    - Seek University/Community College partnerships
    - Seek private industry/governmental grants
    - Cultural diversity driven by local demographics

---

[194] Ibid, 40.

OTHER

In the process of developing a succession plan, there may be other factors to consider that can impact the workforce in a particular area and/or be of value in the process.

- Quality of life
    - Housing costs
    - Child care
    - Benefit packages
    - Equipment
    - Medical/dental/vision
    - Retirement

- Where employees live
    - Number who live in jurisdiction
    - Number who live within a specific distance
    - Commuting distances

- Candidate Pool
    - Location of applicants who apply for positions
    - Diversity of candidates
    - Career expectations

- Looking Outside
    - Marketing/advertising
    - Retention and other best practices in private sector
    - In-house trainers or subject-matter experts that can be called upon to help
    - Best law enforcement practices in other agencies
    - Universities in the area that may be able to help with developing a succession plan or workforce development

Developing a succession plan makes good sense considering the workforce challenges facing law enforcement agencies. The suggestions presented here can be very useful in developing a succession plan that will help prepare staff to assume greater levels of responsibilities as more senior staff leave.

Summary of Key Points

The following is a summary of the key points identified in this chapter.

- There are many reasons for developing a succession plan, included among these reasons is the fact that Baby Boomers are retiring in large numbers and there is a smaller pool within which to find replacements, younger less experienced staff are moving into

---

leadership positions they may not be prepared for, community expectations are changing, technology changes mean workers may not have necessary skill sets and community demographics are, for many cities, becoming more diverse.

- A report on succession planning by Major Cities Chiefs, Federal Bureau of Investigation and National Executive Institute recommended these steps for developing a workforce plan:
  - Develop or update the agency's strategic plan.
  - Conduct analysis to identify core competencies for position classifications, including needs identification in the strategic plan.
  - Assess employees to ascertain current skill levels.
  - Plan and communicate methods to close the gaps between required competencies and current employee skill levels to manage human capital.
- An important aspect of developing a succession plan is projecting population changes, demographic changes, changes in service delivery priorities or philosophy and sources of attrition.
- If employees want more flexibility, look for avenues to accomplish this through telecommuting, flex-hours, part-time opportunities, cross-training, special projects, job sharing, or others ways to create options.
- Identify core values and competencies needed by leaders, then look for the best way to deliver this training to employees.

ABOUT THE AUTHOR

MERLIN E. SWITZER, MA MPA

Mr. Switzer is a consultant and trainer in the area of Leadership Development. Previously, he spent nearly 28 years with the Sacramento Sheriff's Department rising to the rank of Captain. He was often involved with bringing about significant organizational change over the course of his career. He was involved in developing or leading:

- A contract law enforcement cost methodology
- New Generation Jail Training Program
- Court Security Training Program
- Community Policing – Area Command
- Sheriff's Team for Analysis and Transition into the 21st Century
- Stationhouse Command
- Building the Marconi Station
- North Area Teen Center
- Heart of a Hero Annual Dinner
- Arden Arcade Business Council

He is considered an expert in leading organizational change and other leadership topics. He has spoken at a number of state, national, and international conferences on leadership topics.

In 1990, Mr. Switzer was a Management Fellow for the Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training. During that Fellowship, he coordinated the development of a Regional Testing Project comprised of at least fifteen law enforcement agencies. Multiple test sites were established, a joint marketing brochure was developed, and a marketing campaign was developed to assist the agencies in attracting large numbers of candidates.

Mr. Switzer developed a strategy for marketing the law enforcement career state-wide on behalf of local agencies. He also drafted an information paper on the implementation and use of Law Enforcement Magnet Programs as a long-term approach to recruitment.

He is a graduate of the POST Command College and Master Instructor Programs. He is also a graduate of Los Angeles Police Department's West Point Leadership Program and California Highway Patrol's Commander's Course.

Mr. Switzer has published a number of articles and produces newsletters. An archive of these newsletters can be found on his website at: www.SwitzerOnLeadership.com.

RESOURCES

Agnes, Michael.   Editor in Chief. Webster's New World College Dictionary, Fourth Edition.
Cleveland: Wiley Publishing, Inc., 2002.

Akins, Sr., Dr. C. B. A Voice from the Community. A presentation at the Recruiting for
Tomorrow: Investing in Human Capital Conference, hosted by the U.S Department of Justice
and Community Policing Consortium on 31 October 2005.

American Management Association. Six Truths about Employee Turnover.
http://www.amanet.org/books/catalog/0814405975_s.htm (Last visited 16 August 2005) article
adapted from F. Leigh Branham, Keeping the People Who Keep You in Business (AMACOM;
October 2000).

Baltimore County Police Department Website. Hispanic/Latino Outreach Program.
http://www.co.ba.md.us/Agencies/police/community/hispanic_outreach.html, (Last viewed: 16
January 2006).

Benest, Frank. "Help Wanted: Young People for Public Service." Western City, (September
2003).

Bobb, Merrick J. The Los Angeles County Sheriff's Department – 20th Semiannual Report. Los
Angeles: Police Assessment Resource Center, August 2005.

Boushey, Heather.   Family-Friendly Policies: Boosting Mothers' Wages. Washington, D.C.:
Center for Economic Policy Research (6 April 2005)
http://www.cepr.net/publications/labor_markets_2005_04_06.pdf , (Last viewed: 15 December
2005).

Branham, Leigh. The 7 Hidden Reasons People Change Jobs. New York: American
Management Association, 2005.

Businesstown Website. Media Plans. http://www.businesstown.com/advertising/basic-media.asp
(Last viewed, 7 December 2005).

California Department of Finance. California Current Population Survey Report March 2004.
May 2005. http://dof.ca.gov/HTML/DEMOGRAP/Reports/CPS/CPS_Extended_3-04.pdf (Last
viewed 30 August 2005).

California Department of Finance. E6.County Population Estimates and Detailed Components of
Change Ju30ly 1, 1999-2004, with Census 2000 Counts. 7 February 2005.
http://dof.ca.gov/HTML/DEMOGRAP/E-6_00-04.xls (Last viewed 30 August 2005).

California Highway Patrol Website. Woman's Issues – From A Woman's Perspective.
http://www.chp.ca.gov/recruiting/html/q_c.html (Last viewed: 17 January 2006).

California Performance Review. ETV 02 Create an Education and Workforce Council. http://cpr.ca.gov/report/cprrpt?issrec/etv/etv02.htm, (Last visited: 2 August 2005).

California Performance Review. Good People, Good Government. http://cpr.ca.gov/report/cprrpt/preschg/good.htm, (Last visited: 2 August 2005).

California Performance Review. SO43 Creating a Workforce Plan for California State Employees. http://cpr.ca.gov/report/cprrpt/issrec/stops/pm/so43.htm, (Last visited: 2 August 2005).

Carless, Sally A. "The influence of fit perceptions, equal opportunity policies, and social support network on pre-entry police officer career commitment and intentions to remain." Journal of Criminal Justice. 33 (2005), 348-349.

Cetron, Marvin J. and Owen Davies. "Trends Now Shaping the Future." The Futurist. March-April 2005.

Christman, Bryon. Recruiting New York State Troopers. A presentation at the 2005 State Police Hiring and Promotional Summit. San Antonio, Texas, 20 September 2005.

Collins, Jim. Good to Great. New York: Harper Collins Publishers, 2001.

Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training, Current Employed Personnel-Agency Type/Agency/Appointment Status Summary, 4 April 2005.

Commission of Peace Officer Standards and Training. Full-Time Sworn Personnel Employed on 12/31/05 – Employment History. Report No. ah_394a, 25 January 2006.

Commission of Peace Officer Standards and Training. Grand Total of Full-Time Peace Officers Who Have Terminated Employment as a Peace Officer and Have Not Returned to Full-Time Peace Officer Status – All Agencies. 6 May 2005.

Commission of Peace Officer Standards and Training. Percentage Transfers Within Year. 6 February 2006.

Commission of Peace Officer Standards and Training. Officer Transfer Report. 27 January 2006.

Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training, Sheriff, Police and Community College Current Full-Time Sworn Personnel – Current Age/Gender Summary. 20 April 2005.

Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training Website. Sherman Block Supervisory Leadership Institute. http://www.post.ca.gov/training/sbsli/default.asp. (Last viewed: 12 January 2006).

Daughtry, Lieutenant Tom. Personal E-mail. 4 January 2006.

Eglin, Debbie. Strategies for Law Enforcement Recruitment – Instructional Systems Design.
Class 16, No publication date.

Ellwood, David T. The sputtering Labor Force of the 21st Century: Can Social Policy Help?.
National Bureau of Economic Research Working Paper - W8321 (June 2001): pp. 3-4, quoted in
The Partnership for Public Service. Tapping America's Potential: Expanding Student
Employment and Internship Opportunities in the Federal Government, 10 July 2002.

Employment Development Department. Occupational Projections of Employment 2002 – 2012.
http"//www.calmis.ca.gov/htmlfile/subject/occproj.htm, (Last visited: 2 August 2005).

Employment Development Department – Labor Market Information. Occupational Projections –
Introduction and Methods, 24 November 2004, (last visited August 2, 2005) from
http://www.calmis.ca.gov/FILE/OCCPROJ/0amethoctx.htm.
California Occupational Projections 2002 – 2012.

Erickson, Tamara, Bob Morison and Ken Dychtwald.   Coming of Age: Strategic Implications of
the Aging Workforce and the Coming Worker Shortage, Conference Notes – 13 July 2004.
Harvard Business School Publishing (2004: The President and Fellows of Harvard College).

Executive Update. Straight Talk, July 2001.
http://www.centeronline.org/knowledge/article.cfm?ID=555&ContentProfileID=122318&Action
=searching, (Last viewed: 4 January 2006).

Extreme Hiring Makeover. Extreme Hiring Makeover Gives Federal Hiring a Facelift. 20 July
2006. http://www.extremehiringmakeover.org/pr_20050720_facelift.asp (Last viewed: 18
August 2005).

Fajardo, Steven. Telephone Interview. 20 January 2006.

Families and Work Institute. Highlights of the National study of the Changing Workforce. No.3.
New York, NY: Families and Work Institute, 2002.
http://wfnetwork.bc.edu/statistics_template.php?id=831, (Last viewed, January 9, 2006.

Foster, Tracy L. Team Report and Recommendations, Internal Document. 23 April 2002.

Foster, Tracy L. Telephone Interview. 20 January 2006.

Gbemiye-Etta, Emayeneme. Employee Referral Programs. International Public Management
Association for Human Resources. http://www.impa-
hr.org/index.cfm?navid=83&id=3347&tcode=nws3, (Last viewed: 14 December 2005).

Gee, Sheriff David.   Hillsborough County Sheriff's Office, First 180-Day Action Plan. Internal
Document. No publication date.

Gee, Sheriff David. Hillsborough County Sheriff's Office, First 180-Day Action Plan – Follow-Up Report, Internal Document. 28 June 2005.

Gubanich, Kristine. Telephone Interview. 17 January 2006.

Hickman, E. Stewart. "Hiring and Retaining Top-Performing Employees," Info-Line. American Society for Training and Development, November 2000.

Hoy-Printiss, Melissa. Personal E-Mails. 26 January 2006 and 30 January 2006.

Hurtt, Chief Harold L. A Chief's perspective on why we need to achieve diversity in law enforcement. Quoted in U.S. Department of Justice. Achieving Diversity Through Marketing, Based on Conferences of the Major Cities Chiefs 1999-2001.

Institute of Management Accountants. Reducing Turnover. http://www.imanet.org/ima/rhi/ReducingTurnover.asp, (Last viewed: 13 December 2005).

International City/County Management Association, The Shrinking Talent Pool for Local Government Managers. 2005. http://icma.org/main/ld_results.asp?hsid=1&ssid1=44&ssid2=79&ssid3=387, (Last visited: 30 August 2005).

Johnson, Captain Kevin. "The Community Recruiter." The Police Chief, June 2005.

Kaye, Beverly and Jordan-Evans, Sharon. "Retention in Tough Times." Training and Development. January 2002.

Kennedy-Smith, Lieutenant Shelley. Telephone Interview. 21 December 2005.

Kerley, Kent R. When Community and Agency Are in Sync. Community Policing Exchange, November/December 1999. http://www.communitypolicing.org/publications/exchange/e29_99/e29kerle.htm, (Last viewed: 16 January 2006).

Kiger, Patrick J. "Manpower Mission." Workforce Management. 24 October 2005.

Kleinbaum, Josh. "Phoenix trying to cop an edge." Daily News. 16 September 2005.

Kramer, Jonathan. "Retention: Keeping the Best and Brightest." Business Psychology News – Volume 99.1. (2002). http://www.businesspsychologist.com/bpnews201.html. (Last viewed: 15 December 2005).

Kramer, Jonathan. "Perks for Hiring and Retention." Business Psychology News. Vol. 2001.1. http://www.businesspsychologist.com/bpnews701.html, (Last viewed: 22 December 2005).

Krull, Steve. California Police Chiefs – Demographic Survey. Unpublished Report. November 2004.

Lefkow, Dave. Improving Your Employee Referral Program and Justifying Your Investment, Electronic Recruiting Exchange Website. http://www.erexchange.com/articles/db/69A437E7CFB744F38D06B4B74124D8FA.asp, (Last viewed: 12 December 2005).

Light, Paul C. The New Public Service. The Brookings Institute, 2000. http://brookings.edu/views/articles/light/20000101.htm, (Last visited: 17 August 2005).

Lonsway, Kim. Hiring and Retaining More Women: The Advantages to Law Enforcement Agencies. National Center for Women and Policing a division of the Feminist Majority Foundation, Spring 2003.

Los Angeles County Sheriff's Department. Deputy Leadership Institute Curriculum. Provided by personal e-mail by Lt. Gilbert Aguilar on 9 January 2006.

Lucy, Toni.   "New breed of FBI recruits training to take on terror." USA TODAY. 27 May 2005. http://www.usatoday.com/news/nation/2005-05-26-fbi-recruits_x.htm?csp=34, (Last viewed: 18 January 2006).

Major Cities Chiefs and Federal Bureau of Investigation – National Executive Institute. Succession Planning. 2004.

McCoy, Wayne. "A Recruit Peer-Mentoring Program." CALEA Update (June 2005): 3. Also, Blue Spring Police Department, CALEA Exemplary Project Submission – Recruit Peer Mentoring Program, (13 December 2004): 2.

McKinney, Rosanna.   Telephone Interview. 12 January 2006.

Mulvey, Inspector Lawrence W. Achieving Diversity: Mentoring During the Applicant Investigative Process. Quoted in U.S. Department of Justice, Achieving Diversity Through Marketing. Based on Conferences of the Major Cities Chiefs 1999-2001.

NYS Department of Civil Service and NYS Governor's Office of Employee Relations. Employee Retention – Report of the Employee Retention Workgroup. September 2002.

National Center for Women & Policing. Recruiting & Retaining Women – A Self-Assessment Guide for Law Enforcement, (Available at the National Women & Policing Website: http://www.womenandpolicing.org/sag.asp) Funded by a grant from the Bureau of Justice Assistance, Grant #99-LD-VX-0003.

New York State Department of Civil Service and the New York State Governor's Office of Employee Relations. Our Work Force Matters – A Guide to Work Force and Succession Planning for New York State Agencies, New York, 2001.

Nittler, Nancy, Jim Gandley, and Mary Egan. Placer County Workforce Planning Briefing and Status Report. Internal Report. January 2005.

Nittler, Nancy. Placer County Director of Personnel, Telephone Interview. 13 January 2006.

Ortiz, Felipe A. Recruitment of Hispanics. A presentation to the Recruitment and Retention Advisory Council in San Diego on 25 August 2005.

Partnership for Public Service. The Class of 9/11 – Bringing A New Generation of Practical Patriots Into Public Service. May 2005. http://ourpublicservice.org/usr_doc/class-of-9-11.pdf, (Last visited: 18 August 2005).

Partnership for Public Service. Hire Education: U.S. Department of Education. No publication date. http://www.ourpublicservice.org/usr_doc/edcasestudy.pdf, (Last visited: 18 August 2005).

Partnership for Public Service, Prescription for Hiring Success: Centers for Medicare & Medicaid Services, No publication date. http://www.extremehiringmakeover.org/pdf/CMS_casestudy.pdf, (Last visited: 18 August 2005).

Partnership for Public Service. Press Room: New Study Reveals the State of Federal Workforce: Security, Public Health, Engineering Skills Top Governments "Most Wanted" List. http://ourpublicservice.org/enlib/custom_tags/content/print_email_doc.htm?action=pri, (Last visited: 2 June 2005).

Partnership for Public Service. Tapping America's Potential: Expanding Student Employment and Internship Opportunities in the Federal Government. 10 July 2002.

Partnership for Public Service. The Class of 9/11 Full Survey Results. http://ourpublicservice.org/usr_doc/9-11-Survey-Results.pdf, (Last visited: 18 August 2005).

Partnership for Public Service. The Hiring Process. 19 July 2005. http://ourpublicservice.org/usr_doc/PPS-05-06.pdf, (Last visited: 18 August 2005).

Partnership for Public Service. The Science of Marketing: National Nuclear Security Administration. No publication date. http://www.extremehiringmakeover.org/pdf/NNSA_casestudy.pdf, (Last visited: 18 August 2006).

Partnership for Public Service and National Academy of Public Administration. Where the Jobs Are: The Continuing Growth of Federal Job Opportunities, 2 February 2005.

Placer County, Placer County Workforce Analysis and Transition Planning. Internal Report. February 2004.

Regnery, Ronald N. Legal Aspects of Diversity Hiring Practices – Learning Past Lessons to Avoid Future Pitfalls. A presentation at The 2005 National Summit on Law Enforcement Diversity Recruitment. 11 May 2005.

Regan's Management Resources. "Build interest and loyalty with prospective employees through e-mail career newsletter." Employee Recruitment & Retention, October 2005.

Retention Connection. Five Principle Reasons People Change Jobs. www.hermangroup.com/retentionconnection/retention_5reasons.html, (Last viewed: 21 March 2005.

Sacramento Police Department Brochure. Community Recruiter Program. No publication date.

Schiele, Captain Dan. Sacramento Police Department. Personal Interview. 10 November 2005.

Schiele, Captain Dan. Telephone Interview. 18 January 2006.

Schmidt, Diane E. and Gilbert Duenas. "Incentives to encourage worker-friendly organizations." Public Personnel Management. Fall 2002. http://www.findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_qa3779/is_200210/ai_n9085336, (Last viewed, 15 December 2005).

Scrivner, Ellen. Innovations in Police Recruitment and Hiring, U.S. Department of Justice, Office of Community Policing Services, http://www.cops.usdoj.gov/mime/open.pdf?Item=1655.

Selvi, Officer Carlos. Telephone Interview. 16 January 2006.

Siara, Ted. Telephone Interview and Personal E-mail, 17-18 January 2006.

Smith, Hyrum W. The 10 Natural Laws of Successful Time and Life Management. New York: Warner Books, 1994.

Stanton, Bonnie. Personal E-Mail, 23 January 2006.

State of California, Department of Finance, Economic Research Unit, California Statistical Abstract – 2003, Table B-5. http://countingcalifornia.cdlib.org/pdfdata/csa03/03abstract.pdf, (Last visited: 3 August 2005).

Stephens, Gene. "Policing the Future – Law Enforcement's New Challenges." The Futurist. March-April 2005.

Stone, Vanessa and Rachel Tuffin. Attitudes of People from Minority Ethnic Communities towards a Career in the Police Service. Police Research Series – Paper 136. London: Policing and Reducing Crime Unit, 2000.

Sullivan, Dr. John. A Case Study of Google Recruiting…Can any firm compete against this recruiting machine?. 5 December 2005. Electronic Recruiting Exchange Website. http://www.erexchange.com/articles/db/06465389A59D4E0FAA6F0EFFD4A78126.asp, (Last viewed: 14 December 2005).

Swift, Jamie. "Sheriff Offers Bonus to Bring in New Deputies." <u>King County Journal</u>. Bellevue, Washington, 12 December 2005.

Taylor, Mary Jean, Veronica Gardner, Phil Clark, and Barbara McCombs.   <u>Effective Practices Guide and Staffing Workbook</u>. Colorado: University of Denver Research Institute. Funded by DOJ/National Institute of Justice, August 2005.

Taylor, Mary Jean, Veronica Gardner, Phil Clark, and Barbara McCombs. <u>Staffing and Retention in Public Safety Communication Center – Effective Practices Guide and Staffing Workbook</u>. University of Denver Research Institute, August 2005.

Taylor, Melissa and James Carroll. <u>The Changing Population in the U.S.</u> Trend Alert, December 2002.

U.S. Department of Justice, Office of Justice Programs. <u>Hiring and Keeping Police Officers</u>. Washington, D.C.: National Institute of Justice. August 2004. <u>http://www.ncjrs.org/pdffiles1/nij/202289.pdf</u>, (Last viewed, 31 January 2006).

Valdes, Edmundo. <u>Targeted Recruitment</u>. A presentation at the 2005 National Summit on Law Enforcement Diversity Recruitment. Arlington, Virginia. 11 May 2005.

Valdes, Edmundo. Telephone Interview. 19 January 2006.

Van Vianen, Annelies E. M., Ruben Taris, Eveline Scholten and Sonja Schinkel. "Perceived Fairness in Personnel Selection: Determinants and Outcomes in Different Stages of the Assessment Procedure." <u>International Journal of Selection and Assessment</u> Vol. 12, No. 1/2. (March/June 2004).

Wisconsin Department of Tourism. <u>Developing Your Advertising Plan</u>. <u>http://agency.travelwisconsin.com/Programs/es98d.shtm</u>, (Last viewed, 6 December 2005).

Zhao, Jihong, Ni He, and Nicholas Lovrich. "Predicting the employment of minority officers in U.S. cities: OLS fixed-effect panel model results for African American and Latino officers for 1993, 1996 and 2000." <u>Journal of Criminal Justice</u>. 33 (2005).

Page intentionally left blank

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

APPENDIX

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

APPENDIX 1

RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBERS

REPRESENTATIVES	AGENCY
Sergeant Bernice Abram	Los Angeles Sheriff's Department
Lieutenant Devon Bell Placer	County Sheriff's Department
Lieutenant Kevin Borden	Placer County Sheriff's Department
Sergeant Elizabeth Brett – **WPOA**	Coronado Police Department
Sergeant Ernst Cabriales	Los Angeles Police Department
Sergeant Tim Curran	Sacramento Sheriff's Department
Chief Steven Deering – **CSSA**	Office of the Sheriff Monterey County
Chief Steven Fajardo - **NLPOA**	Freemont-Newark Community College District
Richard Gregson – **CPOA**	Executive Director CPOA
Captain Peter Hansen	Redding Police Department
Sergeant Katherine Hoidahl	Riverside Sheriff's Department
Sergeant Melissa Hoy-Prentiss	California Highway Patrol
Captain Glenn Humphries	Amador County Sheriff's Department
Officer Anthony Jackson	Los Angeles Police Department
Lieutenant Dwayne Johnson	Fresno Police Department
Deputy Karl Kamoss	San Diego Sheriff's Department
Lieutenant Shelley Kennedy-Smith	Riverside Sheriff's Department
Lieutenant Buddy Magor – **PORAC**	Chula Vista Police Department
Lieutenant Phlunte Riddle – **NOBLE**	Pasadena Police Department
President Donna Skaggs – **WPOA**	Visalia Police Department
Chief Thomas Soberanes	Walnut Creek Police Department
Assistant Chief Bonita Stanton	California Highway Patrol
Hugh Tate, Trng. & Recruit. Administrator	Costa Mesa Police Department
Sergeant Joshua Thai	Los Angeles Sheriff's Department
Chief Russ Thomas – **Cal Chief's**	Fort Bragg Police Department
Lieutenant Trang To – **CAPO**	Sacramento Sheriff's Department
Sergeant Mark Van Abel	San Diego Police Department

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

APPENDIX 2

<u>SUBJECT MATTER EXPERTS - FOCUS GROUP ATTENDEES</u>

<u>Representative</u>	<u>Company</u>
Chana Anderson	Casa De Las Campanas
Janet Ault	P.D.Q Careers
Al Barela	Hitachi
Kelli Bond	Kelli Bond Associates
Terri Cassidy	City of Costa Mesa
Richard Cinfino	San Carlos Police Department
Tom Daughtry	San Mateo Police Department
Janet Dyer	Directors Guild Producer Trng. Program
Mary Egan	Innovative Solutions for Local Government
Eric Farwell	Chula Vista Police Department
Cynthia Ferrini	Hythiam, Inc.
Lisa Franklin	Cal Tech
Nora Gomez	R.S.I. Home Products
Shauna Harrington	V.S.P.
Jenifer Heiser	The Cheesecake Factory
Art Hershey	Consultant & UCLA Faculty
Genevieve Knych	Wells Fargo Financial
Letty Juarez	City of San Mateo, H. R. Department
Robert W. Lendin	United States Marines
Robynn Losee	McCrometer – PIHRA
Greg Medlyn	R.E.I.
Raul Munoz	I.B.M.
Dan Schiele	Sacramento Police Department
Lee Ann Schumacher	Kramer-Wilson Company
Ted Silvas	Millbrae Police Department
Joseph Vargas	Anaheim Police Department
John Wentworth	Wentworth Recruiting Excellence

<u>Focus Group - Advisory Council Members</u>

<u>Representative</u>	<u>Agency</u>
Sergeant Katherine Hoidahl	Riverside Sheriff's Department
Sergeant Melissa Hoy-Prentiss	California Highway Patrol
Lieutenant Dwayne Johnson	Fresno Police Department
Lieutenant Shelley Kennedy-Smith	Riverside Sheriff's Department
Lieutenant Buddy Magor - PORAC	Chula Vista Police Department
Chief Thomas Soberanes	Walnut Creek Police Department
Assistant Chief Bonita Stanton	California Highway Patrol
Chief Russ Thomas – Cal Chief's	Fort Bragg Police Department

APPENDIX 3

LAW ENFORCEMENT RECRUITER SURVEY – PARTICIPATING AGENCIES

Ada County Sheriff's Office, Boise, Idaho
Amtrak Police Department
Anchorage Police Department, Alaska
Arizona Department of Public Safety
Arlington County Police Department
Baton Rouge City Police Department
Brevard Police Testing Center
Burlington Police Department, Vermont
Charleston Police Dept., West Virginia
Cherry Hill Police Department, New Jersey
City of Artesia, New Mexico
City of Las Vegas Detention & Enforcement
Colorado Springs Police Department
Columbus Division of Police
Denver Police Department
Drug Enforcement Agency
Elgin Illinois Police Department
Fairfax County Police Department
Garden Grove Police Department, California
Greenville Police Department
Hollywood Police Department
Honolulu Police Department
Howard County Police Dept., Maryland
Irving Police Department
Jefferson County Sheriff's Office

James City County Police Department
Las Vegas Metro Police Department
Metropolitan Police Department
Miami Dade Police Department
Newport Police Department
Prince George's County Public Safety Recruitment
Park Forest Police Department, Illinois
Pierce County Human Resources
Reno Police Department
Round Rock Police Department, Texas
St. Louis Metropolitan Police Department
St. Mary C Sheriff's Office, Maryland
Salt Lake City Police Department
State of Delaware, Department of Correction
Tompkins County Sheriff's Office, NY
Tucson Police Department
United States Mint Police
University of Maryland Police
University of Texas Police at Houston
Virginia Dept. of Game & Inland Fisheries
Virginia State Police
Washington State Patrol
Wisconsin Department of Natural Resources

APPENDIX 4

Recruit Survey

The Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training is conducting a recruitment study. Please take a few minutes to respond to the items below. Your responses will be used to help improve peace officer recruitment efforts. Thank you for your assistance!

1. Have you been hired and sent to the academy by a law enforcement agency?

___ a. Yes
___ b. No

Using the scale below, to what extent do you agree or disagree with the statements listed in items 2-4.

Strongly Disagree	Disagree	Somewhat Disagree	No Opinion	Somewhat Agree	Agree	Strongly Agree
1	2	3	4	5	6	7

2. I pursued a career in law enforcement for the following reasons:

a. Stable employment	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
b. Salary & Benefits	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
c. Retirement Plan	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
d. Adventure/Excitement	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
e. Desire to serve	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
f. Shift work	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
g. Non-routine work	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
h. Independence	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
i. Status of being a peace officer	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
j. Other (Please specify in box below):	1	2	3	4	5	6	7

3. The following aspects of applying for a peace officer position were difficult for me:

a. Finding out when the test would be given	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
b. Completing the application	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
c. Meeting minimum requirements for the position	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
d. Written test	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
e. Oral Interview	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
f. Physical Agility	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
g. Background Investigation	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
h. Medical Exam	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
i. Psychological Screening	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
j. Time involved to complete the process	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
k. Lack of contact through the process	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
l. Other - Please specify in box below:	1	2	3	4	5	6	7

4. If employed by an agency… I accepted employment with this agency because:

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
a. Size of agency	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
b. First agency to offer me a position	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
c. Location of city or agency	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
d. Affordability of housing	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
e. Salary/Benefits	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
f. Reputation of the agency	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
g. Friend/family works for this agency	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
h. Retirement Plan	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
i. Variety in assignments	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
j. Agency was willing to send me to academy	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
k. Work hours available to me, such as 10 or 12 hours shifts	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
l. I was already with the agency in another capacity	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
m. Other - Please specify in box below:	1	2	3	4	5	6	7

5. If employed by an agency…I was recruited to this agency via (Check all that apply):

	a. Self-referral
	b. Job fair
	c. Agency employee who is a friend or relative
	d. Agency employee who told me about the opportunity
	e. Ad in paper
	f. Ad on radio/television
	g. Website
	h. Friend/family not in law enforcement referred me
	i. Friend/family who work in a different law enforcement agency
	j. I was already with the agency in another capacity
	k. Other - Please specify in box below:

6. Which of the following best describes your highest level of education? (Only check one)

	a. High School Graduate or GED
	b. Some college, but less than 60 units
	c. AA or completion of 60 units of college
	d. BA Degree
	e. Post Graduate Degree

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

7. Which, if any, of the following did you do to prepare for the Academy? (Please check all that apply)

	a. Work out to get in shape.
	b. Read law enforcement related material, such as criminal law or community policing.
	c. Take college courses.
	d. Go on a ride-a-long.
	e. Talk with an officer about what to expect in the Academy.
	f. Volunteered/worked in law enforcement in another capacity
	g. Other - Please specify in the box below:

8. Which of the following best describes your employment history? (Only check one)

	a. None
	b. Multiple part-time jobs
	c. Part-time with the same employer for more than two years
	d. Full-time with the same employer for more than two years
	e. Full-time with multiple employers over the past two years
	f. Other - Please specify in the box below:

9. What type of activities do you regularly engage in during your free time? (Check all that apply in the two columns below.)

	a. Intramural team sports		h. Biking
	b. Professional sporting events		i. DVD movies at home
	c. Camping/Hiking		j. Jogging
	d. Concerts		k. Tennis
	e. Reading		l. Attend movies at theaters
	f. Martial Arts		m. Fishing
	g. Hunting		n. Swimming

	o. Other - Please specify in the box below:

10. Have you served in the armed forces?

	a. No
	b. Yes…If yes, please fill in the following three items:
	➢ What branch did you serve?
	➢ How long did you serve? Yrs Months
	➢ What rank did you have at discharge?

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

11. Prior to the starting the Academy, did you take advantage of any classes or other assistance to help you prepare for the Academy?

	a. No
	b. Yes

12. Prior to starting the academy, did someone make clear the expectations required to be successful during the academy and the law enforcement career?

	a. No
	b. Yes

13. Which of the following age ranges describes when you decided you were interested in a law enforcement career? (Only check one)

	a. 11 or younger (Elementary or younger)
	b. 12-13 (Junior High)
	c. 14-18 (Senior High)
	d. 19-29
	e. 30-39
	f. 40-49
	g. 50 or older

14. What is your current age?

	a. 18-29
	b. 30-39
	c. 40-49
	d. 50 or older

15. What is your gender?

	a. Male
	b. Female

16. Many agencies are experiencing difficulties in finding qualified recruits. In the space below, please write any ideas you have that would help agencies improve their recruitment efforts.

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

APPENDIX 5

Recruitment & Retention Symposium Survey (2001)

Our records indicate that you were registered for the Recruitment/Retention Symposium that was conducted in 2001. Please take a few minutes to respond to the following items. This information will help POST determine to what extent the symposium helped participating agencies improve recruitment and retention efforts. The information will also be used in preparing for the 2005 Recruitment and Retention Symposium in November.

Thank you for taking the time to respond to this survey. After completing the survey, please return it in the accompanying envelope no later than June 30.

1. Did you attend the symposium?
   a. _____ Yes
   b. _____ No…If no, did someone else from your agency attend the symposium? If so, can you please ask them to complete this survey?

Strongly Disagree	Disagree	Somewhat Disagree	No Opinion	Somewhat Agree	Agree	Strongly Agree
1	2	3	4	5	6	7

Using the scale above, please indicate to what extent do you agree or disagree with the following statements by circling the number that best represents your perspective:

2. I gained new ideas about recruitment of peace officers. | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 |

3. I gained new ideas about retention of peace officers. | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 |

4. I passed this information on to others in my agency when I returned home. | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 |

5. Myself or others in my agency used this information to improve recruitment. | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 |

6. Myself or others in my agency used this information to improve retention of officers. | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 |

7. I recommended changes to others, but no action was taken. | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 |

8. My agency used the public service announcements that POST developed. | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 |

9. Recruitment is a current issue for my organization | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 |

10. Retention is a current issue for my organization | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 |

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

11. Recruitment is a bigger problem than four years ago | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 |

12. Retention is a bigger problem than four years ago | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 |

13. Currently, the following are issues my organization is experiencing relative to recruitment and retention of peace officers (check all that apply):

   a. _____ Getting qualified candidates to apply

   b. _____ Time necessary for a candidate to complete our testing/selection process

   c. _____ Recruits successfully completing the basic academy

   d. _____ Working with the community to attract minority and/or female candidates

   e. _____ The image of our agency impedes attracting candidates

   f. _____ Pay/benefit package is not competitive

   g. _____ Career enhancing opportunities available to officers is very limited

   h. _____ Training for officers after the academy is very limited

   i. _____ Inadequate funding for recruitment efforts

   j. _____ Competition from surrounding jurisdictions

   k. _____ Size of agency is adversely impacting recruitment

   l. _____ Cost of housing is high

   m. _____ Higher than normal percentage of retirements

   n. _____ Advertising is not effective

   o. _____ Other (please specify): _____

   _____

14. Please complete the following information about your recruitment efforts.

   a. Number of people assigned full-time to recruitment - _____

   b. Number of people assigned part-time to recruitment - _____

   c. Money budgeted for recruitment (Not including salaries/benefits) - _____

   d. Money budgeted for advertising if listed as a separate line item - _____

15. What would most help your organization with the recruitment and retention of peace officers?

16. What has worked the best for you in terms of recruitment and retention?

_____

_____

_____

_____

17. Who would you suggest we contact in terms of best practices pertaining to recruitment and retention?

_____

_____

_____

_____

18. Other comments – Please use this space to share other comments you may have.

_____

_____

_____

_____

19. Your name: _____

20. Your agency:_____

21. Contact phone number: _____

Thank you for sharing your perspectives with us!

APPENDIX 6

LAW ENFORCEMENT RECRUITER QUESTIONNAIRE

Please take a moment to complete the following information about your agency's recruitment efforts. This information will be used in preparing an update on best practices in recruitment and retention of peace officers conducted by the California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training. Thank you for assisting us in this manner.

1.	In the past three years, what changes have you made to how you recruit?

2.	Considering your response to the question above, which of these changes has worked the best for your agency?

3.	What changes do you anticipate making in the next two-three years?

4.	How large is your agency? (Please fill estimated number of staff)

    a.	_____ Sworn
    b.	_____ Non-Sworn

5.	How much personnel and resources are committed to your agency's recruitment efforts? (Your best estimate)

    a.	_____ Number of full-time staff assigned to recruitment
    b.	_____ Number of part-time who do recruitment as collateral assignment
    c.	_____ Size of recruitment budget
    d.	_____ Advertising Budget

Continue to next page

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

Using the scale below, to what extent do you agree or disagree with each item on pages 6-8.
<u>Please circle the number that best corresponds to your response</u>

Strongly Disagree	Disagree	Somewhat Disagree	No Opinion	Somewhat Agree	Agree	Strongly Agree
1	2	3	4	5	6	7

6. Your Chief or Sheriff is supportive of your recruitment efforts?	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
7. Your agency has developed a written strategy outlining your recruitment goals.	1	2	3	4	5	6	7

8. To what extent would you agree or disagree that the following have attracted qualified applicants to your agency.

a. Self-referral	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
b. Job fair	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
c. Agency employee who is a friend or relative referred the applicant	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
d. Agency employee who is not a friend or relative referred the applicant to the department	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
e. Ad in paper	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
f. Ad on radio/television	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
g. Website	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
h. Friend/family not in law enforcement referred applicant	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
i. Friend/family who work in a different law enforcement agency	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
j. Ad at movie theater	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
k. Billboard	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
m. Ads on buses or taxis	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
n. Ads on bus benches or similar, but not billboards	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
o. Ads on agency vehicles	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
p. Department telephone message system	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
q. Department business cards	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
r. Partner with community groups to assist with recruitment	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
s. Train community recruiters to help recruit	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
s. Other - Please specify in box below:	1	2	3	4	5	6	7

Continue to next page

9. Considering the list below, in which areas do you feel your agency's approach is considered a **best practice**? (Check all that apply)

a.	Announcing well in advance when the test will be given
b.	Have an excellent interactive website
c.	Completing the application on-line
d.	Meeting minimum requirements for the position
e.	Combining three or more processes in one appointment, such as the interview, written and physical agility
f.	Oral Interview
g.	Physical Agility
h.	Background Investigation
i.	Medical Exam
j.	Psychological Screening
k.	Time involved to complete the process
l.	Continual contact with the applicant throughout the process
m.	Other - Please specify in box below:

10. Which, if any, of the following does your offer as a way to help recruits prepare for the academy? (Please check all that apply)

a.	Work out classes to get in shape.
b.	Provide a reading list covering relevant topics such as community policing.
c.	Provide courses in conjunction with a community college.
d.	Allowing the opportunity to go on a ride-a-long.
e.	Making staff available for interested applicants to talk with about what to expect in the Academy.
f.	Contracts to allow recruits who have not been successful an opportunity to return to the academy after he/she completes some agreed upon measures, such as a physical fitness class.
g.	Other - Please specify in the box below:

11. Which of the following best describes your agency's approach to involving department employees in the recruitment process? (Check only one)

a.	None - Our department has no structured plan to involve employees.
b.	Low – Employees only provided information about upcoming recruitment periods, but not generally encouraged to get involved otherwise.
c.	Medium – Some efforts are made to get employees involved. Examples might include providing materials for employees to distribute or involving a cross-section of employees in developing recruitment strategies.
d.	High - Formal written plan providing for paid incentive and/or department recognition when recruit is hired, completes academy and/or completes probation.
e.	Very high – All of the above are employed to engage the whole department in the process of finding qualified candidates.

12.   Your name: _____

        Agency: _____

        E-Mail Address: _____

        Phone number: _____

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

APPENDIX 7

2005 RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION SURVEY[195]

Please complete the survey below as part of your registration process. Results will be made available at the symposium.

Strongly Disagree	Disagree	Somewhat Disagree	No Opinion	Somewhat Agree	Agree	Strongly Agree
1	2	3	4	5	6	7

Using the scale above, to what extent do you agree or disagree with the statements listed in items 1-15. This information will be used in preparation of the symposium.

<u>Recruitment</u>

1. Recruitment is a problem for our agency.	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
2. Our agency has developed a written strategic plan for recruitment.	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
3. We have identified who we believe to be the ideal candidate for our agency.	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
4. We have surveyed applicants and know how they heard about our agency.	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
5. We have improved our selection process in the past three (3) years to shorten the amount of time required to complete the selection process.	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
6. We have developed effective strategies to partner with external organizations to address our recruitment needs.	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
7. We have found effective ways to address the cost of housing in our area to help employees live in our jurisdiction.	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
8. We actively recruit interns from local high schools or colleges as a part of our recruitment strategy.	1	2	3	4	5	6	7

Please summarize steps have you taken to improve recruitment in the past two years.

---

[195] Completed by participants as part of the registration process for the 2005 Recruitment and Retention Symposium.

Retention

9. Retention is a problem for our agency.	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
10. Our agency has sought employee input using focus groups, employee surveys or similar approach.	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
11. We have taken definitive steps to address retention issues.	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
12. We have developed a written plan outlining steps to improve retention.	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
13. We have provided leadership training to supervisors to improve how they relate with their respective staffs.	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
14. We have developed ways to encourage staff to delay retirement and/or keep them engaged after retirement through volunteer or part-time opportunities.	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
15. The changes we have made have improved retention.	1	2	3	4	5	6	7

Please summarize steps have you taken to improve retention in the past two years.

Page intentionally left blank

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

APPENDIX 8

PRIORITIZING RECRUITMENT STRATEGIES FORM

Strategy	Cost[196]	Time Required[197]	Capability to do in-house[198]	Ability to sustain idea over time	Other considerations

---

[196] Estimated cost to develop idea
[197] Time required to develop the idea for use
[198] The degree to which the agency has the capability to develop the idea in-house, using the following scale: 1 – No capability, 2 – little capability, 3 – Some capability, 4 – Have capability

California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training